

Canterbury Research and Theses Environment

Canterbury Christ Church University's repository of research outputs

http://create.canterbury.ac.uk

Copyright © and Moral Rights for this thesis are retained by the author and/or other copyright owners. A copy can be downloaded for personal non-commercial research or study, without prior permission or charge. This thesis cannot be reproduced or quoted extensively from without first obtaining permission in writing from the copyright holder/s. The content must not be changed in any way or sold commercially in any format or medium without the formal permission of the copyright holders.

When referring to this work, full bibliographic details including the author, title, awarding institution and date of the thesis must be given e.g. Gillespie, Aidan (2017) 'How do primary school teachers understand and express their spirituality in the workplace?' an interpretative phenomenological analysis of professional educators' spiritual expression in primary schools. Ed.D. thesis, Canterbury Christ Church University.

Contact: create.library@canterbury.ac.uk



'How do primary school teachers understand and express their spirituality in the workplace?' An interpretative phenomenological analysis of professional educators' spiritual expression in primary schools.

By

Aidan Gillespie BA(Hons) PGCE MEd

Canterbury Christ Church University

This thesis submitted for the degree of Doctor of Education

2017

Abstract

The aim of this study was to uncover and illuminate aspects of spirituality, which may be

present in the work of primary school teachers. Four themes emerged out the analysis and

were coded using the methodology consistent with an Interpretative Phenomenological

Analysis (IPA). The themes were:

• Spirituality as an aspect of identity formation and understanding.

• Relationships as central to understanding and formation.

• Teaching and learning as a shared encounter through mentoring.

• Spirituality as a contextual resource.

IPA was chosen as a methodology as it places the participant as central to and expert in their lived experience whilst acknowledging the ways in which the researcher impacts on

the interpretative process. Drawing on phenomenology whilst adopting a systematic process of analysis, the material uncovered ways in which spirituality can be used a

resource in the professional encounter.

The implications for this study points towards a new definition of spirituality that

encompasses 'moments of profundity and connection with other that leads to change'. This

is particularly important in relation to the teachers in this study and could be of value to others in the education profession. Seeing one's spirituality as a source of wisdom and as a

contextual resource has allowed the participants to make connections with their colleagues

and pupils that draw heavily on their spirituality in order to make sense of and bring change to situations and relationships. These instances are profound in nature for each

individual but has brought about change in the situation, relationship or way of teaching and relating to one's environment. As such the definition of spirituality in this study both

encompasses established understanding of what it means to be spiritual but places this in

the educational environment and profession.

It is hoped that the findings of this study lead to an awareness of the way in which one's

spirituality can be drawn upon as a positive agential resource will be acknowledged in

teacher education programmes and school-based teaching.

**Word Count: 52,594** 

2

# Acknowledgements

I would like to thank Catherine Meehan and Andrew Humphries for providing me with invaluable support and advice throughout the project. Lynn Revell and Trevor Cooling for believing that I could actually complete a doctorate and pointing the way when I was lost. My colleagues and friends at Canterbury Christ Church University for acting as sounding boards and critical friends. Your academic support is thoroughly appreciated, thank you.

My friends and family has always been there from starting out as a mature student seeking an undergraduate degree. You have sympathised, encouraged, challenged and humoured in more ways than you know and I am grateful to all of you for doing so. To my daughter Maedbh for being the inspiration to return to university and Lorenzo for challenging me to be a good example. My wife Lucinda for sticking with me through this process and helping to calm me down, give me tea and cast a layman's eye over the writing. Thank you for all that you do, I love you.

# Chapter 1

Preface	10
Context of the Research	10
Introduction to the Research	13
Rationale and purpose of the Research	13
Defining 'Spirituality'	15
Definitions of 'Spirituality'	16
Chapter 2	
Literature Review	17
Spirituality as an Educational Aspiration	17
The historical and contemporary context of RE and SMSC	17
Education Acts from 1943-2013	20
Current state of RE and SMSC; definition and exemplars	22
Pedagogies of RE and Spiritual Opportunity	25
Pedagogical Challenges and Responses	27
Spirituality and Education	28
Spirituality: concepts, definitions and misunderstanding	28
Dualism and Spirituality	28
Spirituality as integration of inner and outer lives	30
The Outward Expression of Spirituality	33
Expressions of Spirituality	33
Spirituality within Evolutionary Theory	33

Understanding and Expressions of Spirituality	34
The Rationality and Irrationality of the Spiritual	37
Objections to Spirituality as a positive/self-agential phenomenon	38
Spirituality and Work	40
Teaching as Vocation	40
Spirituality At Work	43
The Creative Impulse	46
Creativity in Flow	48
Summary	50
Chapter 3	
Methodology-Philosophical Underpinnings	52
Introduction	52
Epistemological Position of the Research	52
Objectivity, Reliability and Validity	54
IPA and other Methodologies	57
Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) and Theoretical Underpinnings	58
Phenomenology	60
Hermeneutics	61
Idiography	62
The Research Process	62
Homogeneous participants	63
Data Collection and IPA	63
Interview Design and Schedule	64

Research Questions	65
Ethics	66
Method- Data Collection and Procedures	68
Identification and selection of participants	68
Recruitment	68
Participant Details	71
Interview Process	71
Reflexivity	72
Features of Reflexivity	73
Chapter 4	
Findings	75
Spirituality as an aspect of Identity formation and understanding	77
Relationships as central to Spirituality	83
Relationships as Perspectival	84
Relationships between curriculum and deep learning	86
Spirituality informing relationships between staff	88
Mentoring as a Spiritual Expression	91
Spirituality as a negation of Hierarchy	91
Agency as a method of Self Realization	93
Social Justice as a manifestation of Spiritual Action	95
Spirituality as a contextual resource	97
Modelling the spiritual as an aspect of child development	100

Spirituality as a Professional Resource	101
Summary	103
Chapter 5	
Analysis and Discussion	104
Identity as a negotiated project	104
Relationships as central to understanding and formation	111
Spiritual Aspects of Relationships	112
Teaching and learning as a shared encounter through mentoring	120
Spirituality as a contextual resource	126
Intersectionality as an analytical tool	127
Pedagogy through a spiritual contextual lens	130
Summary	134
Chapter 6	
Conclusion	136
IPA as a Methodology	136
Selection of Participants	137
Interview Design	138
Unique Contribution to Knowledge	139
Implications for Practice	139

Further Research	141
Final Comments	142
References	144
Appendices	158
Recruitment Letter for Participants	158
Consent Form	160
Reflective Exercise 4	163
Interview Schedules	165
Transcript 19	168

# Chapter 1

#### **Preface**

# **Context of the Research**

Having worked as a primary school teacher for six years in two Roman Catholic Primary schools and one Maintained (Non-Faith) primary school I became aware of the ways in which teachers seek to make sense of Religion and Spirituality at both an individual level (for both the teacher and the pupil) but also at a corporate level (within the teaching staff and/or pupil body). The tensions became most apparent within my experience at a suburban maintained primary school. The teaching staff struggled to make sense of what their role was within the sphere of Religious Education (RE) but also within Spiritual, Moral, Social and Cultural (SMSC) opportunities. Initially I was faced with the dramatic differences between the ways in which Faith schools (Roman Catholic education in this instance) and Maintained schools approached and conceptualised the teaching of RE. Within the faith school environment, the Religious Education of the pupils was understood to be at the core of their ethos or mission and placed RE and SMSC central to all academic and communal activities of the school. Maintained schools, from conversations with staff, drew on examples from within their careers and whose stories varied more and often reflected the charism and motives the Head-teacher thought appropriate to their school and the contribution RE made to the lives of the pupils and schools. The interactions and conversations with staff at this school who were attempting to negotiate the terrain between personal belief and the extent to which this informed their teaching prompted this study.

As a primary school teacher my main role, aside from the pastoral care of my pupils, was to plan, deliver and assess all subjects within the National Curriculum for England. Within this role, it was expected that unless a teacher chose to remove him/herself, that Religious Education and SMSC would be taught and facilitated. Early on in my teaching at the maintained school, I was asked to become the Religious Education (RE) coordinator largely because of my experience within two faith schools. This was the first of many encounters where a value judgement was made on my identity but which also helped identify some of the attitudes present within the teaching staff at the school pertaining to faith and religion. As the coordinator, I chose to rewrite the RE syllabus for the school to make it more applicable to the children and staff within the school. As part of this role I

met with teachers on an individual level to help me to understand their subject knowledge and any areas of the RE curriculum which they needed clarification or help with. During this exercise it became apparent that there were many different opinions on what roles religion and spirituality should play within the educational experiences of the pupils in a maintained school and which were to be facilitated by the staff; but also the deeply held and often passionate beliefs of staff in relation to their own spiritual and/or religious views.

Through the interpersonal nature of teaching within a primary school I was fortunate enough to be trusted by colleagues sufficiently for intimate conversations to take place amongst us during one-to-one opportunities in which they revealed their personal feelings and occasionally, their religious and spiritual experiences. Within the teaching staff there were teachers who belonged to 'Spirit-led' Christian traditions and who felt that it was their duty and privilege to 'spread the word' of the Christian Gospel. Within the maintained school context, they confessed that they felt a tension between expressing their faith explicitly and attempting to maintain a 'neutral' and 'professional' stance. This was something of a revelation to me as up until that time (having only worked in Roman Catholic primary schools) I had felt no tension between expressing a faith position and this not being thought of as not only acceptable and normative but that it could be considered as a possible hindrance to a teacher's professional identity and possibly their career.

In addition, I also worked with teachers who felt deeply uncomfortable having to teach RE as it was a subject which they felt was of little relevance to the children which they taught and that it was a subject which detracted from what some teachers thought of as the real work of the school day by taking teacher's time away from the business of teaching English, Maths and Science (all subjects which both the teachers and school were deeply accountable for). The professional tensions coupled with the personal belief systems of some teachers who did not recognise aspects of spirituality and the possibility of the metaphysical brought to my attention the various narratives impacting upon my role as the RE coordinator. Alongside of this, it also became apparent that in order to understand more fully how teachers understand their own spirituality and the way in which this affects their professional choices and practice, an examination of how teachers who define their spirituality within a particular tradition and also practise their teaching within that context should be sought. It was through these experiences that the research question first came to be thought of and developed.

Undertaking this research which focuses on a personal area of interest and an area which plays a part in how I conceive identity (both my own and others) it is necessary that I acknowledge the interpretative process and the ways in which an interpretive methodology best suits the research area and the ways in which I will be constructing and carrying out the research. Examining the personal lived experience of others and their understanding and retelling of events important to them as well as my role as an interpreter of these stories through the lens of my own lived experience I will be taking a qualitative stance which I believe is necessary for the research. The transformative nature of the research will also allow my stance as a researcher to move and develop. Through this emerging gathering of information and interpretation it is hoped that the reflexive nature of the research will aid my professional development and practice (West and Merrill, 2009).

As a methodological approach I used Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) as developed by J. Smith (Smith et al 2009). IPA is 'Interpretative' in that it seeks to understand the lived experiences of the participant's narratives on a particular subject. It acknowledges that both the participant interpret their own experiences and from this the researcher interprets these narratives again in a double hermeneutic circle. Alongside of this IPA is focussed on understanding the phenomenon at hand, in other words, the actual lived occurrence as understood by those involved in it. As such, the themes arising out of the research and the findings presented are, as much as possible, those recounted by the participants themselves. Their conceptions, examples and reflections on their spirituality as an aspect of their identity pertinent to their professional lives are referred to. It is hoped this methodological approach allowed me to be reflexive in my approach to the interactions that took place, and the gathering of data through semi-structured interviews, allow for my own experiences to be acknowledged while privileging the participant as 'expert' in their own lived experience. Through the use of a reflexive diary which was used shortly after each interview it is hoped that my own knowledge, experiences and interpretations will be noted as an element of the interpretative process but separate to the narrative given by each participant. IPA places great importance on the role of reflexivity during the research process. This (as outlined above) allows the researcher to situate the participant as expert but also allows for the foreknowledge of the researcher to be noted and where possible recognised and revised as the research is carried out through several interviews (Smith et al, p35, 2009). Any changes in my own opinions and values were noted within a hermeneutic circle whilst also acknowledging my subjective place within

the process. This phenomenological approach differs somewhat from the Hermeneutic Phenomenology of Husserl. It does so by its systematic approach to interpretation and the positioning of the researcher as central to the interpretive process, as such the 'Bracketing Out' of Husserl's approach is deemed unattainable and undesirable as IPA brings the researcher and researched in to companionship. Through the dynamic process of interpretation I will refer to myself as 'the researcher'; it is hoped that through doing so my place in the process will be acknowledged but not entangled in it (Mueller, 2012).

#### **Introduction to the Research**

The purpose behind this research is to establish how a group of five teachers working within faith and maintained schools in Kent individually understand the concept of spirituality, and how this understanding is manifested in the expression of their teaching and professional interactions with the school community. Through the research it has become evident how individual teachers understand their spirituality and negotiate the expression of the spiritual in their professional practice. An examination of the ways in which teachers' spirituality is used as an interpretative lens from which project of education is implemented and their contribution to this is understood.

# Rationale and purpose of the Research

Since the Education Act of 1944 religion has played a prominent role in the educational project in England and has, through that act been an echo of what some commentators (Jackson 2004 and Copley 2000) would term a 'Modernist' period in the contemporary educational landscape. The 1988 Education Act sought to develop the role of religion and spirituality in the educational journey of pupils by bringing it more up to date and reflective of society's contemporary sensibilities. The implication taken from these education acts is that teachers play a prominent role in the development of the spiritual in children and as such should be aware and reflective of the spiritual in their own personhood and professional expression.

Locating the role of the 'spiritual' within the educative process places demands on teachers who both hold a particular faith tradition and identity as well as those who do not. Through

this research, an examination of the ways in which individual teachers understand 'spirituality' for themselves and the ways in which this understanding and belief are expressed has been undertaken.

One aspect of the process necessarily sought to ascertain how teachers define their roles as educators and how this role is exhibited in their school context. As educators, do they identify themselves as state servants whose role it is to deliver a curriculum (inclusive of RE and SMSC as envisioned in the 1988 Education Act) as a 'neutral' conduit of knowledge and development; or as agents of transformation and change who acknowledge the development of the spiritual aspect of personhood as important within the educative process. Developing this further, the study sought to uncover how teachers understand and begin to define the 'spirit', both in terms of aspects of identity and intelligence and how they do this through their teaching in both explicit and implicit interactions as well as through developmental opportunities for children inside and outside of the formal curriculum (Zohar and Marshall, 2000). As such a picture has emerged of how teacher's understand their spirituality and express this through professional encounters situated in interpersonal contact and professional contexts.

Within the discipline of Education there is a wealth of literature which seeks to explain the context in which Religion and Religious Education plays a part in the compulsory education sector. Within this literature there is an acknowledgement of some of the tensions inherent in this process and the appropriateness or lack of, in relation to the provision of Religious Education and Spiritual, Moral, Social and Cultural (SMSC) areas of learning. Issues that arise which feature prominently are; the role of religion in the contemporary culture of England, how religion and spirituality contribute to the educational process and what both areas offer in relation to the development of the whole child and the educator's role in this. Through exploring these issues both by examining the participants' lived experiences in their professional practice and within the literature itself a picture of the complexities has emerged. Challenges will be made to the positions taken by Freud, Marx and Durkheim which seek to relegate the spiritual and religious to the peripheries of human experience or the problematisation of these areas in relation to the lived experiences of individuals.

Seeking to understand how spirituality is understood and defined by a small number of primary school teachers in Kent will shed light on whether the educative process within

Initial Teacher Training (ITT) at Canterbury Christ Church University assists in this enterprise. The ways in which teachers come to define or redefine spirituality may be as a result of a personal interest in faith or an active participation in their faith tradition and corresponding practises. However, it is hoped that through the research process some information may arise which may show that teachers should be made aware of such issues during their teacher training, or are given the pedagogical tools to be aware of and attentive to the different ways in which spirituality is embedded in the teaching and learning process and their role within this cycle. It is hoped that the research will lead to a greater understanding of how teachers understand their roles in relation to attending to the spiritual aspect of the educative process. This understanding will lead to a more refined approach to the design and delivery of pedagogy within Higher Education which will benefit the next generation of Primary school teachers emerging from Kent.

# Defining 'Spirituality'.

Spirituality can be said to be that aspect of the self which moves beyond the material and seeks unity with other (Palmer, 2003). However, this definition whilst appropriate to the cultural context which we are examining can fall short when examined with regards to the spiritual journey undertaken within a religious tradition. As such, it becomes clear that to define spirituality is to attempt to bridge the gap between institutional religion and that of an individual's spiritual journey outside of such a community.

Acknowledging my role as researcher and the ways in which my interpretations and existing concepts affect the interpretative process is central to IPA methodology. It is necessary to foreground my own concept and definition of the spiritual, doing so assists in positioning myself as an active participant in the research and process of analysis. As outlined in the 'Abstract' my own preconceptions have emerged from a broadly Christian perspective. From this, my personal definition of the spiritual and spirituality is 'the awareness of and relationship to the numinous and that which is beyond the material'.

The definitions which follow present several variations on how 'Spirituality' can be defined from within both sacred and secular paradigms. It is hoped that at this stage an awareness of some of the complexities is evident when seeking to understand the term 'spirituality' and how it may be further complicated when individual understandings of it

are defined during the research process. Taking in to account the desire of the researcher to uncover the participants' definitions of the spiritual, the definitions which follow have been chosen to avoid the assumption of the 'sacred' being inherent in the positions taken by the teachers in the study. As such, they are positioned outside of formal religious traditions which may or may not be those of the participants and as such not reflective of their understanding of spirituality.

# **Definitions of 'Spirituality'.**

'Spirituality is not just a cerebral activity, but involves feeling, intuition and emotional areas of human experience' (Tacey, 2004, p50).

'Spirituality is subjective in the sense that it involves often intense experiences (of joy, awe, sorrow, gratitude etc.), but objective in the sense that it is focussed on something which is and remains external to and higher than the self' (Heelas and Woodhead, 2004, p5).

'The animating or vital principle; that which gives life to the physical organism in contrast to its material elements, the breath of life' (Zohar and Marshall, 2000).

As can be understood from these definitions, there are multiple ways in which spirituality can be conceptualised. The examples given all point towards a confusion over the subjective and objective realities pertaining to spirituality. As such, the educational enterprise grapples with definitions which touch on the numinous but are somewhat removed from the cerebral or the intellectual. It is hoped that the findings in this thesis contribute in some way to a redefining of the concept of the spiritual in relation to professionals engaged in the education of others. The unique contribution to knowledge which has arrived out of this study is that spirituality can be defined as 'moments of profundity and connection with other that leads to change'.

# Chapter 2

#### **Literature Review**

# Spirituality as an Educational Aspiration

Several themes arise within the literature regarding the role of Religious Education (RE) and Spiritual, Moral, Social and Cultural education (SMSC) which outline the complex and contested nature of these areas of the curriculum. Their historical and contemporary manifestations through legislation as well as how these areas of learning and intelligence are understood by teachers and acted on through pedagogical approaches also need to be examined in order for a clear understanding of the ways in which the Spiritual aspect of teaching and learning can be examined. This literature review approaches this complex area through a thematic analysis of the major areas of literature which examine this subject:

- The historical and contemporary context of Religious Education
- Understanding 'spirituality' and the 'spiritual' within education literature
- The role of 'spirituality' in contemporary educational practises

Through the Literature Review and the study as a whole, it emerges that the way in which Spirituality is conceptualised as a discreet 'religious' phenomenon is reductivist in nature. As such, legislation, curriculum design and pedagogy and the interplay of these in the professional context reveals the complex ways in which Spirituality is conceptualised amongst the participants as evidenced from the accounts given in this study. This points towards a complex and multi-faceted concept of spirituality at odds with simplistic definitions of the spiritual in relation to educational practice. The implications of this makes clear a new approach to professional identity and practice which incorporates a holistic view of the individual and privileges individuality and creativity is needed.

# The historical and contemporary context of RE and SMSC

The English Teachers' Standards state that all teachers must be tolerant and respectful of the faiths and beliefs of others (DfE, Section 2.4, 2014). This succinct statement is the latest in an attempt by central government to meet the needs of a changing society by

ensuring that plurality and the promotion of tolerance within schools fosters a sense of national unity with an awareness and respect of diversity. The current teachers' standards are the latest in a long tradition of trying to make sense of where religion and faith should be placed within the educational framework of English society, with particular regard to how teachers should perform. An understanding of how these different historical steps have led to the latest manifestation of RE and SMSC is needed in order to begin to understand the contemporary issues within classroom practice and curriculum design.

Religion and the spirituality's role within the educational enterprise has always been symptomatic of the society in which it is operating in. Throughout the early part of the 20<sup>th</sup> century Religious/Instruction assumed spiritual development as a central concern within it and the assumption that religious education (pertaining to the dominant culture) was Christian in character. Religion and Christian Anglicanism in particular within England was understood to be part of the grand narrative of Englishness. After the First World War and prior to the Second, religion was seen as an essential component of not only character formation but also good character and teachers should be at the forefront of instilling a sense of religiosity in to their pupils (Underhill 1927 cited in Copley 2000). The rebuilding of society after the Second World War was imbued with an Anglican hue and Anglicanism was tacitly accepted as a sustaining feature of the cultural landscape. This engagement with Christianity and Anglicanism in particular, could be assumed to influence the new approaches to education arising from the post war period (Davie, 1994, pp32-39). However, this assurance in Christianity and Anglicanism changed and was challenged by emerging trends of secularisation in post-war Britain.

Grand narratives of the transitory era between modernism and post-modernism were challenged and contested at every turn and none more so than the role of religion and spiritual development, not only within the educational domain but also on a wider scale as the trauma of the First and Second World Wars ebbed and was replaced by an emerging vision of British society more sympathetically secular in outlook.

The latter half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century saw a shift in the national consciousness and the assumed Christian heritage of the nation, this feeling of disconnection with not only the Church of England but with 'establishment' institutions in general paralleled the feeling across Europe (Kay, 2003). The transition from a modernist outlook that assumed the grand narratives of religion or secularism was replaced in part by post-modernism and the

challenge that institutions of old would face from this new social consciousness. From the 1960s onwards secular narratives began to be heard more loudly as within education the Christian narrative started to give way to secular humanist narratives. From this point on, within maintained schools, the role of the teacher and leader in schools started to be less important than the attitudes which they exhibited and fostered in their pupils (Woodhead and Catto, 2012, pp65-66).

A subtle shift in focus from the 1960s onwards from the role of the leader to the fostering of attitudes has also led to an awareness and desire for Religious and Spiritual education/development to be more individualistic. That is to say, rather than the modernist philosophy of shared heritage and understanding the post-modernist placing of the individual at the centre of interpretation and understanding rather than the communal, began to become normative within education. Alongside of this the decline in a religious (observant) way of life began to be replaced by an interest in spirituality on an individual level. Perhaps, spirituality was understood to be more inclusive rather than the exclusivity of institutionalised religion and an antidote to not only the sectarianism of the Second World War but also the tensions between the populations of communist and capitalist Europe (Fraser, 2007).

More recently, the role of Religious Education has been challenged overtly by some educationalists as well as social commentators. Emerging from debates commencing from the latter half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century in England, there is now a question over what the purpose of Religious Education is; is it a subject which should be studied as a phenomenological observation on population's religious traditions or should Religious Education be confessional in that it seeks to promote a sense of the divine or an observance of a particular religious tradition? A call for the removal of any type of faith formation within RE is justified by the assumed secularity of contemporary England and the assumption that the majority of the population are not practicing devotees of any recognised religion. This assumption is deeply contested by faith groups in particular but also some educationalists that see the picture as being far more complicated than justification through lack of attendance at a place of worship. Contemporary issues which have manifested this tension have been evidenced in the media by the 'Trojan Horse' issue in Birmingham, where one view of faith was understood to be more desirable than a liberal approach to religion (Astor, p584, 2018). The rise of academy chains sponsored by or supported from a particular faith perspective has also challenged the recent assumptions around the ways in

which muscular liberalism views religion and faith in the educational enterprise and points towards a view of religion which is set within a communally held truth claim of that religion and faith (Revell, pp55-56, 2015).

Proponents of 'Secularisation Theory' (Boyd, 2010) who assert that religiosity has given way to modern industrialisation are now faced with the problem of the change in how society understands and practices religion, in particular the established interest in the spiritual, both inherited religious traditions and new religious and spiritual movements. Schools and teachers are also bound up in this debate. Does the apparent lack of religious and implied spiritual observance on the part of their pupils mean that RE and SMSC are redundant or does it mean that new understandings of what 'spiritual' and 'spirituality' mean should feed into how Religious Education and Spiritual development is thought of in maintained schools? Alongside of this, the inherited Christian identity of England has not given way entirely. An awareness of what Hemming calls 'vicarious religion' that is to say, the appreciation and endorsement of inherited religious traditions and institutions within society rather than the primacy of individual response and interaction to them should perhaps still influence RE and SMSC pedagogy and practice (2011).

#### **Education Acts from 1943-2013**

The brief outline above shows the dynamic nature in which RE and SMSC (as spiritual education is included currently) has developed over the past 80 years. What will follow is a very brief outline of the aims of three Education Acts which have been central to how RE and SMSC have developed within the school environment and the impact that these subjects were hoped to have on the individual pupil and the community at large.

The 1944 Education Reform Act sought to cement community identity through a reestablishment of perceived shared ideals and cultural identifiers. RE and spiritual development was seen as the responsibility of individual Local Education Authorities (LAs) in developing spiritual education for each pupil attending a non-faith school. Schools now working under the direction of their LA were now accountable for not only the education of pupils across all curriculum areas and RE but also in relation to pupils' spiritual development and the various ways both inside and outside of the formal curriculum that would achieve this. The link between LA-school-pupil was hoped to be

self-sustaining in that spiritual development of the child was realised through engagement and participation of that child with their community in a positive way (Education Act, 1944, 2:23-30).

A gradual move away from LA supervision of spiritual development towards schools being responsible for the spiritual and religious development of their pupils was realised in the 1988 Education Reform Act (Education Reform Act 1988 1.6-9). This act allowed schools, while still answerable to the LA, to become solely responsible for the spiritual development and religious education of their pupils. It could be assumed that the forty years that passed between the two acts was sufficient for the aims of the 1944 Act of community cohesion to be assumed to be met and that the 1988 Act endorsed this by allowing schools to assume to be representative of the community in which they were based.

Inspection in Religious Education within maintained schools was formalised in the 1992 Education Act with the creation of Ofsted and the inspection framework created by them which revised how Spiritual, Moral, Social and Cultural (SMSC) education as well as RE would be delivered. Through the wording of the Ofsted Inspection Framework a separation between personal and intellectual development was made explicit for the first time with particular regard to SMSC within classroom and school life (Ofsted Inspection Framework, 1992, Sec 37). This has been further developed with a revision of the inspection guidance which exhibits a vagueness on what Ofsted understand to be aspects of evidence pertaining to spiritual development in children and again, separate spiritual development from the rigour assumed in other subjects (Ofsted Inspection Framework, 2013, Sec 153).

The gradual development of RE and areas of learning which foster spiritual development (such as SMSC) over the last seventy years have been paralleled between legislation and school provision. Where RE and SMSC have struggled most recently to be understood by teachers, is to what extent should the curriculum and by virtue of this, the school, provide and be accountable for their provision (Allen et al, 2011). The National Curriculum which came into effect in September 2014 makes no mention of SMSC or any aspects of spiritual development. Alongside of this, the continuation of RE to sit outside of the National Curriculum while remaining a statutory subject supervised by LAs means that subjects where development on a spiritual level are seen as something 'other' than that of core and

foundation subjects (Cush, 2007). Ofsted's 2013 Inspection guidance make clear that assessing spiritual development, the fostering of SMSC is beyond the scope of other subjects such as Mathematics, Science, History and Geography. In order to assess SMSC in particular, it must be observed in aspects of school ethos and culture which are outside of the domain of the classroom or individual teacher's expertise (Eaude, 2006). It could be argued that placing aspects of spirituality outside of academic accountability is recommended because of the individual nature of spirituality. However, by placing SMSC (spiritual development in particular) and elements of RE outside of the established inspection process exhibits a value judgment on these areas of the curriculum which has been passed down to schools through the inspection process and National Curriculum.

However, spirituality has been an area where academics and curriculum commentators have acknowledged as being something which is difficult to define and an area which can be 'felt' rather than 'observed' in school life. Carr (cited in Wright, 2000, p85) posits the view that 'some precise definition of spiritual education...is an extremely unpromising strategy to adopt'. Implied in this is an awareness of the subjective nature of spirituality and how inter-subjectivity of pupils and staff within schools is not something which is possible or desirable to bring into the fold of accountability in the same way as other subjects may be. Does this mean that the subjects under investigation are any less worthy of academic rigour and the attention of educational professionals? Perhaps a pedagogy appropriate to these unique aspects of the educational endeavour is needed? Wright suggests (2000, p96) 'what is needed is a pedagogy capable of addressing both the universality of humanity's spiritual aspirations and the actuality of distinct spiritual traditions'.

# Current state of RE and SMSC; definition and exemplars

Both RE and SMSC occupy different places within the National Curriculum and within school coverage and ethos, however both subjects are closely related in terms of content and the qualities they wish to foster in children, particularly in the Primary school setting. This places an interesting dilemma on teachers and their schools in that their level of expertise is assumed (as it is with all other subjects, irrespective of the teacher's first degree subject and level of professional development). To make differentiating between the two subjects easier so that an analysis of what their aims and objectives are a definition of both is needed (Kibble, pp64-65 in Best, 2000). It is hoped that this will highlight the

shared areas between the subjects but will also foreground some of the issues facing teachers in delivering these subjects and how they understand aspects of spirituality (both their own and pupils) which will inform their teaching within and aside from National Curriculum coverage.

As previously mentioned the National Curriculum has never included how RE should be taught within maintained primary schools merely stating that RE is a statutory subject, monitored at a local level by the LEA (Local Education Authority). The reasons for this have been previously highlighted but Ofsted have provided a loose definition of RE in their latest subject report on RE, 'Religious Education: realising the potential' 2013;

'Religious education (RE) should make a major contribution to the education of children and young people. At its best, it is intellectually challenging and personally enriching. It helps young people develop beliefs and values, and promotes the virtues of respect and empathy, which are important in our diverse society. It fosters civilised debate and reasoned argument, and helps pupils to understand the place of religion and belief in the modern world'. (Ofsted, 2013).

As the definition shows, what is to be covered and to what degree is left at the discretion of the LA's Standing Advisory Council for RE (SACRE) a legal body which designs, administers, supervises and reports back on RE to LAs within maintained schools in a local area. Unlike any other area, what exactly is to be taught, when and in what depth is unique to a local area but hoped that it will be contribute to the overall perceived local/national identity and value systems.

SMSC, again unlike any other area of study within schools, is left to the discretion of the school body and to a large extent is in the hands of individual teachers with the traditions of the school and the vision of the Governing Body and Head teacher as chief architects, assisting in the development of these areas of learning. The National Curriculum of 2014, does not include any aspect of SMSC but through Ofsted's recent inspection framework Ofsted, 2014) it is assumed that aspects of SMSC will be observable, not only through teaching activities, but in classroom and school culture and as well as the ethos of the school as a whole. 'When considering how well the school promotes pupils' SMSC, inspectors should take into account the impact of the range of opportunities provided for them to develop their self-esteem and confidence' (Ofsted, 2014, p37).

There is a clear link between RE and SMSC from the above definitions; that the fostering of positive attitudes within pupils is paramount. Aside from this common theme there are some very obvious differences. Whilst what is to be covered in RE is not stipulated explicitly, there is the expectation that pupils will learn about major world faiths. This does make RE more similar to other humanities subjects in that this subject coverage provides a syllabus from which pupils can learn from an etic perspective, the religious beliefs, traditions and spiritualities of others (Brown et al, 2012).

Where SMSC differs greatly is that its coverage is taken to be embedded in all areas of the curriculum and school life. This poses a difficulty for teachers, which is twofold. How do they ensure they are providing opportunities of SMSC for children in all subject areas and how do they know what to cover? Is this something that is discretionary or are there themes which a school expects to be covered by the teacher? The intangible aspect of SMSC makes it very difficult for teachers to construct opportunities which could be observed in ways which would be any other than contrived, 'The SMSC agenda in England and Wales is not one of the standards to be reached by everyone in the same way and to an approved and measured level' (Walters, 2015).

Both RE and SMSC have been noted as areas of weakness within school on a national level. As recently as 2013 Ofsted's report on RE, 'RE: Realising the Potential', observed several areas in which RE in particular is failing within the primary school setting. These ranged from a lack of clarity as to what RE is and its aims at a local and school level, the weakness of subject knowledge on behalf of teachers and a lack of appropriate and high levels of assessment and monitoring in RE (Ofsted, 2013, p5). The judgement of this report implies that the poor state of RE currently is largely the fault of teachers, schools and LAs. This may indeed be the case but when examining the literature and definitions of RE and SMSC from Ofsted; a lack of clarity and suitable definition also points towards a lack of clear direction.

Allowing for LAs to construct their own response to the necessities for their area acted out in RE in schools allows for a certain amount of freedom and professional judgement; but only if the judgement is an informed one. Something that Ofsted itself, does not find in its own research. The National Curriculum (2013) providing no guidance for SMSC could be viewed as an area of accountability which teachers have little guidance on, but one could infer is an equal lack of expertise in this area on the part of teachers, schools and

governors.

What follows is an examination of some of the pedagogical issues in RE, which also has implications for SMSC opportunities that will further an analysis of the difficulties in understanding and delivery opportunities for spiritual education and how it may be understood by teachers. Beginning to understand what is expected of teachers' planning and teaching of RE, will assist in understanding some of the ways in which spiritual education and how spirituality is understood by teachers. This may allow them to formalise their responses to issues around their own spirituality and the challenges and opportunities which present themselves in particular settings.

# Pedagogies of RE and Spiritual Opportunity

Some of the issues raised above brings attention to the issue that subjects and areas of teaching such as RE and SMSC have pedagogical issues and pedagogical models which set them apart from other humanities subjects and areas of teaching and nurture. The criticisms made by Ofsted, particularly of RE, but also the omission of SMSC as an area of learning and the inspection of its nuanced influence in classrooms and schools will now be addressed by an analysis of some of the pedagogical tools which teachers of RE and those responsible for the embedding of SMSC across curricula have available to them. That is to say, the issues faced by teachers of primary school children who take seriously the challenge of teaching RE and SMSC should know, if they are subject specialists with a first degree in RE or a Post Graduate qualification specialising in RE, or possibly non-specialist teachers, through professional development or personal inclination have sought out and become skilled in.

RE should not only expose children to the religious traditions of others but should also instil in them the ability to pose deep questions of themselves and others in relation to religious and spiritual beliefs plus those of others in a respectful way (Ofsted, 2013). In order to do this, the task has very often been split into two separate enterprises. One to teach the major world faiths as a body of study with traditions and philosophies held by its followers. Alongside and separate to this, teachers should also foster the ability in pupils to empathise with the beliefs of others and to seek to find parallels with these beliefs in their own lives.

Michael Grimmitt broke these two pedagogical challenges into two headings with the hope

that children could achieve these aims. They are;

Attainment Target (AT) 1: Learning <u>About</u> Religion and AT 2: Learning <u>From</u> Religion. (Grimmitt, 2002).

These ATs have been used by teachers familiar with the distinct pedagogies of RE since the 90s and according to Chater and Erricker (2013, pp43-48) have often been delivered in two separate RE lessons or parts of a lesson with a shared learning objective. Clearly AT2 is more explicitly aimed at the nurturing of spiritual skills in children such as the ability to respectfully and critically make sense of aspects of others spirituality and their own. AT1 also has some of these opportunities in that in order to present the religious practices of others, some coverage of the belief systems behind these are necessary. Following from this, it can be said that the separation of AT1 and AT2 as two distinct enterprises is more subtle and nuanced that at first appears.

Emerging out of this dominant pedagogy, other pedagogies from particular religious and philosophical standpoints have emerged. One pedagogy which features prominently in England and from an Evangelical Christian perspective is that of 'Concept Cracking' which seeks to take attributes and lessons taken from faith stories in particular but not exclusively and relating these to children's lives. It should be noted that 'Evangelical' is mentioned here as the denomination and the pedagogy does not seek to evangelise pupils to Christianity, but to present Christianity from one particular denominational tradition (Cooling, pp 153-169, 2000 in Grimmitt, 2002). Another pedagogy which features prominently is the 'Gift to the Child Approach' which exposes children to a variety of artefacts and stories from within a variety of religious traditions and scaffolds children in making sense of these artefacts with reference to their own lives, objects and personal stories which may share parallels (Hull, pp112-129, 2000 in Grimmitt, 2002).

Recently, there has been some revision of these pedagogies and in particular the perceived over reliance of the AT1/2 model of RE with the hope of increasing subject knowledge as well as developing the skills and attributes of empathy and awe and wonder in children. Chater and Erricker have noted that the closeness of AT1/2 but the possible misinterpretation and over reliance on this by teachers has led to a pedagogical model which inhibits creativity in RE and lessens the opportunity for personal development in children, with particular regards to those aspects of character which could be said to be spiritual in nature, awe, empathy, openness, unity etc. Chater and Erricker have called for a

pedagogy of liberation from which the blending of AT1/2 is taken as interwoven in all aspects of RE teaching (Chater and Erricker, 2013).

# **Pedagogical Challenges and Responses**

The role and purpose of RE has been an area of debate as it has tried to balance the tensions and perspectives of a variety of interested parties (both religious, educational and governmental). Arising out of this debate the National Framework for RE (2013) outlines the broad aims of a general RE curriculum to include areas of spiritual development alongside formal knowledge of religion and belief as well as intellectual and academic skills of interpretation and expression. The various ways in which RE is envisioned by the different stakeholders contributing to this framework has led to a confusion about the aims and purpose of RE (Chater and Erricker, pp51-52, 2013). It has contributed to the approaches to the teaching of RE and the different strands listed above being varied and unclear from an individual teacher's perspective (ibid). The Ofsted report on RE 2013 made clear that the overall standard of RE teaching was poor with the implication that poor spiritual education was endemic in maintained schools in England. The All Parliamentary Party Group on RE (APPGRE) carried out a parallel study on RE in 2013 'RE: The Truth Unmasked' (APPGRE, 2013) which not only had similar results to that of Ofsted but identified some of the specific problems facing teachers of RE and the teaching of SMSC in maintained schools. The APPG found that one of the greatest obstacles facing teachers in the delivery of quality RE was the lack of subject specialists in RE. Clearly, without the presence of informed quality leadership and specialism in RE, the specific subject pedagogies outlined above will most likely be unfamiliar to most teachers. The implications for this study is that teachers will have to rely on their own pedagogical knowledge and hope that this is transferable in some way to RE or if they are teachers from within a particular religious tradition or spiritual leaning will use these constructs as a way of informing their own RE and spiritual development of pupils (Greenfield, 2008).

# Spirituality and Education

# Spirituality: concepts, definitions and misunderstanding.

Attempting to make sense of the term spirituality is fraught with difficulties. In this section an attempt is made to outline some of the ways in which spirituality and the lived experience of it is articulated by examining how it has been understood within education, psychology and religion with particular focus on concepts of the self and the spiritual-self in contemporary British culture. An awareness of the educational and cultural landscape has contributed to the ways in which the spiritual is understood as outlined in the following exploration. The analysis of spirituality will end with an examination of some of the objections to particular definitions of the spiritual component of an individual or group's identity as a mode of knowing.

# **Dualism and Spirituality.**

An examination of how spirituality is conceptualised and understood should take into account what the motivating factors (if any) of the spiritual drive are. Doing so, places demands on the ways in which this question can be answered. Namely, is spirituality and the spiritual aspect of personhood something that is unique, uniform or imagined in humanity? Does it have an ontological existence and if so, how is this manifest in the inner and outer life of the individual (Finke, 2012)?

Several contributors posit the notion that spirituality is one of the defining elements of what it means to be human (Hay and Nye, 2006, Palmer, 2003). As such it is an element of the lived experience that while being a primary aspect of personhood, is experienced, conceptualised and articulated over time and as such is prone to development throughout the lives of individuals. Spirituality could be one lens through which questions about individual existence, place in the world and destiny are examined. Where feelings of isolation and uncertainty arise, spirituality would seem to offer a space from which these areas can be examined and where appropriate, reacted to. The centrality of one's being in creation and how individual and external reality coexist can be one of magnitude and disorientation which Radford terms as 'the Existential Angst' (Radford, 2006, p89). This being in the world and what it means to be an active and passive participant could be argued to be one of the primary concerns which the spiritual aspect is concerned.

Ways of knowing between inner and outer realities and the implications this has in regards how the contribution spirituality has in relation to to education has been noted by Rogers and Hill (2002, p276). In examining this area with a focus on professional educators, they found that the tacit position taken by early career educators implied a dualistic positioning in relation to spirituality and knowledge. The relationship between the interior life of the individual and the external realities and relationships is just one of the ways in which duality enters into the debate concerning individual spirituality. Before examining this particular dualism, an overview of how dualism affects concepts of the spiritual is needed which may help locate the current analysis within a historical context.

In contemporary western culture, spirituality is no longer synonymous with Christianity or Christian concepts of the spirit (Sheldrake, 2007). However, it is important to note that the term is still bound up with the notion of the spirit being separate to the material or at the least set apart from it. This can be traced back to Plato, who separated the spirit *psyche* from the mental or intellectual *nous* (Webster, 2009, p109). As such, the spiritual was seen as something set apart from the material world and primarily concerned with the immaterial or metaphysical. This being the case the realm of the spiritual and the individual's engagement in the spiritual life was primarily concerned with an interaction with the divine. One of the results of this was that the spiritual and the intellectual came to be conceptualised as distinct features of the person with different functions and concerns. The intellectual *nous* concerned itself mainly with the ways in which the individual interacted with the material and societal world. This would have major implications for western concepts of the spiritual which have continued to some extent into the current era (Radford, 2006, p385).

Pre-Enlightenment concepts of the spiritual were based on the foundations of Platonic concepts, both Descartes and Newton, according to Radford (2006), made an attempt to move the workings of the mind away from the spiritual enterprise and place these above (hierarchically) in terms of their utilitarian worth. The result of which was that spirituality has come to be seen by many as solely an immaterial concept whose concerns are of secondary importance to those of the material. This development of a 2D concept of existence, spiritual-material or spiritual and intellectual has been developed post-Enlightenment to a 3D way of understanding the existential whereby immaterial and material or self and other is also conceptualised while taking into account the emic nature of reality and how society, culture and it's structures affect the person (Hogan, 2009,

pp139-141). The way in which a person thought about themselves as both a spiritual and intellectual being whose concerns are of the existential and transcendent, became informed by the acknowledgment of the ways which culture, history and societal/political structures affect individual identity. According to Hogan (2009, p141) a new concept of the spiritual has arisen in which the magical and mythical as well as consciousness of structures is a 4D perspective of spirituality in which the symbolic and metaphorical works with the external structures of the outer world to provide a view of spirituality that is ego free. This could be thought of as a subjective form of spirituality or spiritual awareness which is concerned with the primacy of individual rather than the interplay of the self with the other. The implications for this in regards to teaching in particular and education in general is that spirituality among some teachers within current western cultures may be seen to be wholly individualistic (Bainbridge, 2000, p168). Developing this further, it can be assumed that educators who view the spiritual in this way are not outward focussed but perhaps myopic in regards their view of personal spirituality. This could be because of the current climate of spirituality as removed or in the process of removal from distinct religious traditions. If this is the case, Bainbridge posits the view that educators may be spiritually illiterate and unable to draw on spiritual tradition or vocabulary to enrich the learning experience of their pupils. 4D perspectives of the spiritual do not however, adequately explain the ways in which the individual is bound up with the immaterial and material and how both of these realms affect the way that the spiritual is conceptualised and articulated. Furthermore, it could be posited that spirituality in this form is so relativistic or postmodern that it become solipsistic or dis-integrated between the individual and the external.

# Spirituality as integration of inner and outer lives.

Attempting to answer questions of existential angst foregrounds the reality that the individual exists in an outer world, as such the inner and outer worlds are mutually meaning making and provide in their different ways, perspectives on what it means to exist. How spirituality is bound up with this is not in the way in which a 3D or 4D inward focus might attempt but as an integration of the individual with the world around them.

An individual makes sense of an external reality whether physical or metaphysical through an internal dialogue of both psyche and nous. The outer reality affects the internal conception of it whilst the individual is at liberty to react appropriately. One example of the way in which this may be conceptualised is the way in which an infant reaches out for the parent, in such a way the internal reaches out through a physical act to have its reality changed by the external reciprocation to that act. Inner and outer realities influence and affect one another (Alma and Zock, 2002, p8). The false dualism of the intellectual vs the spiritual or the inner reality vs the outer reality is made obvious through our embodied self. The self is bound up with the influence of the outer social world; the social world influences the spiritual and inner concepts of self. Wintersgill (coted in Rogers and Hill, 2002, p278) makes clear the danger of a false dualism between the spiritual and intellectual domains in regards to education in particular. Through this dualism the integration of inner experienced knowledge as opposed to outer observable knowledge is incorrect and leads to a distinction between the intellectual and spiritual. Rather than view it in this way, Wintersgill posits the view that the spiritual and intellectual should be viewed as having equal worth.

While spirituality may be primarily concerned with the inner life the ways in which the inner life can be examined or the way in which an individual's spirituality can be developed is varied. One aspect of spiritual development which challenges the idea of dualism is the way in which an individual can seek answers to the existential through an interaction and involvement with others. This could be through religious or societal structures. (Harris, 2007). In doing so an individual might draw on the wisdom and knowledge around them to provide a vocabulary from which to articulate and make sense of their spirituality. The outer world benefits the inner in ways which the individual partakes of the outer reality to both benefit self and other (Radford, 2006, p386). Spirituality developed in this way (inner searching assisted through outward engagement) may manifest itself on an individual basis but might also become part of a spiritual or religious act. The spiritual (private) exercise can manifest itself in a religious (public) act, the interplay between these two areas of individual and society develops the concept of the spiritual being equally involved with the individual and the world around them. An integrated picture of spirituality emerges in which individual and external are symbiotic and in a relationship of continuous self-realisation.

Rather than thinking of self and the external as dualistic, conceptualising an interplay between the two might be more accurate as an interplay between two polarities of existence and knowing. An iterative cycle between the self and other, whether through an

internal conversation or an external articulation, bridges the gap between the two aspects of knowing and reassessing an individual's place in the world. In this way the false dualism investigated so far is further challenged ontologically and epistemologically as the way in which self is socially constructed is undermined. Rather than self being co-constructed with the outer world, an iterative relationship presents the possibility of an awareness of different 'selves' or identities within an individual where the spiritual life and aspect is but one of mutually dependent identities.

The way in which the spiritual life might be expressed externally whilst being conceptualised internally may also give rise to religious, ethical and moral choices being made. How the spiritual is informed by the external structures may vary between individuals, communities and cultures but where the interplay takes place one's identity (as a component part of their many other identities) is articulated by the choices they make. This relationship between the inner voice with the outer morals and values is a convergence with the self and community. The psyche and nous meets the body external as part of community. The role that the community plays in informing an individual's concept of self, including their understanding of shared morals and values, is a direct influence on the inner and outer conversation of the spiritual aspect of an individual. Where one has to consider how one's morality and values impacts others plays a part in the same individual's spiritual formation. The reaching out as outlined previously is answered by the response of the community to the individual's actions. Inner and outer are mutually conversant (Alma and Zock, 2002, p2).

The domains in which one is present in the world or community then is of importance in that the groups and affiliations one belong to can have an impact on the way in which the individual constructs and conceptualises their identities. One's identity is partly forged in the rules and commitments one chooses to be part of in society. The way in which an individuals' inner concept of self is actualised is not fixed but runs parallel with the different stages of life. For example the groups and loyalties one may have will change over their life time from school, to university to work for example. All of these choices not only affect the individual but the individuals around them. The commitments and affiliations one makes helps shape their identity but also how others view them. What an individual commits to may not (given free will) be forced upon them and is the culmination of an inner dialogue and identification of shared values, morals and aspirations. This 'personal resonance' (ibid) is manifested when an individual is moved to

become part of something through an identification of mutually beneficial or compatible elements.

The interaction between the external/communal with the internal/individual helps to ascertain that the spiritual is not an element of the individual which is set aside from the outer world but is bound up in it (Sacks, 2011). To separate the inner and outer worlds is too reductive and over simplifies the many ways in which inner and outer influence one another. If the spiritual is concerned with addressing the existential angst of being in this world and one's place in it, placing inner and outer realities in opposition to one another denies the nature of existence. When allotting one form of existence primacy over another in that the intellectual is seen as the superior to the spiritual a false dichotomy is established which dis-organises the facets of what it means to be fully human. Understanding the ways in which an individual's spirituality is articulated internally and externally will assist in making the case for an integrated view of spirituality with other aspects of personhood.

#### The Outward Expression of Spirituality

# **Expressions of Spirituality**

How spirituality is to be understood as part of the lived experience will now be examined in detail. Individual's awareness of and engagement with their own spirituality, whether within a religious framework, influenced by one or outside of it shall be the focus of this next section. Hay and Nye (2006) will provide a detailed 'geography' from which aspects of the spiritual impulse and action can be understood.

# **Spirituality within Evolutionary Theory**

To be spiritual is a natural impulse. It is part of what it means to be human and as such all people, irrespective of their culture and religion have a capacity for the spiritual (Webster 2009, Adams et al 2008, Hay and Nye 2006). How this capacity is engaged with and understood varies but what seems clear is that to be spiritual is one aspect of what it means

to be human. This view has been put forward from evolutionary sociologists such as Alistair Hardy in the Gifford Lectures of 1965 (Hardy, 1965 and Hay and Nye, 2006, p22). According to Hardy, the spiritual drive was one aspect of our shared humanity which provided an evolutionary advantage to our species as it gave rise to feelings of connectedness, loyalty and morality, all of which assisted in the cementing of relationships within groups and the well-being of the individual. Developed further, Durham (1991) provides a schemata from which to understand this. Rather than being a genetic construct, spirituality (being of the immaterial) provides 'memes' upon the individual. These spiritual 'memes' (a parallel to physical genes) are aspects of humanity which are advantageous to pass on. Feelings of connection and empathy over time became desirable and formalised within groups and societies and were recognised as advantageous to cultivate. These 'desirable' characteristics and tendencies became structured into 'allomemes' which were generalised tendencies that were advantageous to the individual but to their community as a whole. According to Durham the concept of 'according to consequence' meant that when these traits were exhibited and the results of which were positive in nature they became identified as valuable and worth having.

Spirituality then, according to the theories outlined above, is a natural occurrence shared by humanity. As such, it could be argued that spirituality precedes religion and is independent of it at its point of origin. Spirituality then, is not synonymous with religion but may gain expression and voice through religious traditions (Adams et al, 2008, p23).

# **Understanding and Expressions of Spirituality**

'For many people, spirituality concerns their sense of connectedness and relationality with self, others, the world (or cosmos) and for many it also includes a sense of connectedness and relationality with a transcendent dimension, which explicitly name as God' (Adams et al, 2008, p24).

This definition is useful when exploring how individuals conceptualise and 'sense' the spiritual as it encompasses a concept of the spiritual that may or may not include a theistic element. Spiritual sensitivity might be understood in many ways throughout life and the contexts which one is immersed in. An awareness of how the spiritual can be 'sensed' will now be undertaken with a view to understanding how spirituality is experienced and

understood on a conscious and unconscious level.

Hay and Nye (2006) provide a useful framework from which the spiritual can be understood. In their mapping of the 'geography' (Hay and Nye, 2006, p63) of the spirit they draw links between the sensing of the spiritual with differing levels of awareness whether they are cognitive, physical or emotional. These differing spiritual senses allow for the individual to respond to their feelings of connectedness and relationality across a variety of contexts and as such allow for the spiritual element of one's person to be acknowledged and/or observed.

An active participation of the meaning making process is inherent in Hay and Nye's mapping of the spiritual. In terms which reflect this they outline three broad areas (and sub-categories within these areas) from which an individual interacts with their spiritual impulse. Awareness Sensing, Mystery Sensing and Value Sensing are ways in which the individual through a variety of individual and communal contexts recognises and makes sense of their spirituality and spiritual aspect.

Awareness Sensing encompasses a conscious engagement with the spiritual. It is to be aware of self but also to have a reflective awareness or mindfulness of the different aspects of the physical, emotional and transcendental. This might be done in an intentional and focussed way or might be 'stumbled' upon when engaged in certain activities. Within Awareness Sensing recognition of the multiplicity of ways in which this might occur are through a focussed attention on the 'Here and Now', That is to say a conscious effort to become aware of the present moment whilst acknowledging the way in which past and future events cease or have not come to exist. To be present in the moment. Within these moments, religious affiliation may move from the foreground to the background. However, within religious traditions this state of engagement or sensing is often cultivated. Buddhism through Mindfulness or within Christianity through Contemplative Prayer. The way one feels when there is a response towards musical forms is also noted as a gateway to spiritual recognition and engagement. Music moves in a way which is different to the linguistic form but which, like language, communicates to us on a different level. This Tuning allows one to become emotionally immersed in the moment. Similar to this the concept of Flow is introduced. Being immersed in an activity or skill which one has had to master to a level where conscious effort is lessened but where the process becomes unconscious and fluent is one state which is found within the creative arts. How one

reflects upon this and the feeling of immersion in the activity possibly gives rise to a sense of unity or communion with whatever medium is being exercised. While these ways of sensing the spiritual could be thought of as incidental (that is to say, they may occur outside of one's conscious effort) *Focussing* is the process whereby an individual gives careful attention to the sensations of the body or the environment. The aim of which is to be immersed in the moment while an attempt is made to filter out distractions. A move away from the cognitive aspiration of the attainment of wisdom but towards an awareness of the wisdom offered through an observation of the body. Observing the physical as a tool for self-awareness (Hay and Nye, 2006, pp 65-70).

Contemplative awareness features with Hay and Nye's mapping of the spiritual through *Mystery Sensing*. This is different to the *Awareness Sensing* outlined above in that it is a definite, prescribed engagement with self and other, whether that is interpersonal or as part of creation. The natural world provides the opportunity for the spiritual to be experience and reflected upon in a conscious and definite act. Placing one's self in context and being moved by it may provide moments of *Awe and Wonder* where an individual is struck by their minuteness of their place within creation. Moreover, engaging one's *Imagination* to make sense of symbol and metaphor in relation to understandings of self and other indicates that there is a move from the experiential aspect of spirituality and towards a reflective, conscious aspect of one's spiritual engagement.

Emotional responses to the spiritual could occur through both *Awareness* and *Mystery Sensing* but Hay and Nye provide a specific framework for this through *Value Sensing*.

Value Sensing is a move away from the sense of self and towards a feeling of other. It is the seeking out of connectedness and empathy in those around the individual but also the individual's relationship with their environment. It could be argued that this aspect of spirituality is not easily placed within the western tradition of placing the cognitive in a hierarchically superior position at the expense of the emotional. In this way the spiritual engagement with the emotional assists in the prompting of action in oneself or as part of society. The emotional component of *Value* sensing can be experienced as delight or despair. Delight in one's connection with other or despair in one's feeling of isolation.

Within religious traditions this has been noted as 'the dark night of the soul' or feelings of euphoria and bliss. Where the emotions and memory of them are deep an individual might reflect on the metaphysical such as a contemplation on what the 'Ultimate Goodness' is and what this might mean for them. The question is goodness a force in the universe that is

theistic or atheistic is not a factor for consideration but one's response to what one feels in relation to goodness is of importance. 'Ultimate Goodness' within the religious traditions gives an individual a sense of place and a feeling of value and belonging. Attempting to make sense of these experiences and to find *Meaning* through spirituality (either within or outside of religious tradition or from an atheistic stance) is much deeper than a cognitive engagement. *Meaning* in this way engages the individual on an emotional and cognitive level to make sense of their lived experience and the ways in which their spirituality has affected their sense of place and their relationship with other. Through engaging all aspects of self from an emotional, imaginative and cognitive activity the spiritual can deeply affect an individual through a holistic engagement and immersion in appreciating self and other and by beginning to understand the relationship between individual, community and creation. It is a bringing about of connectedness and awareness of self in context (Hay and Nye, 2006, pp 71-77).

### The Rationality and Irrationality of the Spiritual

Throughout the above outline of Hay and Nye's mapping of the spiritual an acknowledgement of the many ways that the spiritual can be engaged was foregrounded. Aspects of spirituality which engaged the cognitive, emotional and imaginative have been given equal importance and without a hierarchy of validity. In order to make sense of this an examination of the ways in which spirituality can be divided into rational (throughout and observable) and irrational (emotional, intuitive) must be presented. Spirituality has been acknowledged as one aspect of humanity and has provided advantages of a social evolutionary nature (Davis et al, 2013). As this is the case, certain aspects of spirituality have become recognised as being of more value than others. Namely these have been when spirituality (within the western empiricist tradition) has complemented rather than challenged the rational. Spirituality is rational when it forms part of a formalised structure which can be observed and regulated. Namely, spirituality is thought of as rational when it is based on a religious tradition and organisation (Webster, 2009, p113). Juxtaposed with this concept of the spiritual is the concept of irrationality of the spiritual domain. This is not to say that spirituality is nonsensical but that it cannot be regulated and observed. As some aspects of it are subjective in nature, spirituality (historically) has been relegated to discourses outside of an intellectual or academic forum (ibid). Again, the placing the

intellectual or cognitive in a privileged position over the intuitive, imaginative or emotional is to misunderstand the multiplicity of ways in which individuals engage in the spiritual life and experiences (Sheldrake, 2005).

### Objections to Spirituality as a positive/self-agential phenomenon

Further examination of the spiritual aspect of personhood necessarily should be made by contrasting the positive aspect (as discussed above) with some objections to both the spiritual drive and the present understanding of it in western literature.

'Religion is the opium of the masses' (Marx, 1975) asserts that the spiritual is an individual response and the religious as a collective response is a misdirected attempt to connect with wider society in order to address collective need for social equality and justice. What Marx, one could argue, has identified is the association of spirituality with the need to feel a connection with other. In attempting to identify and connect with those around us for the common good, the Marxist assertion that each individual must form part of a collective response is not vastly different to the impulse to find empathy and commonality with other as outlined by Hay and Nye (2006). Marx makes clear that seeking connection seems to be an impulse which is common among all people but that the origin and destination of this drive is societal rather than transcendental.

Spirituality as an individual or universal neurosis was thought of as a negative element of the religio-spiritual aspect of the personality in Freud's understanding of the phenomenon (Freud, 1923). Attributing the metaphysical with meaning was one way in which individuals sought to ease the existential angst which Freud thought of as taking away the individual's responsibility to acknowledge and engage with aspects of the self which were perceived as problematic or negative. Institutional religion played a two-fold part in this process in that Freud attributed to it both the agential charge of providing individuals with a structure and culture which they could avoid confronting their own neurosis but also as a structure which was symptomatic and bound up in a cultural universal neurosis (Freud, 1928, pp30-35).

Connection with other have been the source of objection for Durkheim, along with Freud and Marx. Group dynamics and the euphoria one feels in certain situations are the source for what Durkheim identifies as 'spiritual' recounts of people. Durkheim coins the term,

'effervescence' to describe this sense of joy and connection one feels when engaged in religious activities such as worship within groups. Durkheim does not state whether these feelings arise out of an energetic or ecstatic form of religious worship of a more formal and reflective engagement. What is identified is that these feelings are reported from individuals when they have been engaged in group activities and when there is occasion to celebrate or remember as a collective (Hay and Nye, 2009, p 24).

Hay and Nye acknowledge that the objections made by Marx, Freud and Durkheim were of their time and were charges laid at institutionalised religion rather than religion and spirituality. Spirituality in its current academic and societal understanding was not part of the social discourse when analysed by the above authors so an assessment of their objections must be placed within the cultural context in which they were writing. However, aspects which Marx, Freud and Durkheim raised must be addressed and Hay and Nye (2006) do so in a way which directly challenges the assumptions made in the three objections previously explored. Marx asserts that the yearn for the religious is in fact a misplaced calling to find connection with other to address social inequality and that religion places a negative role in that it distracts individuals from addressing their socioeconomic need continuing and exacerbating their need. Social inequality and poverty have a detrimental effect on those affected by it. An individual who is impoverished is holistically poor, which includes their spiritual well-being. That is to say, inequality, as Marx illustrates, is a negative aspect which affects the entire person as an economic, social, psychological and spiritual level; it damages a person's agency. Freud's analysis of the way in which religion continues to leave an individual ill through distracting them from engaging in their own 'neurosis' assumes that individuals are ill from the outset. Research cited by Hay and Nye (2009, p28) explains that people who are spiritually engaged or are content in their religious affiliation report a sense of well-being which would challenge Freud's assumption that they are under the influence of a mental/emotion health problem. On the contrary, Durkheim (cited in Hay and Nye, p28) explains that individuals who are religiously and spiritually engaged may be able to draw on 'tools' which can be used to aid well-being and resilience. These tools may well be psychological but positioned agentially through an understanding of the spiritual as an influential marker to engage in self-analysis (Culliford, 2011). Episodes of 'effervescence' which individuals report, rather than being part of a group context, are in the main reported as being

something which religious and spiritual people experience as a solitary encounter (Pickering, 2009). This would seem to challenge the assertion which Durkheim makes. That being said, Durkheim posited this idea well before the current 'spiritual' period in which these reports were made. One possible element of the rise in individuals reporting about their spirituality or willing to engage in discussions about it is the rise in spiritual awareness and the decline of spirituality being assumed to be part of a greater institutionalised religious traditions (Hay and Nye, 2006, pp 19-30).

### Spirituality and Work

### **Teaching as Vocation**

Within Education discourse there is a well-established but contested view that teaching can be conceptualised as a vocation. The understanding of vocation varies depending on the worldview of the educator but some definitions point towards its Christian conceptualization: 'Vocation is the thing which makes the heart sing' (Cooling, 2008, p5), 'Finding fulfilment in our work occurs if the particular tasks of the job fit our skills and competence' (Palmer, 2003, p15). Vocation and the understanding of it places an imperative on the individual to understand themselves and their job in order to find their path (Cooling, 2008, p6).

All of these definitions build on the assumption that one's vocation within the teaching profession in particular is a dynamic process and one which envisages an awareness and acknowledgement of one's personal and professional circumstance with a view to living out what is held to be of supreme importance to the individual, in the case of Christian educators the religious faith. To illustrate this point Mark Chater carried out a study of Christian educators who were both starting out on their careers as well as well-established teachers within their profession and sought to examine how both sets of educators understood their vocations. One of the differences which was noted was that early career educators conceptualized their vocation as being embedded in their faith and values. No examples were given as to how the early career educators based their concepts of vocation within any kind of educative practice. Established career educators expressed opinions which were based almost entirely on aspects of their professional practice rather than

conceptual ideas (Chater, 2005). Issues such as working 'with' or 'alongside children rather than 'teaching' them from a position of authority were not present in the research or the call to 'serve' through a sense of vocation was something again expressed by early career educators rather than those whose careers were established.

Professional practice set within a framework of faith of belief manifests itself in an educator's sense of vocation. Within the Christian tradition this is seen as the call to transform society 'Work becomes vocation when we see it as a means for contributing to the transformation of society in ways that build the Kingdom of God' (Cooling 2008, p8). This definition is useful in that it sets apart those who see their vocation as an evangelising process aside from those who do not, whether they are of any other faith or none. Where the ideal of the Christian vocation as illustrated above is challenged is in the current landscape of secularization of education. Established teachers have had to develop their sense of vocation to accommodate the gradual shift of secularisation within the management systems of their schools. Teaching is now firmly established as an outward/professional activity as opposed to an inward/spiritual one (Chater, 2005, p255). To articulate how one's faith impacts on one's conceptualization of their profession or the philosophy of their practice is to risk blurring the lines of the personal and private spheres. Alongside of the professional and private debate in regards to how one's faith manifests itself within the professional realm, is the possibility of faith and religion as being problematic in that it is not something that is quantifiable or easily placed within other aspects of education. This separation of the rational academic disciplines, from the irrational spiritual/religious perpetuates the idea that religion and belief is illogical and an idiosyncratic aspect of some individuals (Cooling, 2008, p3). As such being able to 'manage' professionals who articulate religious/faith beliefs challenges the managerial process and the secularisation of education. De Klerk-Luttig (2008, p505) also regards this as being the case in South African teachers' experiences in schools. Spirituality in this context is understood to be firmly outside of the professional sphere and teaching outside of a spiritual position is technicist or performative in nature.

A one dimensional view of the metaphysical is a limited view which hampers a full appreciation of the spiritual impulse. Roy Bhaskar noted a similar process through what he termed 'Transformative praxis or creative work' (Bhaskar, 2016). In it he posited that through an engagement with the ineffable through one's work or profession that one can see the development from a two-dimensional view of reality towards a multidimensional

view of reality which presupposes an objective but incomprehensible ultimate reality. For Bhaskar this ultimate reality is grounded in the divine. This position challenges the secularization and performativity culture within educational settings. Finding a space where practitioners can articulate internally their spirituality and values they hold is held in tension with professional standards and norms.

One area where faith and belief is of prime importance within the education system is that of faith schools. The Catholic tradition has placed great importance on the desire for teachers within their schools to be of the Catholic faith, be practising and have a desire to foster the faith in others (Catholic Education Service, 2014). Accommodating these aspirations within the current postmodern climate has posed challenges as well as opportunities. Teachers now entering into posts within Catholic schools in Canada for example are not assumed to be familiar with the philosophy of the Catholic school or tradition they are entering into, regardless of if they are Catholic or not. A process of familiarisation with Catholic philosophy of Education and an awareness of the particular aspirations of Catholic schools is undertaken through a process of group work and the assistance of a mentor. All beliefs are seen as a resource and something from which to draw on and a move away from conformity and towards open forum. This has been established in reaction to the acknowledgement of the need for individuals to have their voices heard rather than a top-down managerial process of induction. As such an articulation of the value each individual educator places on his/her faith is encouraged and seen as a positive contribution to the school's staff (Shields, 2008).

The sense of vocation when challenged within the realm of a secular context poses challenges which teachers of a faith perspective might find challenging. The expected separation of faith and professionalism places a dichotomous tension which teachers of a non-faith perspective may be unfamiliar with. The change from subjective vocation towards a rooted professionalism is often traumatic for teachers as they move away from their initial sense of self through their career paths. Chater (2005, p255) noted that early career teachers as well as teachers established within their profession felt oppressed when they felt they needed to de-emphasize the spiritual aspect of personhood as well as the role the spiritual in the transformative process. It could also be considered that teachers without a formal belief structure could feel similar tensions when deep rooted values and/or

philosophies are opposed to the teaching context which they are part of. What could be argued however is that the role of faith and the transcendent may place an imperative on the role of the believer where this may be negotiated for the non-believer.

The encroachment of managerial structures on the philosophy and beliefs of educators is well documented but where faith and religion diverge from this narrative is the sense of personal compromise on a deeper level. The ways in which the secular managerial culture within many mainstream schools, and in some sense faith schools, places teachers at an intersection which forces a separation of belief structures from professional identity. The lack of agency resulting from this diminishes the freedom of individuals to express aspects of their personhood which could benefit their role as teachers. Fear of mistakes and accountability further hampers the explicit expression of vocation for many and asserts itself in a lowering of experimentation and morale (Chater, 2005, pp254-255). However, it is evident that within these negotiated spheres there is the opportunity for creative ways of positioning oneself to practice teaching in a way which is professional but authentic to deeply held views and beliefs. O'Broin and Palmer (2010) and Palmer (2003) provide examples of this by drawing on ways in which teachers have negotiated the expression of their personal or spiritual selves as part of their professional practice. Doing so harmonised the personal with the professional from a perspectival position without compromising the experience or emerging values of the children being worked with.

## **Spirituality At Work**

Acknowledging and valuing the roles that religion, faith and spirituality play in the lives of individuals, rather than assuming a separation between the professional and the spiritual has led to movements within the corporate sector encouraging individuals to foster a sense of the numinous. The Spirituality at Work (SAW) movement is an international approach to facilitating the acknowledgement, expression and understanding of the role that spirituality plays in the lives of individuals and how this impacts on their work. SAW was initially an American response to the assumed fragmentation of communities and the concern that individuals sought to gain deeper meaning from their work in lieu of, or alongside of the practise of formal religion. SAW does not comprise of one consistent approach or model but it made up of a multitude of understandings as to how individual's spirituality and understanding can be facilitated in the workplace (Ashmos and Duchon,

2000). Approaches have included the formal recognition that prayer and meditation practices can be facilitated at work such as the introduction of yoga and relaxation techniques to managers and general workers. This is with the aspiration of enhancing the well-being of individuals with the assumption that this will have a positive impact on morale and productivity. One of the difficulties that the SAW movement has encountered is the multitude of ways in which spirituality can be understood and defined, not only within one culture such as a North American understanding but also when an understanding of spirituality is sought across cultural and international communities. Developing this further Hudson (2013, p29) asserts that a paradox within the SAW model is made apparent when a definition of spirituality is arrived at, by a company or workforce and that this will necessarily include and embrace some groups of individuals but is likely to exclude other understandings which other members of the workforce may hold. As such the aspiration of SAW models necessarily creates 'in and out' groups.

Arising out of a dominant Protestant Christian narrative in the United States SAW models in the USA in particular have emphasised the positive effect work has in the lives of individuals. Good work is seen as a contributory factor to well-being (Richmond, 2012). Assisting individuals in expressing aspects of their spiritual identity through their work is assumed will lead to a sense of contentedness which will not only benefit the individual but will have secondary positive effects such as higher staff morale and better engagement with work. One way of providing meaningful work is to provide a context where the individual sees that their work is meaningful to society as a whole (Hudson, 2014, p33).

Parallels between the SAW movement and how this might be applied to the teaching profession in contemporary England can be found in the context in which the SAW movement arose in late 20th and early 21st century working practices. Working practises which may have led to people spending more of their time engaged in work (whether that is in their place of work or working at home), is acknowledged as providing a dominant social identity. As such relationships and conditions at work affect individuals holistically. In the corporate context, SAW workplaces were observed as undergoing periods of reductions in staff while increasing workload on individuals leading to high turnover of staff and places of work being interpreted as places of pressure and fear (Geh and Tan, 2009, p288). Similar observations have been made by various commentators within the teaching profession. Heavy workload, poor morale and high turnover of teachers have all been noted as contributory factors to poor working conditions for teachers and under

performance for pupils (TES, 2015).

When work was seen to be giving rise to senses of alienation and frustration, the SAW model was aimed at attending to the needs of individual workers and specifically the spiritual drive and needs of individuals, that a sense of positive acknowledgement of the individual's contribution could be expressed. Alongside this, through a sense of being valued, it was hoped that the contribution of each individual to raising morale would have an overall effect of bringing together individuals to form a sense of community in the workplace.

A possible negative aspect of the SAW model is that it can be understood as a managerial response to improve productivity, albeit with positive implications for individuals. While managers seek to improve the personal welfare of their workers through an awareness and sympathy to key aspects of personhood, such as spirituality, providing them with the cultural and contextual artefacts, spaces and activities for these could be understood as a business strategy rather than an act of altruism. The goal being the end product rather than the spiritual health of their workers (Geh and Tan, 2009, p295). Alongside this there is no acknowledgement of the complexity that is involved in concepts of spirituality, expressions of this and how these are understood by individuals who may be operating in a multicultural and multi-faith context. Developing a relationship with self-other or self-other-transcendent takes time and cannot be understood in the same way that corporate strategy or managerialism. Factors such as time, on-going maturity and the personal/spiritual understanding of the individual may not be best nurtured in the arena of the workplace (Ashmos and Duchon, 2000, p38).

One of the founding principles of SAW is that it would bring meaning and purpose to a person's work. A central tenet of the SAW model is that meaning and purpose will be arrived at by cultivating a sense of agency and opportunities to be creative through the act of working. One of the founding principles of SAW is that it would bring meaning and purpose to a person's work. A central tenet of the SAW model is that meaning and purpose will be arrived at by cultivating a sense of agency and opportunities to be creative through the act of working. Through innovative ways of engaging in a SAW model, each professional is encouraged to engage in a meaning-making process where their spiritual aspect is nourished through the way in which they contextualise their work as contributing to something beyond the self. Selfless giving of oneself or the aspiration to lessen

hierarchy and move towards a partnership or mentoring model is one of the ways in which the vocation of teaching might be expressed (Bennett 2015 and Johnson, 2003). This can be observed in the middle-ground between vocation and mentoring, where one's call to work is placed alongside that of a perspective towards the equality of other. Employees (as conceptualized in the SAW model) are encouraged to be involved in work which brings meaning to their lives. Work is not understood in terms of providing the means to live but as a way of engaging with Other and others. Encouraging creative responses to this is of prime importance to SAW models worldwide (Ashmos and Duchon, 2000).

## **The Creative Impulse**

The ability for teachers working in primary schools in the English system to exercise creativity in ways similar to those expounded by the SAW are constrained in part due to professional teaching standards, (Department for Education, 2011) which all teachers must adhere to and the lack of flexibility in choosing what and how to teach by the National Curriculum 2013 (Department for Education, 2013) which sets out the programme of learning to be undertaken in all state primary schools (Department for Education, 2013). Policies such as these remove from teachers the hope of having more agency over their working practises as their professional, pedagogical and subject choices are curtailed in regards to professional freedom in the classroom. However, the ability to be creative may involve a broader consideration of how creativity is defined and conceptualized and the appropriate context available to teachers in order for creativity to be exercised.

The project to understand how creativity could affect learning in particular underwent a dramatic period of investigation from the 1970s onwards (Collard and Looney, 2014, p349). Scales were developed with the hope of understanding the ability to problem solve in individuals. From the 1980s four attributes were identified which indicated an individual's capacity to be creative: Openness to experiences, effort and persistence, self-efficacy and active participation in social networks. It was noted that individuals who were exposed to environments or professions which were understood to be creative or which valued collaborative activities were more likely to have a greater ability to think and respond creatively to problems (Collard and Looney, 2014). Creative approaches to pedagogy were explored to examine ways in which teachers might approach the teaching and development of pupils who had difficulty reading due to language issues between the

home and school environment. Teachers were paired with pupils and explored sounds in the local environment, wrote down how these sounds might be represented and then found similar sounds. Teachers encouraged pupils to make connections between differing environments and objects as well as their corresponding written representations (Collard and Looney, 2014, p352). One could argue that arising out of this project is an awareness of the necessity for teacher's individual agency to be exercised and provided with opportunities to collaborate and explore with other professionals. Collaborative partnerships are essential to the creative development of pupils and teachers, it is the interpersonal and relational aspect that seems to allow individuals to feel comfortable and safe to explore responses to dilemmas. Teachers involved in projects similar to the above example all noted that they felt there was an improvement to their teaching practice (Collard and Looney, 2014). No agreed definition in regards to creativity was arrived at during and subsequent to these studies but agreement was made in that the features of creativity or what it meant to be creative could be observed while suspending the search for an all-encompassing definition. Since then there has been a move away from this conceptualization of the products of creative endeavours and a move towards an understanding of how to nurture creativity on a personal level (Craft et al, 2008, p2).

Rather than seeking to find ways in which creativity can help the professional educator express themselves more freely in their practice, or to find an outlet for elements of the personal-professional identity to become blurred through individualised approaches, the 'Creativity' movement in Education is heavily focused on 'outcomes' for pupils in the guise of 'How to' literature for teachers (Desailly, 2012). The philosophy behind this movement closely parallels the contextual constraints placed on teachers mentioned earlier. While they provide strategies for teachers to become more creative in their activities in the classroom or how to foster creative approaches for their pupils, they are not intended to assist the practitioner in the exploration of his/her creativity and what this might mean to their personal or spiritual sensibilities.

It is in this contested arena of how creativity is conceptualized that creativity in education and creativity in relation to SAW depart. SAW sees creativity as a way in which individuals express their agency and at a deeper level understands creativity as an essential aspect to an individual feeling 'whole' through outward expression. This in turn influences how the individual feels about themselves and influences their personal-spiritual-professional well-being with the overall aim of making workers more content. Creativity in

relation to education seeks to foster creativity in pupils by providing teachers with tools to aid this important aspect of children's development. It in no way aims to make teachers themselves more creative but highlights areas and techniques which can foster it in others. As such it could be argued that there is little opportunity for teachers to be fully immersed as creative agents in their own work through this educational approach, as the goal is outcome rather than process.

The area where these two fields seem to come together is in the area of 'Flow' (Csikszentmihalyi, 2002). Flow is understood to be a complete immersion in an activity when one is absorbed in the process to carrying out or producing an activity. Where teachers are fully immersed in the work of aiding pupils with their learning through being fully agential in the planning and teaching process, it can be understood that they are in the midst of 'Flow'.

### **Creativity in Flow**

Mihalyi Csikszmentmihalyi terms flow 'Joy, creativity, the experience of total involvement with life, I call Flow' (Csikszmentmihalyi, 2002, p xi and 2006). Examining the experience of creativity and how instances and processes of being creative manifest themselves in the act of teaching, gives rise to the search for specific examples or narrative accounts from practitioners on which they recount moments of creativity during practise. As outlined earlier, arriving at an agreed definition of what it means to be creative or a generic understanding of 'Creativity' in regards to human endeavour is fraught with difficulty because of the numerous ways and contexts in which humans exercise creativity. One area where narratives are plentiful is in the area of 'Flow' which has been an aspect of research within positive psychology and seeks to note and understand how creativity is experienced across a variety of activities and contexts. Flow, in is its simplest terms, is the act of being absorbed in an activity to such an extent that deliberate and conscious decision making gives way to personal expression, whether that is part of a group or during an individual activity (Csikszmentmihalyi, 2013).

An important element of the concept of Flow is that each individual, in order to reach a sense of Flow during the creative process, must have a strong element of agency in their work. This sense of agency should ideally form the basis for the initial entry into the activity or profession. There are no right and wrong methods outlined but one illustration which Csikszmentmihalyi gives is that of a surgeon who elects to do routine operations on

an area they are specialist in for their entire career and who finds this work unchallenging but rewarding as opposed to a surgeon who specializes in an area of surgery but who challenges themselves through variety, experimentation and diversity. The latter example is highlighted as the one in which Flow is most likely to occur (Emmons in Csikszmentmihalyi, 2002). This is because the latter example must draw on what the individual surgeon knows, their experience, expertise and inner resources in order to solve new problems creatively.

One predicate of this example is that the people involved must have an autotelic attitude to their work; their work must provide meaning and be of contributory good (however each individual defines that). The autotelic disposition, coupled with areas which the individual, alongside of their superiors, identify areas of work where agency, familiarity and ownership all contribute to the possibility of flow being realised. Where individuals were engaged in work where they felt Flow occurred they identified feelings of strength, creativity, activity, concentration and motivation (Csikszmentmihalyi, 2002, p 158).

In relation to how this might impact on teaching, one area which should be highlighted is that of agency and an ability to find new and innovative ways to express one's professional capabilities. This is quite different to certain personality types being more likely to be creative and innovative, 'Creativity is exhibited when people have an element of engagement or curiosity about the process to task' (Csikszmentmihalyi, 2013, p52). While this may be the case for many teachers, the constraints through standardisation of pedagogic approach and set curriculum might point towards teaching being likened to the surgeon who is engaged in routines which are familiar and unchanging. The professional's ability to express themselves as individuals with set skills and attributes is less likely, as the environment is not conducive to the creative or possibility of Flow being encountered on a regular basis.

In contrast to this, the domain in which people are engaged in, may give rise to Flow being encountered if people are exposed to domains where learning and stimulation are important. As such, it could be posited that schools are an ideal place for creative teachers to experience Flow. If teachers within schools are encouraged to identify their own skills and talents and find ways of exploring these in the field of teaching, this may bring about opportunities to be creative and innovative in context specific circumstances. Again, this negates one personality type being better disposed to creativity, as it is acknowledged in

the Flow literature that individuals who recognise their ideal working environment and arrangements (however diverse) can express creativity in the deepest way. Individuals who like deadlines and strict parameters are as likely to be creative as individuals who work better in open and ill-defined parameters, if that is their natural working disposition (Csikszmentmihalyi, 2013, pp53-79).

Where Flow has been noted to occur in individual's working practices is where clear goals are identified every step of the way. That is to say that in order to achieve something great a framework of smaller, easily achievable goals is set out and adhered to between individuals and managers. Immediate feedback is also a feature. Feedback often takes the form of mentoring from a knowledgeable other and is conceptualized as an observer providing another perspective from which the individual concerned can assess their work. Through this type of feedback, it is assumed that fear of feedback is lessened, which assists the individual in continuing the cycle of exploration and experimentation along the journey from lesser to greater goals (Csikszmentmihalyi, 2013, pp110-111). The conditions of Flow only occurs where and when there is clarity between individuals and goals.

#### **Summary**

Exploring the development of Religious Education and SMSC in the State Primary phase foregrounds many of the issues which has led to the confusion about what the role of RE and SMSC is in relation to children's learning and educator's practice. The history of these two subjects are inextricably linked and to a large extent enmeshed in one another. The result of which is a misunderstanding of the remit of these subjects and what this means for educators with special regard to spiritual development and an understanding of the spiritual. The diversity of conceptions of what Spirituality and the Spiritual component of personhood does in some ways assist in understanding the complexity of the situation. Alongside of this it also alludes to possibilities where teaching and learning can be enhanced through an awareness of how one's spirituality (however defined) seeks to make connection with the 'other'. This creative drive to make connections is made-up of and shared between spirituality and creativity in general. Creativity as an expression of selfhood and agency has the possibility to provide opportunities for self-actualisation and the enhancement of self and professional practice. Within Initial Teacher Education and Early Career Teaching support programmes a need arises for an appropriate forum from

which the religio-spiritual aspect of personhood and the history and context of religion and spirituality in our schools is explored. As such, the relegation of the spiritual and religious components of identity can be repositioned from an assumed irrationality or cultural reminiscence may be readdressed or harnessed in a positive and affirming manner. In doing so, where moments of profundity arise through the connection with other, positive change may be facilitated which leads to growth and development.

### Chapter 3

## **Methodology- Philosophical Underpinnings**

### Introduction

Research examining Spirituality has most often been found within a realist framework and within an Interpretive paradigm (Mueller 2012, Eatough, 2007). Spirituality and the various ways it is conceptualized within religious traditions and from personal narratives presents data, that could be argued, is best suited to idiographic, qualitative research methods. As such Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) has been chosen to examine the various ways in which spirituality is conceptualized by a small number of teachers as it is appropriate to the gathering of personal narratives from participants which are homogenous in the phenomenon under investigation (Willig, 2009). IPA, within a qualitative framework, readily acknowledges and foregrounds the role of the researcher in the interpretative process. Coding and interpretive devices form part of the methodology which privileges the accounts of the participants whilst also acknowledging the role the researcher has in interpreting and presenting data emerging out of those accounts in a narrative way (Smith et al 2009). It is hoped that by adopting IPA to engage with teaching professionals, to understand how they conceptualize their spirituality and how this affects, if at all, their professional practice, it will illuminate an area of study which has been hitherto neglected in education. The following chapter justifies the use of IPA as a research paradigm, method of data collection and as a framework for robust and rigorous analysis. Where there are areas in which IPA has limitations, these have been identified and explanations given for how these issues have been resolved or appropriate alternative practical or theoretical considerations enacted.

### **Epistemological Position of the Research**

Ontological and Epistemological assumptions are addressed through both Qualitative and Quantitative research methodologies. Qualitative and Quantitative methodologies are broad approaches which seek to investigate and understand a wide variety of types of data and phenomenon and as such have come to form distinct research traditions and paradigms. Both methodologies contain a wide variety of approaches and methodologies within each broad approach. Qualitative and Quantitative approaches are held to assume

different and somewhat adversarial philosophical positions when answering questions about the nature of reality and how this is presented in research. Qualitative data (in its discreet form) is assumed to offer greater insight into the ways in which personal accounts are to be investigated and understood. This is because qualitative methodologies are concerned with how individuals live and understand their experiences (Willig, 2009, p8).

Qualitative methods seek to understand individuals' lived experiences, as such their approaches commonly take small scale first-hand accounts which acknowledges to greater or lesser extents (appropriate to each method used) the role of the researcher in the gathering and interpretive process. As individual teacher's accounts are the focus of this project Quantitative methods were taken to be an inappropriate methodology to adopt. The main methods for data collection commonly adopted in Quantitative research such as social surveys, the use of statistics, structured observation and content analysis, would not have been appropriate to an idiographic research model as the focus within these data collection methods is on large scale sampling and interpretation through generalization. The accounts arising out of these processes of collection would not accurately convey the individual perspectives of the participants taking part in them and would have (through their use of large scale sampling) been general and nomothetic in their findings rather than presenting the actual lived accounts of the participant (Silverman, 2000). Furthermore, Quantitative research frequently takes a position of a scientific research method. As such it implies that the process and results arising out of such research is value free and is bound up in the concept of an objective reality, 'The researcher is not swayed by an emotional attachment to an issue, commitment or cause' (Newby, 2014, p48). The naive realism which is occasionally found within Quantitative research approaches does not acknowledge or seek to understand the possibility of truth being negotiated by the participant (Burr, 2003). Quantitative researchers when adopting an approach which seeks to understand phenomenon by taking a large sample of accounts and presenting the findings through a general description of those findings, fail to acknowledge the multiple ways in which individuals make sense of their experiences and realities. 'Quantitative researcher ignores the differences between the natural and social world by failing to understand the meanings that are brought to social life' (Silverman, 2000, pp4-5). Using research methods, such as those involved in Quantitative approaches, would be inappropriate to use in seeking to understand the ways in which individual teachers negotiate the meanings they bring to their understanding of spirituality and how these

meanings may be contextualized and acted out in the social world of their teaching practice. The perspectival accounts of these negotiations would not be presented in a Quantitative approach as individualized accounts are not conducive to generalized findings which point towards trends and patterns of opinion and/or behaviour.

Qualitative researchers when examining the accounts of how individuals present and negotiate meanings in their lived experience acknowledge that individual's present multiple truths in their narratives (Crossan, 2003). As such, within Qualitative research it is acknowledged that there are multiple perspectives on what is 'true' when describing a particular phenomenon (Ferber, 2006). How Qualitative researchers make sense of and present findings which examine a single phenomenon from the multiple perspectives of the participants involved, embrace the notion that truth is negotiated and ascribe to the concept that people can hold valid and yet different truth claims. The Qualitative researcher seeks to make sense of these different truth claims and their accounts (Newby, 2014, p48).

The process in which a researcher interprets the various ways in which teachers understand and express their spirituality in a professional context must necessarily involve themselves explicitly in the process of reflection and interpretation. The researcher within Qualitative methodological approaches must foreground their role in the interpretative process. Qualitative approaches form a spectrum of relativist stances to realist (Shipway, 2011). Within IPA a realist stance is taken in that the objective reality of the phenomenon under investigation is recognized whilst acknowledging the perspectival positions of the participants when narrating their accounts. The relativist stance asserts that the material gathered presents knowledge of pure experience while the interpretivist position of the researcher seeks to understand these claims through an interaction with the participant's accounts whilst relying on devices of reflection and interpretation (Willig, 2009).

### Objectivity, Reliability and Validity

Reliability and validity are central to both qualitative and quantitative research methods and methodologies. How both methods of data collection and the methodologies conceptualize and understand the terms are distinct and highlight the various ways that the data collection process is designed, carried out and understood. Reliability and validity connect measures to social constructs, that is to say they give solidity to the constructs we

conceptualize by verifying the ways in which processes and findings are scrutinized and understood both by the researcher and independent of the researcher (Neuman, 2011). Reliability and validity are related to desired and desirable aspects of analysis and interpretation.

Certain questions and research studies are more easily measured using data collection and verification methods which are empirically based. That is to say, using methods which quantify and categorises aspects of social interaction and conceptualization. Types of question however, which seek to understand values and social constructs are not as suited to these types of analysis and require research methods which are based on interpreting what people understand by particular phenomenon or values which are directly significant to them (Madhill et al, 2000).

Within quantitative research, reliability is broken down into three categories: Stability Reliability, Representative Reliability and Equivalence Reliability. An explanation of all three understandings should be undertaken to highlight why the conceptualization of Reliability from a quantitative stance would be inappropriate to the study of how individuals understand an element as personal as spirituality.

Stability Reliability is the measure of reliability over time. The problem with using this form of reliability as a measure is that within a qualitative methodology such as IPA participants do not remain static in their personal or professional lives. Alongside this, how participants reflect on themselves and understand themselves in relation to spirituality will necessarily change over time as spirituality is a relational construct and relies on an individual's interaction and reflection of it.

Representative Reliability focuses on subgroups of a population, while IPA studies seek to understand small groups of individuals and how they understand a phenomenon from a personal perspective, this conceptualization of reliability does not meet this requirement and exceeds the scope an IPA study (Smith et al, 2009).

Equivalence Reliability uses several tools and/or questions which examines the same phenomenon from multiple examples. As such this points towards ways in which IPA coding takes place. Within quantitative concepts of Equivalence Reliability the assumption that this will lead to a phenomenon being observed from multiple perspectives again exceeds the expectation of how small groups of individuals might express an individual

understanding of a shared phenomenon (Neuman, 2011, pp217-212).

Validity within quantitative and qualitative methodologies share parallels and seeks to measure 'how well an empirical indicator and the conceptual definition of the construct of that indicator is supposed to 'fit' together' (Neuman, 2011, p211). In other words, once the phenomenon for study has been defined and conceptualized, does the tools used for verifying it provide a consistent result? Again the concept of Validity, within quantitative methodologies, can be further broken down into Face Validity, Content Validity and Construct Validity.

Face Validity simply means that 'on the face of it' does the content and method of measurement show that the results are valid. Construct Validity is a type of measurement which uses multiple indicators to illustrate the trustworthiness of the results; this again would not lend itself to an idiographic analysis as it imposes a set of criteria on individuals from which they are measured by a researcher. Content Validity is a type of measurement validity which requires that a measure represent all aspects of the conceptual definition or the construct; this does not apply well to how individuals understand a relational and dynamic phenomenon such as spirituality as it is by its nature individualistic and does not translate easily across small groups of participants, however homogenous (Neuman, 2011, Silverman, 2000).

Within qualitative research methods there is a general acknowledgement of the principles mentioned above but there is an explicit acknowledgement that the type of phenomenon and fields studied by qualitative researchers is diverse and is complicated in that it involves and focuses upon individual people, their personalities and their stories. As such it acknowledges the multiple ways that things can be measured and that rather than this being 'unreliable and invalid' points towards the multiple facets that can be explored provided that the individual research approach is consistent. 'Validity means truthfulness' in qualitative studies we are more interested in achieving authenticity than realising a single version of 'Truth'. Authenticity means offering a fair, honest and balanced account of social life from the viewpoint of the people who live it every day' (Neuman, 2011, p214). However, it must be highlighted that this does not mean that quantitative studies do not represent 'truth' for some individuals. What is different is that qualitative researchers seek to do this through focusing on individual accounts rather than seek to represent a broad spectrum of data from a wide range of participants which may 'accurately' describe

the views, values and positions an individual might coincidentally hold. Reliability and Validity are usually complimentary to one another but validity can remain as we delve deep into a subjective account of some phenomenon from the perspective of one participant, particularly when they drive the process. If this approach is applied to them then the reliability falters but their accounts of the phenomenon will still be valid to them. Methodologies such as IPA seek to negotiate the tension between rigorous data collection and interpretation methods and the privileging of the individual in giving their account (Smith and Eatough in Lyons and Coyle 2007).

According to Atkins and Wallace (2012, p54) it is a mystery why so many educational researchers seek to be as 'scientific' in their methods as qualitative researchers. Issues around reliability should give way to being a trustworthy commitment to authenticity as this is where the permutations and subjectiveness appears in social constructs. To be completely objective in social research is impossible and researchers being part of the process is a necessary and not undesirable position to take. However, impartiality is necessary as one must be able to set back from the data in order to make a clear an unbiased representation of the participants' accounts.

## IPA and other Methodologies

IPA is a method of Interpretative Phenomenology which acknowledges that the exploration of how someone understands and describes their world implicates the researcher in the process of interpretation (Willig, 2009, p57). The ways in which an individual conceptualizes aspects of their reality and articulate these, places the researcher at the intersection of thought and language, both their own and that or the participant. As such, language as it is being expressed through speech, places demands on a researcher using IPA which sets IPA apart from other qualitative methodologies which also see language as central to the research process (Holloway and Jefferson, 2002).

Discourse Analysis (DA) is one such methodology which places language as central to the research process. DA as a method takes many forms but is largely concerned with the study of language as a social process and how language reflects interactions and conceptions (Arthur et al, 2012). The ways in which language is used in order to achieve something is one of the aspects which DA focuses on. It does this by examining language

in context, such as teacher-pupil talk or talk which takes places in professional settings. Examining transcripts taken from these contexts is the main method of analysis in DA. Methods of Discourse Analysis examines texts away from participants. By doing so it is hoped that the text will give rise to new information about the participant and their context. By examining 'Naturalistic Talk' contained in the text away from participants it is assumed that influencing the participant's or researcher's impact on the interpretation of the material is negated (Lyons and Coyle, 2007, p99).

The role of the researcher/interpreter in IPA is foregrounded to a greater extent than in DA methods of research. As such the task of reflexivity in IPA where the researcher engages in an on-going process of analysis and reflection of the text (as co-constructed with the participant) is not present in DA. The centrality of iterative interpretation of individual's accounts rather than a textual analysis of content (without the imperative of reflection) is understood by the researcher to be advantageous when examining phenomenon which may not be limited to utilitarian interactions such as those foregrounded in Discourse Analysis.

### Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) and Theoretical Underpinnings

Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis 'IPA is a qualitative research approach committed to the examination of how people make sense of their major life experiences' (Smith et al 2009, p1). Understanding how people make sense of their lived world and how these understandings are articulated and conceptualized are central to the IPA project. The epistemological framework and method arising out of it which IPA is constructed upon draws on the philosophical concepts of Phenomenology, Hermeneutics and Idiography and will be examined further in this section.

The ideas put forward by Edmund Husserl (1859-1938) in regards to the then new philosophical movement of Phenomenology heavily influences IPA methodology. Husserl espoused the idea that in order for things to be understood, one must step outside of one's 'Natural Attitude' and examine phenomenon without recourse to previously held conceptions or bias (Smith et al, 2009, p12). By doing so one could observe the phenomenon in new ways, ways in which commonly held beliefs or assumptions may not influence the observation of the phenomenon. By immersing oneself in the phenomenon, the phenomenon's essence could be revealed (Shinebourne and Smith, 2009). By not

rushing into judgements or equating culture to phenomenon, the colour and multiple perspectives of the phenomenon could be revealed.

Whilst Husserl outlines methods of observation without recourse to bias or preconception through mental processes such as 'Bracketing Out' preconceptions. Eidetic Reduction is engaged to arrive at the essence of a phenomenon which may involve processes of 'Imaginative Variation' where multiple aspects of the same phenomenon are considered (Smith et al, 2009). Husserl does not however, according to Willig (2009), express a sequential or prescribed method of doing so. The part the researcher has to play in the phenomenological method used by Husserl in interpreting the phenomenon is not central to the process.

IPA has been accused of not having a sufficiently strong theoretical basis (Giorgi, 1997) and (Giorgi, 2008) as it places great importance on acknowledging the role of the researcher in the process of interpretation. Philosophers such as Heidegger, Merleau-Ponty and Sartre have contributed to the philosophical framework of IPA in that they place the individual as a contextual being with recourse to one's own experiences, contexts and culture (Smith, 2009). Individuals are 'Thrown in to the world' (Heidegger, 1962) and as such make sense of the world from their perspectives and tools of cognition. Attempting to comprehend phenomenon without recourse to social, contextual and cognitive resources is impossible to achieve and as such is acknowledged in the role of the researcher in IPA (Willig, 2009). The existentialist stance taken in IPA is central to the way in which phenomenon is understood to present itself to individuals and researchers. Heidegger questioned the possibility of gaining any knowledge from outside an interpretive stance, informed by the tools and processes an individual brings with them to the task at hand. This situatedness is developed further by both Merleau-Ponty and Sartre by examining how 'embodiment' necessarily informs sense of self and the process of understanding following existence (Smith et al, 2009, pp18-19).

Giorgi (2008) notes that within the phenomenological method the aim of 'bracketing out' any influences on the ways in which individuals' and their contexts are studied should be the ideal when following the approach advocated by Husserl. This Transcendental Phenomenology (to transcend basic descriptions and understandings in order to arrive at the essence of the phenomenon) should be adopted before examining more than one phenomenon within any given study. However the charge levelled by Giorgi (1997,

(Langdridge, 2007) (Kvale, 2007) 2008, 2008) that IPA does not satisfy the requirement of the phenomenological method outlined above as it places too great an emphasis on the role of the researcher in the research process is challenged by Smith et al (2009). IPA, according to Smith et al, draws on the Hermeneutic approach of Heidegger, Gadamer and Schleirermacher (Smith et al, 2009, pp21-28). While the researcher aims to immerse themselves in the accounts of the phenomenon, as expressed by participants, they necessarily draw on methods of interpretation and analysis. In order to move from one phenomenon to another one has to assume a judgement and interpretation is made. As such the assertion Giorgi makes is challenged on a theoretical and procedural basis in IPA.

Through the study of the participant's accounts of phenomenon an attitude will be assumed by the researcher which it is hoped will immerse the researcher in the participant's accounts. Adopting an attitude of openness in order to examine the phenomenon in various ways should allow for the phenomenon to present itself in ways which might otherwise have been overlooked by the researcher. It is acknowledged however, that the researcher will necessarily draw upon their existing cognitive and social resources to understand and interrogate the phenomenon but that this will be recognised and acted upon through a systematic approach of exploratory coding within IPA.

### **Phenomenology**

Phenomenology is the study of the ways in which people understand and think about lived experience. Edmund Husserl started the philosophical movement early in the twentieth century and sought to establish a way in which phenomenon could be examined, free from the self-deception of structures which people build up through their everyday existence, (Smith et al, 2009, Todres, 2007and Marcel, 1950). Husserl's concern for the way in which people link thought to something in reality (which related to that thought) Husserl termed this correlation as 'Intentionality'; people are aware of something in relation to something else. In other words, people are always conscious *of* something. How individuals

perceived aspects of their existence, was regarded by Husserl as 'Intentional' modes of thought that is to say, individuals regarded the psychical concepts of phenomenon as the phenomenon themselves. The goal of the phenomenological method was to differentiate between the mental/psychical correlations to a knowledge of the phenomenon itself free

from related conceptions. The phrase used for this was the 'Phenomenological Attitude' (Smith, 2008). The phenomenological attitude comprised of steps which assisted the researcher in 'bracketing out' preconceptions of a given phenomenon in order for the phenomenon to 'present itself'. The process of examining phenomenon through these steps is 'phenomenological reduction' which places an imperative on the researcher to redirect unreflective thought towards an immersion in the phenomenon. Through an awareness of one's own intentionality it is hoped that a phenomenological attitude can give rise to an understanding of how things present themselves and are experienced by individuals (Smith 2008).

A further development within the phenomenological movement was brought about by Martin Heidegger (1889 –1976) who challenged Husserl's proposition that phenomenon can be examined by suspending all fore-knowledge of the phenomenon under investigation. For Heidegger this was not possible as we are 'Thrown in to the world' and must rely on aspects of the world in order to make sense of it. This 'Being in the world' (Dasein) was for Heidegger, a central problem of the phenomenology as conceptualized by Husserl. Through Dasein bracketing or removing one's fore-knowledge was unattainable (Willig, 2009).

### Hermeneutics

Hermeneutics is concerned with the interpretation of texts. This next stage in how phenomenology was to develop through Heidegger, Scheleiremacher and Gadamer who sought to acknowledge that the process of understanding a phenomenon inevitable involves levels of interpretation (Smith et al, 2009). Heidegger acknowledged that individual's preconceptions or 'fore-knowledge' of a phenomenon might only become apparent in its entirety when examining a phenomenon. So, the process of 'bracketing out' as previously mentioned was problematic. By examining a phenomenon, one might be presented with a way of conceptualizing this phenomenon which was not previously known or that they were aware of. Only through a dynamic iterative process of interpretation can a phenomenon be examined. Within IPA of a 'Hermeneutic Circle' in which the researcher constantly re-examines the part and the whole in order to interpret fully the phenomenon at hand is constantly engaged. Further complexity is acknowledged in the hermeneutic process of IPA whereby a relational interpretation takes place between

researcher and participant. The 'Double Hermeneutic' manifests itself when a participant interprets their lived experience and the researcher then interprets the participant's interpretation whilst remaining aware of their own role in the interpretive process (Smith et al, 2009, pp21-28).

## **Idiography**

Idiography is concerned with the particular. With detail and depth of analysis, it is also concerned with how phenomenon is concerned by particular individuals and contexts. As such IPA uses very particular sample sets which are largely homogenous in one aspect or another. Idiography can focus on a single case in its own right or move to an examination in more general claims. Idiography does not eschew generalizations. It may talk about general themes but only in the context of specific case examples and places these cautiously. Idiography does not conflate the particular with the individual, that is to say, it looks at particular cases but does not bind these up with the individual neatly. Like the concept of Embodiment, it acknowledges the complexity involved with how an individual experiences the world through their perspectives and relationships, these give rise to an idiographic rather than an individualized view. Dasein the idea of being-in-relation-to and as such does not belong to an individual per se but is brought about by being in relation to something or other (Smith et al, 2009, p29).

#### **The Research Process**

This research is conducted to meet partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of EdD at Canterbury Christ Church University, Canterbury, Kent. An application as made to the university EdD programme in November 2011. In September of 2013 an application was made to the research degree board for commencement of the research, through a research proposal. In April 2014 approval was sought and gained through the Ethics Committee of the Faculty of Education. Recruitment letters were sent to schools known to the researcher in September and October of 2014, following the identification and selection of participants, the first interview was carried out in October of 2014, the final

## **Homogeneous participants**

IPA requires the experiences of the participants are relevant to the topic being investigated. Alongside of this, the number of participants in the study must be appropriate to the purposes and goals of the research. To ensure commitment to the study, homogeneity was sought in terms of the professional experience of the participants. For this study, participants were recruited who were primary school teachers in the East Kent area. All the participants had more than 5 years' experience as teachers. Furthermore, all the participants had a teaching qualification from England and these ranged from Bachelor's Degrees in Education to Post Graduate Certificates in Education. Whilst it was initially hoped that all of the recruits would be from non-faith (maintained) schools, two of the participants chosen for the study were currently in faith school settings.

#### **Data Collection and IPA**

Semi-structured interviews are the principal method for gathering data used in IPA. Interviews which are semi-structured allow the interviewer to respond to the different topics that the participant wishes to disclose, whilst maintaining the ability of the interviewer to explore topics directly pertinent to the study (Punch and Oancea, 2014). Smith et al. indicate that semi-structured interviews allow for data to be gathered in a flexible and collaborative way (2004). Within this data collection method, IPA methodology encourages the researcher to allow the participant to guide the course of the interview and to explore topics which they feel are relevant and of importance to them, as such interviewing within IPA is non-directive (Smith, 2009). During the interviews, the researcher attempted to create a safe and comfortable environment before the interviews took place. During interviews, questions were posed in an open-ended way so as to encourage the participant to feel free to explore the topic in ways which they felt comfortable. When asking open-ended questions the participant was allowed to recount instances and opinions that were important to them. Before, during and at the end of the interviews, the researcher made clear that the participant was free to explore any beliefs and opinions they held whether they were religious, spiritual or neither in relation to the

topic under investigation.

Within IPA there is an acknowledgement that there is 'no right number of sample size' (Smith, 2009, p51). What is of importance is that the researcher examines each participants' contribution as though it were a case study. For a study of this type it is suggested that a number between 3-6 participants would provide enough data for a thorough examination of each participant's views so as to enable the analysis to be sufficiently rich and deep. With a relatively small number of participants, it is hoped that the data will be explored in such a way as to uncover the layers of meaning in the contributions of the participants and that the small number of participants will also guard against the possibility of data rich material being overlooked as may happen in sample sizes which are larger (Smith, 2009). A further epistemological feature of IPA is the concern to maintain an ideographic commitment to the research method, in doing so larger sample sizes would not be able to address this concern. Using smaller sample sizes the focus is maintained on gaining deep interpretations from the data, rather than the danger of being overly descriptive which may be a necessity if examining a large data set.

## Interview Design and Schedule- Appendix 'Transcript 19' page 168.

Each participant was interviewed three times over the academic year. This was so to facilitate an in-depth idiographic analysis that was sufficiently rich in detail to aid the interpretative process. Alongside of this, the interviews being spaced out throughout the academic, and working year, of the participants alleviated some of the pressures in being able to attend interviews at the university and away from the participants' places of work. Each interview throughout the year was based on one of the main research questions. The main research question was then reduced down into a further 8-10 questions so that particular areas within the main area of study could be explored. The interviews were semi-structured as suggested by Smith (2009) with the first questions designed in such a way as to allow the participants to feel at ease and to explore their thoughts, opinions and recounts in a way which was comfortable for them. Throughout each phase of the interviews, the participants were made aware that they were the 'expert' in the encounter and that their contribution was of ultimate importance, as such there was no right or wrong answers, simply an exploration of their beliefs and experiences from their perspective.

Each interview schedule was used as a guide throughout the interview but not adhered to as a 'fixed' set of questions but as an interrogative prompt. Frequently, participants took the interview away from the initial topic of the interview. This was not detrimental to the data collection as the ways in which interviewees were allowed to do this provided data which was different to and often richer than might have been uncovered if the interview schedule had become too rigid. Within reason, the interviewee took the direction of the interview allowing the interviewer to be non-directive during the interview process. Where the participant struggled, techniques to aid the flow of the interview were used such as rephrasing, recounting, or summarising the participant's contributions. In such a way, the researcher used minimal interjection and as such it was hoped that the participant's contributions would be free from influence (Kvale, 1996).

### **Research Questions**

Following the literature review, over-arching questions emerged which sought to explain the links between how teachers understand and express their spirituality and how this is manifest in the workplace. These over-arching questions provided the overall theme for the three individual rounds of interviews and the questions posed to the participants. The over-arching questions could also be thought of as the objective of the interview but achieved through an interview schedule made up of component questions aimed at achieving the interview objective while taking in to account the directions the participant may choose to take during the course of the interview. The over-arching research questions were as follows:

- 1. How do individual educators within primary schools define their spirituality?
- 2. In what ways do primary school educators express their spirituality in the context of their setting?
- 3. What contextual mechanisms are there which help/hinder the spiritual expression of primary school educators?

The main research questions were drawn from topics within the literature and alongside areas which the researcher had experience in. The research questions were further broken

down into several 'thematic' questions which would act as an aid to the interview but were not fixed. This allowed the participant the freedom to explore the topic in ways which were appropriate to them. While the interview was based around interview schedule(s), (See appendix p165) questions were designed in an open way and it was hoped that in so doing the researcher did not lead the participant in a direction which may have shaped the data in a way which was not reflective of the participant's experiences. Throughout the interview, the researcher was mindful to allow the participants' time to reflect and think about their answers. Any prompts that were made were to seek clarification on a point raised by the participant or to enquire into the deeper feelings held by the participant.

#### **Ethics**

Ethical approval was sought for the research project through the Ethics Committee of Canterbury Christ Church University and prior to the recruitment of participants. Approval was sought and gained at the design stage of the research with the Ethics Committee providing advice and feedback on ethical issues which may have arisen as part of the project. Ethically conducted research seeks to maintain the welfare of the participants and researcher throughout the research process and to do so in a cyclical and iterative way; restating the purpose of the research and seeking well-being of participants at each stage of the research being undertaken. 'Ethical research is also a dynamic process, and needs to be monitored throughout the process' (Smith cited in Mueller 2012, p60).

The subject matter of religion and spirituality is an area which has the potential to cause distress to participants as these areas are assumed to be deeply emotive to participants regardless of their religious observance (Hammersley, 2012). As such, participants were given information of each stage of the research being undertaken, outlining what the interview stage would involve and an overview of the general topic which would be explored. Both before and after interviews participants were made aware that they were free to discuss any areas they wished and to avoid answering questions which they felt uncomfortable with. They were the 'experts' in the research and as such were in charge of the direction of the interview/action. Support contact numbers were given to the participants at the first stage of the interview process and were made aware of agencies they could contact if they experienced any emotional distress. This was reiterated to the participants at each stage of the interview process. After each interview participants were

debriefed and were asked how they felt about the interview, alongside of this, participants were made aware of the right to withdraw at any time alongside the maintenance of their anonymity in all forms of material gathered. Once interviews were transcribed, these were offered to the respective participants along with an audio file of the interview (Oliver, 2010).

Additionally, some issues which arise out of qualitative research which have ethical implications are: the relationship between the researcher and participant, faults in the design of the study and how the researcher subjectively interprets the data (Mueller, 2013, p60). Power dynamics were minimised as the participants in the study (as well as the researcher) viewed each other as fellow teaching professionals which maintained an element of professional familiarity and informality.

One issue which arose on several occasions which had implications for the ways in which the participants explored aspects of their spirituality, was that they very often sought agreement or shared understanding with the researcher. Initially, it was observed that this may have been due to nerves arising out of the process or simply a linguistic feature by some of the participants. However, the number of times that participants sought affirmation or agreement could have meant that the power relations or the ways in which the participants viewed the researcher was not as collegial as was first assumed. This was raised with the particular participants during debriefing but of the participants this related to, none of them recognised this as a feature of their interview. However, as this was an interpretation based on the initial impression of the interview, the reflective notes and the transcript, has noted that this could be a legitimate interpretation of the interview phenomenon.

#### **Method- Data Collection and Procedures**

### **Identification and selection of participants**

Potential participants were sought in several ways. Initially, through using school involvement with the university, head teachers of known schools were sent emails outlining the research and it was hoped that these would act as gatekeepers to interested members of staff. This proved to be unsuccessful for reasons which are unknown. The researcher then identified schools where RE and SMSC were of high calibre and who had staff which were enthusiastic about these areas of learning. Again, initial contact was made through email and these were passed on to interested staff via email. From this, 3 teachers were recruited who were interested in the research. The remaining participants were approached by the researcher as they had close links with the university through their roles as student teacher mentors in their school. These teachers were all known to the researcher in a professional capacity and some knowledge of their interest in this area due to involvement in subject leadership related to the research topic. Following initial conversations outlining the research, the participants who showed an interest in taking part were emailed an outline of the study, what it would expect of them and the mechanism to contact the researcher to discuss any concerns. Consent forms were sent out and these were discussed and signed before the initial interview for each participant took place (Appendix, p160).

#### Recruitment

Six participants were recruited from six different primary schools in the East Kent area. All were practising teachers with a minimum of five years professional experience. All of the teachers worked in primary school and only two practised in a faith school setting with the remainder working within maintained schools.

None were chosen depending on certain religio-spiritual beliefs or perspectives and the recruitment letter and follow-up conversations made clear that all beliefs and none were valid and appropriate to the study. The initial prerequisite for participants was that they were practising teachers with a minimum of five years' experience in the classroom. Out of the six participants, only one had met the minimum requirement time wise with the remaining five participants far exceeding the five year stipulation.

It was felt that if practitioners had a minimum of five years' experience this would afford them the possibility to be able to draw on a greater set of resources to explore aspects of spirituality which would not only include their own concepts of this but would also enable them to contextualise this is their professional practice. With a timeframe of practice stipulated it was hoped that there would also be sufficient time for the teachers to have formed a sense of professional identity which would reflect their values and the ways in which they felt that spirituality might inform this. Having a sufficient time in school contexts would also afford the possibility that the participants would be able to recount a variety of instances where their professional and spiritual identities might inform one another.

Out of the six participants all were female. This is not unusual when examining the demographics of teachers within primary school settings. Five of the participants were White British and one was White Irish. Two of the teachers described themselves as Catholic but non-practising, one of these teachers also teaches in a Catholic Primary School. One teacher described herself as Christian (Evangelical) and was teaching in a Church of England Primary school. Of the remaining three teachers two identified as being of no faith but acknowledged a Christian heritage. Of these three, one teacher now describes herself as Atheist and one as Christian (Pentecostal). Four of the teachers had a BA in Education with Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) and two of them held a Post Graduate Certificate in Education with QTS. All of the participants have resided in England between 10 years and from birth. The participants ranged in age from 35-50 years of age.

After the first round of interviews one participant withdrew due to personal issues. As such, her material was not used as it was felt that it would not represent the totality of her views which the project hoped to examine. The remaining five participants, Toni, Jane, Janet, Helen and Katherine (pseudonyms) all completed the project and received debriefing throughout, with the opportunity to examine their transcripts and the interpretation of them. None asked to do so.

The first interview was undertaken after the participants received, read and signed the debriefing form which outlined the overall nature of the study and explained each of the interview themes. Any concerns that the participants had were discussed and any anxiety was addressed before commencement of the interview. Participants were also made aware

of their ability to cease the interview and participation in the project at any time and also of support agencies available should they feel the need to contact them due to the possible sensitive nature of the research. After each interview, the participants were asked how they felt the interview had gone and if any issues had arisen which may have caused them anxiety (Kvale, 1996). These were discussed before participants departed. As ethical considerations are an ongoing concern (Smith, 2009) participants were consulted before and after each interview as to their well-being and any issues which were of concern were outlined and/or resolved.

All the participants were sent an overview letter which outlined the study and their involvement in it. It also contained information about the process, confidentiality and how the study was disseminated. The areas outlined were:

- detailed information on the research area and its context
- the purpose of the research
- interview format and duration
- the right to withdraw
- access to individuals information and confidentiality
- contact information

Before commencing in the project, participants were given the consent form prior to interview to read and if happy to sign and bring to the interview. They were given one copy and one was retained by the researcher (appendix page 157).

# **Participant Details**

Place of	Gender	Ethnicity	Age	Religious	Practising/	Years of
Work				Affiliation	Not	Career
					Practising	
Maintained	Female	White British	35-40	Anglican	Not	16
Maintained	Female	White British	45-50	Atheist	N/A	7
Faith	Female	White British	40-45	Catholic	Not	17
Maintained	Female	White British	30-35	Pentecostal	Practising	12
Maintained	Female	White Irish	40-45	Catholic	Not	5
Participant	Participant	Participant	Participant	Participant	Participant	Participant
Withdrew	Withdrew	Withdrew	Withdrew	Withdrew	Withdrew	Withdrew
Faith	Female	White British	40-45	Evangelical	Practising	20

#### **Interview Process**

Each of the participants received the briefing document before attending for interview. The details of the interview were outlined in the document and were further explained before the interview took place. Verbal consent was sought and any questions around consent were discussed. The researcher checked each participant to see if they understood the project or had any questions before the research took place. With any issues resolved and the process made clear, participants were invited to sign two copies of the consent form, which they received prior to the interview. The researcher also signed both copies and one copy was retained by both the researcher and the participant (Frey and Oishi, 1995).

Participants were reminded about issues around confidentiality and were assured that any materials relating to them, that might identify them or their places of work, would be anonymised. Access to any material relating to a particular participant was offered to each participant should it be requested. It was made clear that the interviews were to be recorded using a digital voice recorder and would only be accessible to the researcher. The recordings were to be transcribed and again, these would be anonymised and made available on request to the relevant participant if they wished. The right to withdraw at any time was also discussed before commencing each interview and should participants wish

to remove themselves from the research, all material would be destroyed pertaining to them (Richards and Morse, 2007).

Throughout the research project, the main area of investigation for each interview was outlined to the participant before arriving for interview. Alongside of this, transcripts of prior interviews were offered to each participant for comment or revision or to act as an aide memoir. Before each interview, the researcher re-explained how the interview format would work and that a semi-structured approach would be adopted. Each participant was made aware that they were the 'expert' in the interview and that while the interview was semi-structured they were free to explore any areas that they wished during the process. It was hoped that in this way the participants were fully involved in constructing their own narratives (Smith et al, 2009).

At no point in the interview process did any participant request access to their transcript when offered. Most participants wanted to discuss things that they had reflected on after each interview immediately before commencing a new interview. Through a collaborative process of discussion and recollection, the interviews and areas of interest were recapped before commencing the next interview in the research process.

# Reflexivity

Within interpretative methodologies a seeking to understand one's role in making sense of others' lived experience features to greater or lesser extent across methods adopted (Hunt and Sampson, 2006). IPA places great emphasis on the importance and place that reflexivity has in understanding one's own perspective and how this can influence the interpretation of data (Smith et al, 2009). Reflection is an ongoing and dynamic process throughout IPA but has a set place in the method of collecting and interpreting information. It has been suggested that the first step in interpreting new data is to immediately reflect on how the new information has impacted, challenged or reaffirmed your own opinions and values. Through an in-depth engagement with self-criticality and a distancing of one from self, it is hoped that features such as bias, prejudice and assumptions can be identified and acknowledged as possible factors which may affect the reading of data. 'Acknowledging one's position and characteristics may be of benefit to the reader in their observations in the analysis; the presentation of some appropriate

reflections on their role in the dynamic process of analysis is also helpful, particularly where it might have a significant impact on the final account' (Mueller, 2012, p65). IPA explicitly acknowledges the role of reflexivity in making sense of lived experience. As such it is assumed that researchers using IPA engage in the reflective process in order to understand the ways in which self affects the interpretative process; as such, an acknowledgement of the researcher's role in interpreting data is made prior to any analysis taking place (Hefferon and Gil-Rodriguez, 2014 and O'Brien et al, 1999).

# **Features of Reflexivity**

Reflexivity has no one preferred method but occupies a multiplicity of approaches, however all are concerned with 'how the researcher and the intersubjective elements impact on and transform research' (Finlay and Gough, 2003, p4). It is a process of deep reflection in which it is hoped that the researcher is lead to an awareness of 'other' whether that 'other' is the subject of their research or an active analysis of self as 'other'. 'It involves creating an internal space, distancing ourselves from ourselves, as it were, so that we are both 'inside' and 'outside' of ourselves simultaneously...opening ourselves up to the experience of 'self as other' whilst also retaining a grounding in our familiar sense of self' (Hunt and Sampson, 2006, p5).

Throughout the process, an uncovering and an awareness of our social, emotional, past and present selves helps to shed light on the ways in which the stories of others are understood by the researcher. Acknowledging areas of empathy and common ground are important in that the possibility of shared understanding is made evident when both parties share commonalities (Findlay and Gough, 2003). In contrast to this, where there is ambiguity or dissonance between the researcher and the researched, feelings which are less positive should be acknowledged as they are likely to impact on the observations in ways which if unacknowledged, increase the possibility of the interpretation being more heavily influenced by the researcher's reading of the research than the message portrayed by the participant (Merrill and West, 2009).

As part of the research process, the researcher undertook reflection exercises immediately after and in the following days of each interview. These exercises consisted of a written account of the initial thoughts and reactions to the interviews and to act as an aide memoir

to facilitate the deeper reflection exercise later on. Some interviews provoked stronger thoughts and reactions than others but all were analysed in the same way.

- Initial note taking immediately after the interview.
- Listening and re-listening to the interview within two/three days of recording.
- Writing a reflective account of the ways in which the recorded material and interview aroused thoughts and feelings in the researcher.

The reflective diary was to be used when analysing transcripts of interviews so as to keep the researcher aware of the possibility of misinterpreting what the interviewee had expressed through the researcher's own bias. What follows is an example of a reflective diary for one of the interviews which posed some challenges for the researcher as it both challenged and affirmed deeply held convictions which left unacknowledged or examined could have adversely affected the interpretation.

(See Reflective Exercise 4 in Appendix p160)

### Chapter 4

## **Findings**

The chapter which immediately follows introduces us to the superordinate themes which have emerged out of detailed analysis of the participants' accounts. The superordinate themes emerged after many instances of listening to the recorded interviews and initially noting down the researcher's responses to these interviews, capturing situational or contextual information such as emphasis and other verbal cues which added texture or the following transcription. The transcription of each recording could be said to be the first stage of analysis, as listening back to the recordings in a detailed and systematic way allowed for the interview to become, rather than a social interaction with a specific purpose, an encounter where research and analysis was the prime concern. The following chapters explore the analysis of the interviews and thematic analysis through an IPA methodological approach. As noted in the previous chapter IPA explores individual's lived experience through a double hermeneutic analysis of exploring the participant's experiences and then interpreting these experiences through a process of exploratory coding, theme emergence and superordinate or cross case thematic investigation (Smith et al, 2009).

Transcription of the interviews was then followed up by the process of Exploratory Coding as outlined during any IPA analysis (Smith et al, 2009). The interviews were first analysed for 'Descriptive analysis 'that is the initial thoughts and responses by the researcher to the account given by the participants. This was done by a line-by-line analysis of the transcript and initial response being written alongside the corresponding text in the column next to the written interview. This was then colour coded for ease of reference when reviewing the analysis later. Going deeper into the analysis involved an examination of 'Linguistic Coding'. This allowed for an in-depth examination of the ways in which the language used expressed the participant's utterances, imagery, metaphor and any other devices which were of particular concern. Any linguistic devices which were used were examined to determine if they added meaning to the accounts given, again this was a line-by-line analysis of the transcript and any pertinent information was noted in the corresponding column of the interview table. Before themes could emerge from the transcripts the final stage of 'Conceptual Coding' was undertaken by a detailed reading of the transcripts. During this stage, exploring the interviews in a deeper way than the previous two coding

stages brought to the surface ways in which the participant expressed their understandings. These were examined to determine what their meaning may have been and how this represents their answering and understanding of the research questions. This was a very immersive and involved stage but allowed for the deeper nuances and subtleties to intimate the ways in which participants understood this aspect of themselves to emerge.

Examining each participant's account individually, to allow for themes to emerge out of it was a process which involved many readings of the interviews and analysis of the Exploratory Coding. Each interview from individual participants was examined as a single encounter without initially looking towards the individual's other interviews. Gradually themes emerged out of the interviews which could be seen to reoccur across participant's collected interviews. This examination of each individual was strictly observed so as to comply with IPA methodology. Once all the participants' accounts were examined in this way superordinate themes began to emerge across accounts. These superordinate themes were analysed and revised with a critical approach to ensure that there were indeed areas of correspondence between participants. While each participant's account is unique to them and is represented as so in the following analysis, the superordinate themes allows an understanding of what it means to be a teacher engaged in multiple contexts to understand and express their spirituality in unique, personal and contextually specific ways. The four superordinate themes which emerged out of the analysis are:

- Spirituality as an aspect of identity formation and understanding.
- Relationships as central to understanding and formation.
- Teaching and learning as a shared encounter through mentoring.
- Spirituality as a contextual resource.

What follows is an exploration of each theme through the accounts and contexts of the participants. The analysis of these themes will then be undertaken so as to address the research questions, allowing for an understanding of how teachers conceptualise and express their spirituality in their professional contexts. Taken together the themes which emerge exhibit a pattern where each theme develops from one to the next, not necessarily

in order. The meaning making process in which the teachers are engaged shows that whilst they are active members of their teaching community they are also set apart during some instances where corporate belief or assumptions are present. The implications which arise out of this study suggest that professional identity is one which draws on a range of resources and is enhanced by an awareness of one's spirituality and that of others. This finding calls in to question the assumed privileged position of cultural secularism and relocates spirituality as a positive attribute of both those who identify with a distinct religious tradition or identify themselves as 'spiritual but not religious'. The unique contribution to knowledge arising out of this project is a redefining of the spiritual in relation to primary teacher's professional encounters. For the participants to be spiritual is to acknowledge and reflect upon those 'moments of profundity and connection with other that leads to change'.

Where excerpts from the transcripts are used, 'R' refers to the researcher.

# Spirituality as an aspect of Identity formation and understanding

It is not unusual for an IPA study to address aspects of identity. As IPA is principally concerned with the lived experiences of individuals and their identity, conceptions of how their identity is understood by themselves and others frequently arises (Smith et al, 2009). During the analysis of the superordinate themes, this was also found to be the case. The participants all expressed an awareness of how their own identity and their concept of self had been informed by their upbringing and the maturation process. Alongside of this, there was an awareness of how they were perceived by their colleagues in regards to how their spirituality was seen as an identity marker. Both of these aspects held positive and negative emotional correspondence for the participants. All of the participants were asked: What is your understanding of Spirituality? The following is their exploration of that question.

**Toni** And then I think it's, it's got links to life. I thought I would initially think, after thinking I thought I would initially mention God and my previous education in Catholic schools both primary and secondary but I realize as an adult it hasn't got anything to do with God.

**Toni** Today as I'm talking, yeah. Because I feel, I feel it's more and I'll probably contradict myself later because I did think about some examples which you'll probably mention or you'll ask me later. Yeah, so that quality thinking about myself, relationships and that sense self of worth and well-being ok. And personal reflection I think has a lot to do with it, having that time to be, to reflect on our personal life. Has that answered the question?

For Toni it is clear that her past upbringing in a Catholic family in an area where this is a minority community has caused her to see her spirituality as being informed by that past. What is interesting to note is that she chooses to focus on the formal aspect of her Catholic education at this point rather than a more personal or family oriented answer. As she thinks about this however, Toni seems to suggest that her understanding has developed over time and that this previous Catholic tradition, whilst having informed her understanding is developed to exclude some of those ideas. It is important to note that she makes a clear distinction between what she has been taught and has learned as a child or young person has been developed as an adult. What emerges is a sense of selfhood and the development of an awareness of the primacy of her own opinion over that of an inherited past (Hayward and Krause, 2013).

Developing this further Toni also provides an insight into how she understands herself in relation to her identity and others. Her spirituality, it would seem, is central to her sense of self and the way in which she feels positive about herself or how her spirituality enhances her sense of self-worth (Culliford, 2011). This has implications of her relationships to others as well - her spirituality is something that seems to act as one way of seeing and being with others in a positive way. This challenges the position of Freud who likened religion and spirituality as having a neurotic tendency and focussed on the negative. Hay and Nye (p28, 2009) concur with the view posited by Toni in that they identified religion and personal spirituality as a source of positivity for some people and a resource from which to engage with other in a constructive way.

How one understands self in relation to the past and family it would seem has implications

for how one identifies aspects of spirituality in relation to their context. Janet was very clear that she was unsure about any aspect of the numinous. From the following extract Janet explains her understanding of what spirituality is in relation to her family and her role as daughter and mother. This for her, her family identity, has informed and continues to inform her understanding of what it means to be spiritual.

Janet I am conscious of other things that I see and I suppose what I've done is translate them through a lens of religion. I'm driving along and my son, I see my dad and my brother, oh God I am comforted because my dad is not around anymore but that my sense of continuity is in my genes but it isn't just in that it is also in everything that we've done. I think about my dad probably every day and it's who he made me and its all the things and every little impact he had on the world. Is that a kind of spiritual sense of something? It's more than, it's an understanding of stuff that goes a little bit beyond the matter of fact and the, and I suppose I would put that in my spiritual box as well, my spirituality box. The fact that I stop and I look at my son and I don't just go, 'Oh my God you look like my dad today'. I think about that in terms of the legacy that's something again about the interconnectedness of everything so but I don't feel any need to work on it. I just feel that's it's a sense that I have and I don't think people have much more sense of it to me and other people don't have any.

Her past continues to inform her present. Janet's familial roles allow her to transcend time and make links between the past and the present. It is through her identification as a member of her family and the inheritance that brings that positively enhances her understanding of 'interconnectedness'. Again, there is no mention of the metaphysical in the sense of an underlying 'reason' behind the spiritual but a sense of how one is placed and identifies with others as informing her spiritual understanding.

From the above, it is clear that one's past and the relationship between self and family affects the ways which one identifies oneself and in turn, how spirituality or the spiritual aspect of one's life is understood. This has implications for how one sees their role in life and is pertinent to how one understands their professional identity and the possible reasons for entering into teaching as informed by family and a developing sense of self. Jane understands her spirituality and her professional identity as being informed by her family and upbringing. She however, makes clear that her past has allowed her to see her role as a

teacher in light of her faith. For Jane, her spirituality and her desire to teach are closely linked.

**Jane** Yeah, no. My mum was a Sunday school teacher we went to church all our lives, I'm a Sunday school teacher.

**R** *Oh wow ok, I didn't know that.* 

**Jane** You didn't know what, yeah. So to me that's just something you do but for me now it's a bit more about giving back to the community more than...

The way in which Jane (in this case as a Sunday school teacher) sees her role as serving the community and how that has been informed by her family history is very important. As a teacher, she sees herself as someone who is there to develop the child but more importantly identifies with children who are misrepresented by others. She recounts one particularly disturbing episode in school where a case of domestic violence was being spoken about by the staff (Schwab, 2013). How Jane set herself at odds with the staff consensus illustrates her understanding of her own identity as informed by her spirituality.

**Jane** And the mum was a cleaner and came in with big bruises, it was pretty hideous. And they couldn't believe and this is where I may be people, I also said I feel for the man 'How can you?' and I said it must be something, he needs help quite desperately in order to free, do you know what I'm saying? He's got issues and problems and they couldn't see and I think I'm that I think there's too much stress, not enough time, I see that a lot where I live as well. Families struggling where actually the bigger picture doesn't.

**R** What do you think would help or what sort of things would have to happen for people to have the opportunity to maybe twig on to their spirituality or their deeper side or whatever it is?

**Jane** I think part of it is education to be spiritual, what's their expectations of life are that I think people are very easily...I'm going to do that because that's what I'm here for.

Being an advocate for children and their families is a theme that is common to several of

the participants to varying degrees. Katherine however identifies herself as a teacher who is informed by the primacy of children to explore and learn for and about themselves. She makes it clear that she does not see herself as a teacher who dictates to her pupils but one who encourages exploration and reflection. Her identification of herself as someone who allows children freedom rather than seeing herself as an educator is made very clear.

**Katherine** Well I think you got I think you've got to give children the freedom to explore and express their feelings in a creative way because if you're someone who, that doesn't allow them the freedom to do that and they always have to do everything exactly how you want them to do it then they're never going to have an opportunity to show you what they're really feeling are they?, and things that they might be processing and working through?

What is important to note is that in this extract Katherine makes no mention of academic development and this was the case for this exploration of her identity as a teacher. For Katherine, the role of the teacher was to guide the child to an understanding of self before academic achievement. This was in large part informed by her understanding of herself as a teacher informed by spiritual searching. Identification of oneself as someone that goes 'beyond' what the bare requirements of teaching require one to see oneself in relationships with one's colleagues and pupils.

The participants generally saw their spiritual identity as a positive aspect of their overall sense of self. There were however, instances where participants recounted where their spiritual and/or religious stance and identity caused them pain or discomfort. While this is not common to all of the participants but what was a general theme was the exploration of how one was understood by colleagues. Most participants were eager to acknowledge that this may have been their perception of reality rather than how it might have been from the perspective of their colleagues. Again, there were instances of participant's pasts affecting their interpretation of events. What is clear however is an awareness on the participant's parts of a subtle difference between how they are perceived among colleagues as opposed to colleagues who do not foreground their spirituality or make explicit how their spirituality informs their professional decisions.

For Helen, there is a real tension between her beliefs and her role as an educator. She sees

this as something which needs to be negotiated but it is an uneasy compromise. Her role as a teacher has to take precedence over her identification as a member of a faith. She sees a danger in expressing her faith explicitly to children in particular as this compromises her sense of professionalism.

**Helen** Very firmly and that's why I have trouble when I've been teaching in schools...then I do have very strong beliefs. I pray to God through it.

# R Right.

**Helen** That's quite hard for me because I those things as strongly as I believe you know the maths I'm teaching in a way that's as much truth. But I can't speak openly about that as being truth that would be indoctrinating and its not my role to do that whereas I would when I, I do a lot of work in church, children's work, but there I can say what I think is the truth there because that is appropriate and that's why I find it really hard being in assemblies because I cannot worship in the way that I would worship because that would upset people and there's no point.

Her spirituality and identification as a Christian allowed her to contextualize her faith and to draw on it to assist her in her role.

Helen That particularly, me talking to God all the time really struck, just sort of every session I was in and I'd just be crying because it felt like God was talking to me about this you know... I'd be getting burned out because running between being a good Christian in church and then running back to being in the workplace or normal life and then getting burnt out and he was using some Bible passages which were from the Old Testament places at the same time but also God and that had a real big impact on me and that was one of those stages for me God was to talk to particularly when I was about to you know I was just about to give a talk to parents and I was really nervous about it and I just remember going into the loo quick and saying a real big prayer there and how that really helped.

Identification as a Christian allowed Helen to draw on resources to help her negotiate between her identities as church member, school teacher and mother. There is clearly a lot of tension in the above passage and Helen sees herself as conflicted between her spirituality and being authentic too that and how this is translated into her role as a teacher. Katherine also identifies as a Christian but has a different interpretation of what it means to be a person of faith in her context. Rather than seeing herself as a Christian and then a teacher, she asserts that her identities work together well and inform one another. Developing this further she posits the idea that people may prefer to see themselves as 'set apart' rather than integrated into a staff community as this feeds their identification as members of a particular faith group.

Katherine Yeah I think maybe so but there's an element of choice in that. If they were excluded and I'm speaking hypothetically, I can't really speak from experience but, they might actually like that in a way because some Christians believe that they are to be set apart from everybody else and they're to be in the world and not of the world. So, some people might actually think you know they do see I'm a religious person and therefore they have not invited me to this or whatever because they do see I'm different. So, I think some people might view it in a positive light that they're actually kind of shining and being an example that people can see because they are adapting their behavior when they deal with them.

Identity then is one of the ways in which all our participants understand themselves in relation to spirituality informing a sense of selfhood. How spirituality is understood is individual and can be seen as something which has been developed and appropriated over time and which might have been quite different during different life stages. Alongside of that, how one's identity as a professional can draw on spirituality as a resource has been explored. Family and education have been noted as informing the participants' accounts of themselves as professionals. Finally, the identification of oneself as a particular faith tradition and how this may conflict or enhance one's sense of professional identity is contested and is negotiated individually.

### Relationships as central to Spirituality

Many participants stated that their understanding of their spirituality has been shaped by the relationships they have had and have made between aspects of their professional and private lives as well as between children and the curriculum. For some participants, their spirituality is first and foremost understood as a relationship between the divine and themselves on an intimate level, which informs their interpretation of seeing connections and relationships between people, places and ideas. For other participants, the prime concern is upholding equitable relationships in various aspects of their lives so as to inform their negotiations of the personal and private.

### **Relationships as Perspectival**

For a number of the participants, their relationship with the divine provided the clearest indication of what a positive relationship is and should be. This was informed by how life events were interpreted and an acknowledgement of the relationship with the divine as something which is fluid and allows for a degree of maturation and revision.

**Helen** I guess my spirituality is the bit of me that has a relationship with God...part of me. I became a Christian when I was 7. The choices that I made and the prayer that I said, the feeling I had of God coming into me was I guess the start of my spiritual relationship with God 40 years ago and I guess all through those years God is built. I think of that as my spirituality is that relationship, that part of me that I think is a very real part of me that spirit world that God...

The definite positioning of Helen's understanding of her spirituality as God directed and rooted in her early commitment to the God of her faith is something that shares similarities to the other contributors. Where Helen differs markedly is her complete understanding of spirituality as God centered and something that finds its truest expression through religious commitment rather than being directed towards something else or interpreted through other phenomenon.

**Helen** I think there has always been events like that. I think now I'm older I think sometimes I'm quicker to go to God and ask him than I would have been before and I think I have more faith because I got these experiences that I've had. I've got faith that he answered me before, he'll do it this time and I think God can work the more faith you have it gives God a channel.

**R** Do you mean by faith the more openness you have...or more of an open ear?

**Helen** Yeah maybe, yeah and I guess I feel like when I was younger I would talk to God once a day...but I feel like I have a conversation much more frequently...it runs through my day more.

Understanding one's spirituality this way was not unique to Helen however other participants had a more open attitude towards where spirituality should be directed and interpreted. Janet had explored Christianity in her teens and early twenties but has a cautiousness about attributing spirituality solely towards the divine. For her, it is a much more personal response based on individual's understandings rather than through the spectrum of faith and/or religion.

**Janet** I'm not sure that it is. I suspect people I know do feel that they have a spiritual dimension to their life, they do feel that. A lot of people with no spiritual dimension do not believe and that the word had no meaning for them 'spiritual' only 'now'. Now I've allowed the here and now to become spiritual in my thinking, a bit bizarre in a way because that's exactly not but then it's like ...

For Janet, it would seem that the contexts which she negotiates through her life provides her opportunities to interpret relationships and events and allow her a way of understanding or exploring deeper questions than perhaps would otherwise present themselves. Her apparent lack of relationship in this area would seem at odds to other participants, but when thought of in relation to her earlier statements of seeing family as pointing beyond the 'here and now' and towards something which is uncertain. Like Helen, Janet's understanding of spirituality is something which seems to develop over time and allows for revisions to be made and examined when necessary.

Further instances of participants exploring aspects of their spirituality which are grounded in relationships occur throughout but one of the most explicit expressions of this way of understanding spirituality (as grounded in relationships) occurred when Jane recounted instances where her spirituality was called into action or demanded a response.

**Jane** And not be religious and I think somebody who cares about others, others before them, thinks about the environment can be spiritual just deep thinking and reflective that's

my opinion.

For Jane, the relationship between self (deep thinking and reflective) and other(s) through sacrificial action constitutes the spiritual. Again, this is something that may or may not be contextualized through religion but this would seem to be of minor importance for Jane. What is evident is that spirituality is understood as a response to other(s) and is not an abstract or isolated phenomenon which directly challenges the position taken by Bainbridge's view (2000, p164-168) which outlined that the early career educators which he examined viewed spirituality as being personal at the expense of the corporate impact espoused by the participants.

# Relationships between curriculum and deep learning

Building on the ways in which some teachers understood aspects of spirituality as providing an imperative towards social action, several participants expressed the ways in which they did this. Some of which were to act prompts towards their pupils to see the relationships between not only academic subjects but their role in the educative and social process. This was borne out of many shared responses from participants as seeing the goal of their relationship with children was to encourage children to be enquiring and active members in their learning and wider communal groups.

Seeing her spirituality as a resource which informs her relationships with her pupils and allows her to develop in her pupils, Katherine explains that the attributes of questioning and exploration between areas of learning which she hopes to develop in pupils has wider personal and social implications.

Katherine If you look at things like English and Literacy I think you can give a deeper meaning to things if you have kind of a more spiritual view, you don't always read things literally. And maybe write in a literal way so I think you get that effect. I think it is obviously immeasurable in terms of like statistics and things but I think if you look at it as the bigger picture then it's always going to have an impact on someone else's life. So, if you instill I know you said they were life soft things but if you instill those values in people you know they're going to go and make a difference in the wider world but I think in terms of stuff you can measure, see I'm quite a literacy based person so I could guess I

comfortable about seeing literacy you use the 5 senses when you try to write in literacy. And I think if you're naturally a spiritual person then you can eek that out of them a bit more. So, you can feel comfortable saying 'Oh let's all go outside and listen to the birds and lets go into the woods and see what we can see and what we can touch'. Some people might not be comfortable doing that because they might think it's a bit kind of soft or airy fairy or so in that way I've seen real kind of improvement in writing and it becomes natural for the children then so they don't have to think about the 5 senses because they're kind of attuned to that anyway so they...it would be natural for them to if they were at the beach to think 'Oh this is what I feel, smell, touch'. It's kind of like a bit of mindfulness.

Katherine feels very strongly about developing in pupils a sense of seeking relationships between phenomenon in order to be able to contextualize the pupils position with that of other(s). This seeing children's learning as going beyond the curriculum and allowing the opportunity for the teacher to foster a positive image of themselves on the part of their pupils seems of central importance. It could be assumed that the relationship with self is of central concern to the teaching endeavor as it allows pupils to seek connections between a positive sense of self and their relationship with their environment and others, understanding teaching as being a challenge to step outside of and exceed the curriculum as imperative to developing informed and agential pupils.

Janet If there were connections for me, when I teach it's not all out there, I get very involved, I get very excited about the bits I don't know, that I have got to go and learn. So, if there are those connections for me I suppose I would be wanting to share those, involve the children in those. Find ways, it's also about the world, being. It's all about that sense of awe and stuff about the world, about the things that make you stop and think about who you are and what you are and I suppose I don't think of those in terms of curriculum they need to know this, this and this, and be able to do this, this and this, I don't think about those.

Helen explores her own view of her teaching skills alongside that of her colleagues and begins to address the tensions she feels between the demands of the curriculum against her desire to develop children both academically and personally. For Helen, this causes her to assert that perhaps she is not a good teacher in regards being a deliverer of content but sees her spiritual relationship as providing her with a context to justify her professional choices.

**Helen** Well they have better teaching skills than me. I might have all the best will in the world to do things but I might not necessarily have ideas of how to convey something or teach something but I think, I think it gives me a good basis for the values that I'd set in the classroom and the morals that they get and I think you know because of my priorities I might not be so pushing the results of my children for Ofsted and things like that but I want to develop the whole child and I want them to be encouraged and those things.

The relationships Helen has with her pupils and her desire to see beyond the professional demands and towards developing pupils as something more than learners can be challenging. Professional standing and relationships between colleagues are negotiated through the fostering of relationships, which either bring to the foreground or background participants' spirituality and/or religion. What this means for being part of in-out groups within the staff team and how one views oneself and their role as colleague and friend has had an impact on some of the participants. The negotiation of the personal and professional identities has allowed for some of the participants to be explicit in regards to their spirituality, while for others it is a source of negotiation and interpretation.

# Spirituality informing relationships between staff

The ways in which the teachers involved in the study distanced themselves from explicitly expressing their spirituality with pupils was a theme which was consistent across all participants. From this calling into question the professional and private boundary, several of the teachers interviewed expressed in various degrees a more open attitude towards expressing their spirituality with staff. This clearly was context specific and for some participants caused anxiety and self-reflection while for others it was an authentic expression of their deeply held beliefs, which gave them a sense of worth within the school community.

From a professional standpoint Janet felt the most ill at ease with expressing aspects of her spirituality which were explored by making connections between areas of learning for children. To her, this deep questioning and seeking of connection, was an integral part of her professional and spiritual nexus but was at odds with the demands placed upon her as a teacher working collaboratively with others in designing lessons and assessments.

**Janet** It's all about that sense of awe and stuff about the world about the things that make you stop and think about who you are and what you are and I suppose I don't think of those in terms of curriculum they need to know this, this and this, and be able to do this, this and this, I don't think about those.

### **R** You're a rebel these days.

Janet Well I haven't really thought about this before that much but I suppose I don't think in those ways. I think people hate planning with me because I think in terms of what I would like to think about are bigger ideas but for other people are just irritating because it makes it all a bit complicated I suppose I'm not a very easy person to work with because. Yeah I am I suppose trying to make those bigger connections and I sort of feel maybe it's about a sort of philosophy, beliefs and values, we talked about that I think last time rather than and maybe that's a spirituality because it's about those things that have to have them to know and they're quite nebulous things. So yes I very much want to share that.

Wishing to share was she identifies of as being important and the negotiation of this with the desire to be part of a harmonious team places Janet's position in difficulty (De Souza, 2012). Not wanting to be difficult or complicate working situation and relations was also a concern of Jane.

**Jane** And with other people, I think if you're a spiritual person. See sometimes I don't look at myself enough, I tend to think about others more but I think that does make you an easier person to work with because I tend to not rock any boat. I tend to suck things in do you know what I mean and I think perhaps because I don't want to cause and I feel that's part of your spirituality. Does that make sense?

The hierarchicalization of others over self seems to be done out of a sense of being easy to work with but may also have undertones of sacrifice and altruism interpreted through the lens of her spirituality. Being able to place oneself within a tradition was for Jane and others a useful way of seeing the relationship between their spirituality as an alternative interpretive tool for their relationships with others and in some cases provided the vocabulary to express this in the workplace when the context was deemed appropriate.

What must be foregrounded though is that the examination of relationships between the participants focused almost entirely on interaction between themselves and their colleagues and not with pupils.

**Helen** Yeah, but like I very often on my way into work and when I am driving along I'll be thinking you know I am God's person in this school, how would God want me to be today in school and to use me and to try and be open for opportunities. So there might be ways I can serve other members of staff, helping them or chatting with them. Very occasionally I have had times where I have prayed with another member of staff. So it is fairly high up in my mind when it's not completely crazy. I think, I'm very sure that God put me in that school for circumstances and I'm very sure that he's got roles for me to do. And I very much want to do those.

Having a 'reason' to be placed in that school as a member of staff and being open to or seeking opportunities to be authentic to her faith/spirituality was fundamental to how Helen saw her contribution towards positive professional and possibly private relationships. Helen very much explicitly negotiated her religious identity with staff and sought to recognize opportunities where she felt her faith and her spiritual life could positively impact on her colleagues.

**Katherine** And I wouldn't want to influence them because I do think faith is definitely something you have to choose for yourself. Even with my own daughter I wouldn't make her believe because I think that is wrong.

**R** For your colleagues then, if you imagine your colleagues looking at you would your spirituality be more evident let's say than your religion? So do you go around talking about your religion or is it more subtle than that, do you know what I mean?

**Katherine** *I think it's more subtle than that yeah unless I'm explicitly asked.* 

Approaching the interaction between her spirituality and the relationship she has with her colleagues, Katherine takes a passive stance in relation to Helen. This might be because for Katherine, she is content to explore ambiguity in regards to questions of a metaphysical nature. This is because of her exploration of different forms of faith and how these inform

her current understanding. Being open to other possibilities, it would seem, shows that she is comfortable with ambiguity and/or does not see herself as someone whose position is yet clearly defined by others.

# **Mentoring as a Spiritual Expression**

Throughout all the interviews with the participants it became clear that they understood their spirituality as a way of locating aspects of themselves which were understood as central to their identity. Acknowledged within this was the notion that to be spiritual entailed having ownership over one's choices and ways of understanding and interaction in the world. This agency and the interaction of their professional and personal responses to it foregrounded the ways in which they hoped to provide opportunities for young people to take ownership over their own ways of seeing and interacting with the world (Bennett, 2015 and Johnson, 2003). The response from the participants, to varying degrees, was to find aspects within their own professional practice which would allow them to cede control over aspects of the children's learning and staff relationships in order for the individuals involved to take ownership of their own development, whether that was identified as personal, academic or spiritual. The theme of 'Mentoring' encapsulated the ways in which the participants encouraged individuals to direct themselves while being guided rather than 'taught' by the teacher. Mentoring was interpreted as one label through which the participants could imaginatively engage with the spiritual whilst occupied in their professional world. The coming together of the partipants' 'spirituality at work' exemplified the ways in which Ashmos and Dushon (2000) conceptualised this explicit model. Where the participants challenge the model put forward by Ashmos and Duschon (ibid) was that this was often implicit and undefined in their own concept of their role as professionals and evidenced in the ways in which articulating this proved difficult.

# Spirituality as a negation of Hierarchy

Toni gave many examples from her teaching within Key Stage 1 to illustrate how she resisted the impulse to lead or give easy solutions to children's questioning or activities. For her, the way in which she responded put her role as situated alongside that of her pupils rather than above them. For Toni, this negation of hierarchy allowed children to

learn for themselves and ultimately, retain ownership of their learning (O'Broin and Palmer, 2010). The ways in which Toni positioned and understood her personal (spiritual) values placed an emphasis on 'being with' pupils as opposed to 'working with' pupils. Mentoring in this way by negotiating the relationship between herself and her pupils meant that Toni could be fully engaged in her relationship as facilitator (hierarchically negotiable) rather than 'Teacher' (Hierarchically fixed). As such, her spirituality and values were implicitly articulated in the situation and helps to authenticate the ways in which teachers mentor pupils as expression of their spiritual lives not at odds with their identities as professionals but complimentary to it.

**Toni** I think they like that if they ask a question time needs to allow through discussion you get more questions don't you. OK well I don't know the answer right now so let's find out together. Children like that because if they've had the question and it wasn't fed through facts, because they had the question they want to know the answer, don't they. The same as an adult if you got a question you're going to look into it and you're going to retain it aren't you.

The intersection between retention, enjoyment and ownership allowed Toni to not hesitate in facilitating these learning opportunities. The tensions she feels in being able to negotiate the curriculum and demands of the school and her desire to allow children the time to reflect and take the learning on for themselves is an aspect which she is still negotiating.

**Toni** I think, I think because it's through questioning and giving time for children to respond in their own way and those, and especially particularly the older children getting them to respond in a much deeper, deeper way and giving then and allowing them that time to be reflective, yeah? And that was quite interesting in the outcomes, they wanted to know you know what plant is that, and why is that that colour but it's not that colour on that plant. You know, we don't give children the time to ask us questions very much.

Ways in which children assume agency over their learning and from this allowing the teacher to step back from direct instruction and towards a role of facilitator seems to be of ultimate significance. Becoming a background figure in the teaching and learning process and desiring to allow children to learn for and from each other is central to the participant's conception of what effective learning is.

**R** Would you say the kids when those times have happened, would you say actually the learning that's taking place is very, very good. It's been better than saying right kids we're

going to sit down and work our way through.

**Helen** Yeah and it's when children have taken charge of the learning that they're now leading the learning rather than you being up front doing this...they run run with it.

**R** Would you say then that actually their education is better, you know the end result is better so kind of if it's creative actually.

**Helen** They're not being 'done' to.

### Agency as a method of Self Realization

Stepping away from seeing children as 'products' or 'objects' to be filled with information which will be withdrawn at a later stage situates the learner as a dignified participant in the process or to extrapolate further that the learner is placed hierarchically superior to the teacher in the way in which they are conceptualised by the participants. Their personhood is understood as being of higher significance than their identities as learners. The significance of this stance varies between participants but what is central to all of their accounts is for pupils to be the driving force behind their learning. This is seen as central to the participant's esteem for their pupils and is hoped that it is a statement (whether implicit or explicit) of the ways in which children will go on to interact with their environments and relationships.

Janet Sorry can I come back to the previous question, the teacher one I think it possibly also relates to a sense of self and identity and if you can give children...enhance, enhance might be the best word here, enhance their sense of self enhance their sense of their own identity. Educating for meaningful lives. Enhance their sense of that that their lives has meaning that they matter, they have something to say, contribute. Then yeah I think its hugely important now it maybe some people will say that you can do that without spirituality but I have a feeling and you see you get tied down in the current sort of...we're blinkered by policy contexts of the moment but I think we could be as educators just churning people through...

#### R Products?

**Janet** Yeah it's all about products it's all about the workforce at the end of it and actually not very effectively because I don't think the curriculum with everything we've got will

create the sort of people that we need for that anyway.

**R** It's taking away problem solving.

**Janet** I think if you did we'd create those people that would be that but they'd be so much more besides.

Building up a sense of self-worth through agential ownership is inextricably linked to how the participants understand their role as teachers. Moving their professional identity away from instruction and towards a more long term view of mentoring through instilling a sense of power and worthiness on the pupils in ways which positively enhance pupils' lives is central to their professional practice. The intersection between personal and professional identities alludes to an integration of private and public expression of spirituality both towards invigorating learners through positive development.

**R** Would you say that your expression of spirituality is very much in nurturing, I'm going to say spirituality in nurturing the ability of kids mainly from what you're saying in having those sort of...'flipping heck this is something to think about or just isn't it beautiful or isn't it challenging?'

**Toni** Yes, yeah. Yeah I have responded to my yeah my examples have been with children because I suppose that's how it is with my, you know with my, life. Whether I am at work or at home it's still with children so. I need to get out more. And I think going out being out as just as an adult I think I'm being I can be more inwards it's more inwards that reflectiveness. If its verbal I think it can be with children but if I'm on my own it can be more, more inwards like I said before it is that it is that personal reflection it is that selfworth, that well-being that I suppose you kind of gauge.

Being able to see and interpret beyond 'facts' seems to be the ideal which the participants strive towards fostering in their pupils. Through achieving these agential skills, the participants hope that pupils will learn to be active participants in questioning and situating themselves in relation to others. The ways in which children develop and progress is acknowledged by a fostering of inquisitiveness and is understood as being central to how the participants view the educative process. Being able to understand one's perspective and the reasons for this allows for the understanding of differing positions whilst retaining harmonious relations with others. This assists in developing pupils to become positive contributors towards society.

This is done through nurturing rather than instruction or rather through having and modelling positive relationships to be used as a reference by the pupils in other contexts.

Janet It gets mushed up a bit you know like everything is very black and white and as you get older it can go a little bit grey, we won't talk shades of, but at that age you do form your identity in that way and it is about for a lot of people it is about looking for values. I suppose...so what am I doing with teaching primary aged children? I'm not teaching them towards an idea of them joining, adhering to a particular set of values or whatever. I suppose I am encouraging them though to think beyond themselves and their immediate environment.

#### Social Justice as a manifestation of Spiritual Action

Through giving agency to children by allowing them the tools to seek out and question for themselves brings about elements of social justice or action. The participants all explored the idea that education is not just for the learning of areas within the curriculum but through positive relationships should provide pupils with the tools they need to become active participants in society and where possible to seek change now. By knowing the children in their care, the participants discussed several encounters where they felt that their contribution towards guiding children to see themselves in certain ways would not only improve their concept of self and self-esteem but possibly assist in personal and social change. Not all of these recounted episodes were emotionally positive but did provide a way in which the participants saw their role as mentors to children. Janet, struggled with issues of social inequality and the limitations of her effectiveness to bring about positive outcomes.

Janet Well with the children I am thinking about because some of them more able because you're saying 'could you see it in the classroom?' Children that maybe come from backgrounds more like mine where they are given more chance to make those connections and go to places that open up their minds and see things in different ways, have different perspectives on things, I think they probably did get it a bit but it's not those ones I was... I'm not not interested in them but it's the other ones that I suppose I am interested in for whom life is a series of very functional, getting through. I don't know whether as a teacher how much power you actually have to make a difference to those.

Understanding her role as a mentor to the child and as an educator is central to Janet's conception of what teaching is about. Seeing connections between herself and her pupils as well as allowing pupils the possibility to see themselves in a positive light in relation to others, parallels aspects of spirituality when held up amongst areas where spirituality is likened to being in relationship to/with. Whilst most of these examples from participants relate to how they see children and the fostering of agency and self-esteem within them as contingent to their role through drawing on their sense of the spiritual there were examples of challenging inequality of relationships between members of staff (Dewey, 2012). Again, the expression of the professional and private (spiritual) self is seen as one of mentoring rather than explicit foregrounding, the hope is as above, to bring about positive change through the highlighting of individuals' worth in society and the contextualisation of their actions, rather than isolated and reflected response (Jamieson, 2013). While these findings do not challenge Chater's research (2005) on early and established educator's careers, they do point towards a continuing engagement with conceptual issues in regards to how the educators reflect upon their role. Perhaps it is more nuanced and a coming together of faith position and professionalism where hierarchy (Dewey, 2012) and service (Jamieson, 2013) are integrated with the professional and personal spiritual lives of the participants. Here Jane recounts a particularly harrowing account of how her fellow colleagues reacted to issues of domestic violence, Jane hoped that by giving her colleagues the opportunity to place the individual concerned in another light that it might bring about a change in attitude, which may help foster positive relationships. This was a defining moment for Jane.

**Jane** And the mum was a cleaner and came in with big bruises, it was pretty hideous. And they couldn't believe and this is where I may be people, I also said I feel for the man 'How can you?' and I said it must be something, he needs help quite desperately in order to free, do you know what I'm saying? He's got issues and problems and they couldn't see and I think I'm that I think there's too much stress, not enough time, I see that a lot where I live as well. Families struggling where actually the bigger picture doesn't.

**R** What do you think would help or what sort of things would have to happen for people to have the opportunity to maybe twig on to their spirituality or their deeper side or whatever it is?

**Jane** I think part of it is education to be spiritual, what's their expectations of life are that I think people are very easily...I'm going to do that because that's what I'm here for.

Bringing about social change through the development of agency in children (and colleagues) by mentoring rather than instructing them was an explicit expression of what each participant defined as what it meant to express their spirituality at work. While the participants had no issue with linking their spirituality to the theme of mentoring and the ways in which mentoring was manifested, the shared thread of seeing children as active participants in their education with the ultimate aim of developing mature and well-rounded individuals who had the ability to see themselves in relation to others and context.

# Spirituality as a contextual resource.

Examining the multiple ways spirituality is conceptualised and expressed by the participants in the study seems to point towards a general feeling that the spiritual element of individuals' existence is acknowledged but negotiated. This negotiation draws deeply on the participants' backgrounds, personal philosophy and religious belief. What seems to be a common element however, is the concept that elements of spirituality can be viewed as a resource or 'tool' to draw on or a 'frequency' from which they can attune themselves to. For the majority of participants (regardless of whether they subscribe to a system of faith or not) elements of spirituality allows both the participants and through them, the pupils in their tutelage, to make comparisons and contextual examination of aspects of their life pertaining to life choices, values and relationships. Within an idiographic analysis of each individual's understanding of the ways in which spirituality provides a resource which assists in the assessment of contextual binaries several different understandings of this as a resource emerged. Examining these assists in some ways in understanding how each participant sees spirituality as an element of self, which enhances one's understanding of self and other (Sacks, 2011).

Janet understood spirituality as providing a resource which she can choose to draw on when needed. This was understood as just one set of 'tools' which helps her to make sense of occurrences or relationships. As a distinct but also integrated resource which can be regarded as an aspect of self or as a point of focus when engaged with 'other'. It is this 'distinct while also integrated' understanding of spirituality as a which distinguishes Janet from the other participants who view it as part of an integrated whole.

**Janet** Is that a kind of spiritual sense of something/It's more than, its an understanding of stuff that goes a little bit beyond the matter of fact and the, and I suppose I would put that

in my spiritual box as well, my spirituality box.

The way in which Janet acknowledges that for her spirituality as a resource is not easily defined and possibly is still being negotiated. Putting it in her spirituality 'box' alludes to this 'box' comprising or becoming comprised of more than one element from which she can draw on. This ongoing negotiation of these elements, which make up her spiritual resource is something that she examines further.

Janet seems to have a situational awareness of her spirituality, rather than a concept of spirituality, which she feels she needs to engage with explicitly or devote time to. It is an integrated aspect of her personhood. The way in which her spirituality is drawn on whilst also being something she can attune to suggests that for Janet, spirituality is multifaceted in how she engages with it and conceptualises it.

**Janet** A lot of people with no spiritual dimension do not believe and that the word had no meaning for them 'spiritual' only 'now'. Now I've allowed the here and now to become spiritual in my thinking a bit bizarre in a way because that's exactly not but then it's like ...do you need to work on it? I don't know. I think you may become more conscious of it but why would you need to work on it, for what reason, why would I want to work on it. I don't particularly want to be more spiritual I just am what I am.

The ways in which spirituality has been used as a tool or resource, which assist in the negotiation of life choices and relationships or provide a context for understanding certain experiences, has meant that for some participants the need to develop or engage with this aspect of themselves takes an explicit form. This active engagement with spirituality and the by-product of which being a resource or tool which one has the option to draw on is something which Katherine expressed. Rather than a resource which is neutral in the sense of it neither being positive or negative in how it is conceptualised or how it makes one 'feel' about themselves, Katherine makes it clear that for her spirituality as a tool provides benefits.

**Katherine** I don't know if it's that or just the fact that you've had to lay still for 45 minutes but you do come away feeling kind of more resourced. And kind of have a bit more peace.

**R** OK but going back to like your childhood because you said your childhood, at what point did you think ok spirituality and God are two things that go together or how did that thinking come about?

**Katherine** I guess because when you're praying and stuff you kind of sense that it's kind of something bigger than you and it just feels different and you kind of believe that what you're praying for is going to happen and that you'll get a response.

Not only is spirituality seen as a 'tool' to get things done or to interact with. It is also seen as an aspect of self which can be drawn on to give meaning to aspects of life and identity. For Katherine, spirituality as a resource helps her to achieve something, whether that is a reflective passive act or whether it is an active, outward act is unclear. For Jane her spirituality has and is being used as a tool for situating her sense of worth professionally. As such it is seen as a tool which provides context and motivation within her teaching.

**Jane** I think I was kind of right, I know there's no right answer. But it did say about modern day spirituality as being...doesn't it. So it probably does help me with my teaching. Because I don't think I would still be doing it, so for example next year still teaching in school two days and having the fulltime job here but I do still love the children.

As a way of understanding her motivation and giving her a context for how she sees her role as teacher and as someone in relationship with her pupils and colleagues, Jane uses her spirituality as a tool which affects her sense of resilience. These are just some examples of how the participants defined spirituality as a resource. It is not only an aspect of the individual but it is something which can be used and interacted with in a variety of ways which is clear from the above examples.

### Modelling the spiritual as an aspect of child development

It is clear from the above examples that there is an implication that spirituality whilst being understood as an aspect of personhood can also be understood as a resource which one can draw on to help make sense of relationships and situational occurrences. How this is translated from the individual participant within their role as teacher is complex but there are elements which seem to be common between participants irrespective of their worldview and/or faith conviction.

Janet expressed some ways in which she sees spirituality or the spiritual element within individuals (which she is still negotiating) as a way of providing children with a context in which they can see and understand their own experiences in the light of others and hopefully from this, to be able to understand their own situations and context. This arises out of Janet's deeply held social and political convictions and this, coupled with her teaching context, allowed Janet to see spirituality as a positive and challenging resource which she could assist children in developing (Harris, 2007).

Janet I'm not sure there's any sense of improvement but if you think your place in the world is somewhat random therefore where you are, how you got there, chance and luck therefore you don't...so much of it is being in the right place. I didn't, I have no control over being a reasonably bright, white middleclass woman in western Europe but not just western Europe but in the UK, south east blah, blah and I think that makes me incredibly lucky and as a result I suppose I feel I have a responsibility, probably don't do much about but I certainly owe it to people who didn't, who aren't as lucky not to...You look at the pictures of migrants all they're trying to do is that thing Norman Tebbitt asked people to do get on your bike except it's on your incredibly dangerous boat and make a better life. Isn't that what Tebbitt was telling people to do in a very different and to ever kind of consider that other people's lives are easy or take what you have for yourself for granted there's something about that that informs the way I think in that way.

The challenge implied within Janet's views of using spirituality as a resource is that one should consider one's context and from that react to it. For her it seems to be in assisting pupils in understanding and reacting to their own contexts. But how one provides a way in which this can be done is much more difficult to define. Aspects of this were explored by all of the participants, with some commonalities for the ways in which this can be

developed. The differences seemed to be in the motivation for this exploration. Toni drew heavily on her own faith and that of the school she practises in. For her, allowing children to understand how she draws on her spirituality as a resource was an activity which was modelled rather than instructed. Time and individual reflection were elements which she felt were essential in allowing children the possibility of developing spiritual resources.

**Toni** So it's setting up that classroom climate, especially as a fulltime teacher it is, it's setting up that climate in your own class with your own class that actually...and circle time I've used, used a lot for that where we are all taking it in turns to speak and things that we say are ok. No one's wrong and I find myself saying that more now 'don't worry there's no wrong answer'.

Providing children with a safe space to explore their ideas and experiences and allowing for individual accounts to be valued is central here. It is the lived experience that is important for Toni's development of spirituality in children and how the children use this as a resource or tool from which to explore their lives.

# Spirituality as a Professional Resource

As can be seen from the above examples, the participants all seem to place great importance on the openness of how individual's understand their own spirituality and that this openness extends to providing individuals with the opportunity to develop their own concept of spirituality, by providing time and space, rather than 'instructional' models of spiritual development. Developing this further, the teachers identified ways in which they see spirituality being a resource, which is embedded in self-reflection but manifest in action and reaction to context. Exploring this, it is clear that each participant drew on their own teaching context for how they understood spirituality as having the possibility to develop the individual and benefitting community. This did not always mean an imperative or acted out response but could be responded to by individuals (teachers and pupils) using spirituality to understand their context and possibly provide a motivation to action. Janet explicitly acknowledges that her concept of spirituality is something that is focussed on elements of existence which are not easily defined and also explored the reasons why spirituality has to have an extrinsic expression.

Janet Well again it's how it relates. It only makes sense in a framework of, to me spirituality is I suppose all the stuff...the intangible stuff it's about the stuff that's separate from functional, I said before, and so if you've got a spectrum functional is at one end and spiritual is at the other other but it is a spectrum as is most things so between them so putting them on a ruler isn't actually that helpful. And educator or people to be aware that just small specifics isolate and compartmentalise pupils/students whoever question stuff that goes beyond very functional thought and question what makes us human. And I suppose for some people then that's spiritual for others it's just philosophical.

Being able to reflect and question oneself in regards to how one is a contextual being and how this may affect how one interacts with their context allowed Helen to place her spirituality very much in the realm of providing an impetus to help and serve others. This meant that for her pupils and colleagues she used her spirituality as a resource which permeated all aspects of her lived experience. After retelling a time when she prayed with a member of staff having personal problems and exploring prayer with a pupil whose family had suffered a tragedy Helen explains why her spirituality acted out through prayer.

**Helen** Yeah and we do we have a really close relationship as a staff, we're a real family and a team so that's built up and I know for me it's a big thing. I've worked in a number of schools for a few...before I always felt when it comes to leaving it's like I told them a little bit about Christianity, like they know I go to church but I didn't really tell them about God and about my relationship with God that they could have and I felt really and this time, being in this school always its been I want to be able to tell people. I don't want to leave this school whenever that is and people not know who God is because I haven't told them.

**R** Is that because you want to be true to yourself as well though? Not honest but there's no hiding that aspect of yourself, is that your thinking?

**Helen** I guess I'm braver to just be myself now but also if I really, truly believe that if people don't follow God they're in real danger I've got to do something about that I've got to give people that choice.

The participants as teachers, which incorporates the dual identities as teacher and

colleague, have all acknowledged that there is an element to their concept of spirituality, which could be understood as a tool or resource. What is implied in this is that their understanding of spirituality is not a benign or disinterested aspect of selfhood but rather an aspect of self which has an imperative to act. That acting out could be an awareness of self in relation to other and to be aware of the contextual elements which inform one's situation. Taking this further social action could be one response to this. It might be that for those like Janet, this social response or social action should be directed towards improving one's own and other's situation or for Helen an outward expression of her faith for the benefit of others. How one defines what is beneficial is complex and it is clear from the above examples that the resource of spirituality benefits the individual and others in a host of ways which are defined by the individual rather than by others or community.

### Summary

Examining the way in which the participants recalled their understanding of spirituality and how this was manifested through their professional interactions has been outlined in this chapter. Through a phenomenological approach utilised in IPA, it has been demonstrated that the lived experience of the participants through the retelling of their professional encounters has uncovered themes which indicate an awareness of the ways in which spirituality informs their practice. Evident in this chapter is the ways in which this is not a clearly defined phenomenon but one which is negotiated and re-examined in a dynamic process involving the professional use of reflection and evaluation. Taken together, the findings point towards a new definition of spirituality drawn from the participants' accounts which is shared between their professional experiences but understood personally. That is those 'moments of profundity and connection with other that leads to change'. The following chapter will discuss these accounts through a closer inspection of the superordinate themes which have emerged through these discussions.

### Chapter 5

# **Analysis and Discussion**

By examining the contributions of the participants in the previous chapter, it emerged that there were shared areas which the participants recounted in their lived experience that demonstrated an awareness of spirituality as personal to them and how this informed their teaching. Exploring this further, this chapter will assist in unveiling the unique contribution to knowledge of the project, its new definition of the spiritual in relation to the participants, and the possible implications this has for their teaching and the ways in which teaching and teacher education could be informed by their contributions. This will be achieved by an in-depth analysis of the superordinate themes uncovered in their recollections in the previous chapter.

# Identity as a negotiated project

Arising out of all the contributions from the participants is a shared story of how their individual identities are made up of and made by their past and current experiences. What is unique to these accounts however is the ways in which the individual participants identify spirituality and their spiritual self as a component of their identity as teachers. This in some ways is no surprise, as they refer to their spirituality throughout their life stories and illustrated narratives. What is unexpected however, is how they see their spirituality as informing their professional discourses and the ways in which they feel themselves to be teachers but also how they feel they are perceived by colleagues. This aspect of the findings places spirituality as a key component of the private, public and professional self.

For the participants, it became clear that their identities have been informed and constructed both by themselves in a conscious manner but also by the environment and communal circles which at the outset of their lives may not have been chosen independently but may have come about through familial and localised spheres on involvement. Social Identity Theory (SIT) is at odds with many social psychological theories of the self. SIT sees the formation of the self as dependent on the social contexts in which individuals are placed (Liu and Laszle in Maloney and Walker, 2007). If this is the case, the ways in which many of the participants' recall childhood or early adolescent narratives about belonging to a church or faith community through the membership of their

families becomes an area of importance. One could argue that at an early stage this active involvement by an identity group of supreme importance (immediate family) implicitly placed these groups as set apart in order of their importance and worth (Markova in Maloney and Walker, 2007). This would seem at odds with Kay's (2003) position which assumes a developing disconnecting between individuals and established church groups or at the very least challenges the lowering of importance of this aspect of life in the current social context. The one participant who challenges this assertion is Jane, she chose a group as an adolescent in opposition to her parents, what can be said however, is that it is possible that a faith group was chosen as it hierarchically challenged the political values espoused by her family in opposition to organised religion. Regardless of this theory, it is provisionally safe to assert that familial involvement with certain groups (in this case religious) played an important part in the hierarchical organisation of the participants' identity groups.

Within SIT, the concept of Social Identity (SI) individuals who opt into a group consciously or otherwise come to see the group as having a positive impact on their sense of self. While this may be the case where groups are benign or positive in their culture, the same could be argued for groups that are seen as negative from the perspective of an observer from outside of the group. What is worth noting is that for the member of the group, membership is seen as important and informs their sense of self and identity. SI is 'that part of an individual's self-concept which derives from his knowledge of his membership of a social group, together with the value and emotional significance attached to it' (Tajfel in Bennett and Sani, 2004). Analysing this further, membership of one's family group who is involved with a religious group necessarily gives rise to the position taken by the participants, that family and church groups are important and in some respects one and the same. The model for church and the way the church and family group are set to serve one another feeds into a shared model of membership and activity. This can be seen in Katherine's account of her family membership of the Salvation Army early in her childhood. To be part of her family was to be part of her extended church family. The call to serve was explicit and had the effect of giving her a sense of self-worth and usefulness. Alongside of that, Janet's account of her mother being involved in Sunday school led her to have the feeling of serving the community as an important and necessary activity. This finding challenges the assumption of secularisation in Britain (Boyd, 2010) being

culturally normative and accepted en masse. Both these narrative accounts point in some way to confirming that the spiritual aspect of their identity mode such as SI, informs the value of groups and how being a member of one can have a positive effect on the emotional welfare of its members and confirms Hay and Nye's (2006) challenge to both Freud and Durkheim's analysis of the effects of religion on the individual. Seeing oneself as part of a group helps to categorise oneself in relation to others and provide a contrast between the group membership and that of others.

In regards to how individuals felt they were viewed from within their staff community Social Comparisons (SCom) were made (Bennett and Sani, 2004, p9). For Katherine, there was a feeling that her explicit membership of a religious group was seen as a private matter by her colleagues and there was a respect for her removal from school communal events which clashed with her private religious obligations. There was a definite separation of her professional and spiritual/religious social groups on this matter but one which she felt was well managed by her and her colleagues. Social Comparison refers to the tendency to evaluate categories constituting the context by comparing them to relevant dimensions. In this respect (SCom) for Katherine showed that her religious membership superseded that of her professional identity. The hierarchical nature of different identities has a tendency to be fluid for the participants. Helen recalls a story of where she made a conscious decision to soften her spiritual identity in spite of her strong identification with this, so as to remain or be seen to remain professionally neutral when administering pastoral care to both pupils and colleagues. Social Categorisation is a useful lens to observe how the participants with SIT negotiate their personal, professional and spiritual selves. When viewed from the lens of the Spirituality at Work (SAW) model it appears that this model is more culturally focussed than that outlined by Hudson (2013). Being part of an in/out group dynamic brings cultural, professional as well as personal agency and lack of. As such the SAW illustrates that within the professional context of teaching in England, one's spirituality is something which is a private matter and not viewed as a professional resource but a private one.

The negotiated space between sacred and profane is well attested to through all of the participants' accounts. What is unique in their encounters however, is the way in which the

sacredness is explicitly acknowledged and the way in which it contributes to personal growth, professional practice and the iterative ways which the participants negotiate their personal and private identities. What the participants' narrative accounts illustrate is an awareness of the ways in which sacredness is a complex social categorisation but one which they use to assert their practice (professional) as set apart and possibly different to that of their colleagues. Knott (in Day et al 2013) asserts that the way in which the sacred and secular have been polarised has over simplified the ways in which these two categorisations are understood contemporarily. Secularisation Theory (Day et al 2003) whilst challenged has informed the ways in which the 'Sacred' has apparently disappeared from within European liberal democracies but has re-established itself in different contexts. The findings confirm this and also establish that the new ways in which sacredness is understood informs professional practice (Gordon, 2011). Toni illustrates this by asserting that the way in which she interprets space as sacred has been inherited in part through her upbringing but is also affirmed by her religio-spiritual dimension. This in turn is reflected in the way she sees it as necessary in giving children time and space to see and understand things for themselves rather than receiving information in a didactic way. The democratizing aspect of Toni's teaching is clearly a space of negotiation between her professional and spiritual identity which allows for sacredness to be identified and defined individually rather than solely the preserve of a recognisably religious influence. Ben Rogers (2004) recognises this in that what the sacred means to individuals must necessarily imply that there is a value given to certain moments, locations and or objects in people's lives. Whilst this may not be likened directly to Durkheim's view of effervescence (cited in Hay and Nye, 2006) the implications are that sacredness in this context is more nuanced and negotiated than the emotions and engagement with the spiritual as outlined in Hay and Nye's analysis of Durkheim's position. The participants, whilst being informed by their own inheritance and current hierarchicalisation of sacredness in their professional and private lives, incorporate opportunities where their pupils can define and place moments of profundity for themselves. In this way, the professional identity of the professionals, has been found to be both informed by what they understand as sacred encounters with their pupils and the desire to provide these moments for their own pupils.

Seeking meaning in the immanent could be one of the ways in which the teachers in the

study recalled elements of the sacred in their professional lives. Understanding sacredness in this way challenges the deep meaning and resonance it has for the teachers, as can be observed in the direct ways it informs their continuing identity formation and spiritual understanding. Charles Taylor (2007) takes a position (which seems to have influenced Boyd, (2010)) asserts that the way contemporary society understands the sacred is that it has moved away from the forum of the traditionally religious or post-Axial age and towards encounters of the profane kind. This position is seen to be tenuous from within the findings as the professional narratives have been directly interpreted by the participants in relation to their religious heritage and in some cases, current religious practice. What has emerged out of the findings is that the religious inheritance and identities which the participants draw on, inform and shape their understanding of the sacred but also, perhaps through an awareness of plurality, influence the teaching methods and relational encounters/relationships with their colleagues and pupils.

Shared among the participants is an acknowledgement of the existence of the phenomenon of Sacredness. Alongside of this is the acknowledgement that Sacredness is important and is something to be valued and where possible shared and foregrounded, particularly with pupils. This has important implications for the ways in which the participants understand their roles as educators. Jane, Toni, and Janet make very clear the sacred encounters they have had whilst teaching and how these have influenced their classroom practice. The findings would assert that Sacredness is recognised by the teachers taking part, by drawing on or recalling aspects of their religious heritage whilst recognising the possibility that the Sacred is an individual value judgement, which may or may not take place or be informed by Religion. Inherent in this is the finding that individualism is a shared value between all of the teachers and the ways in which they allow for pupils to develop their individual sense of the sacred depends on the pedagogical tools they employ. Emerging out of the findings is a sense that recognising the Sacred bridges the gap between the religious and the profane. Teachers developing a pedagogy of individualised reflectiveness is evident from within the accounts, which attempt to develop the spiritual and sacred potential of the pupil and classroom encounter by allowing the individual participant's spiritual narrative to inform the process.

Responses to the Sacred aspect of the teaching encounter vary among the participants from explicit opportunities for children to have time to reflect upon and situate themselves within a phenomenon or relationship forms a central feature of Toni's understanding of teaching. Alongside of this, an awareness of the impact the interpersonal relationship between teacher and pupil is also observable from all the other participants. How these teaching opportunities are fostered vary from the formal planning for these encounters to take place, as in Katherine's account of giving thanks, to opportunistic moments such as Janet's seeking to recognise the personhood of one of the pupils under her tutelage and the development of their sense of self-worth.

What is shared amongst the participants and is evident within the findings is a pedagogy which is centred upon the relationships between the teacher and pupil as well as between colleagues. Unique to this study however, is the way in which it has been found that the power dynamics and democratization of the teaching and learning encounter is a central aspect where all the participants express and interpret their spirituality.

Power relations sought to be reconceptualised by the participants but by forming relationships which challenged a hierarchical model and based on a sense equity and of mentoring and guidance. Seeking to redress the balance between the role of teacher and pupil was a central concern for all participants and this was sought to be addressed through the teaching and learning encounter. The examples in the preceding paragraph seem to challenge Bernstein's (2000) concept of pedagogy, identity and control which is based on power relations and the acknowledgement of differing and hierarchical roles in the process of pedagogical enactment. For Bernstein, the necessity to acknowledge 'expert' and 'learner' as constituent parts of the whole educational encounter is foregrounded in his pedagogy of identity and power balances. Contrary to Bernstein's pedagogical model the findings foreground the explicit acknowledgement by the participants of the role of teacher as an active respondent who involves the pupil in developing themselves holistically. This is a central concern and an explicit expression of spirituality as articulated in the professional encounter. This challenges the pedagogical model of Bernstein in that power relations were actively negated or at least a pedagogical model was put in place by the participants which sought to neutralise the power dynamic from hierarchical and towards one of a shared encounter. Both the control element of the learning taking place within the

school environment and the power relationship was actively neutralised where appropriate by the participants. Where this is most evident within the narrative accounts is whereby all of the participants draw on their spirituality as a tool from, which they provide encounters for children to experience learning and profundity whilst not explicitly signposting the participant's individual spiritual and religious background. Using their own spiritual and religious resources, the participants recognised the possibility of influencing their pupils through their own spiritual identities but sought to avoid confessional teaching. The focus on mentoring and providing opportunities for pupils to grow as individuals, choosing their own spiritual expression was central to the participants' identities as teachers who are engaged with a spiritual dialogue which challenges power relations in favour of relationships.

The motivation behind seeking to develop the whole child is not unique to the teachers taking part in this research but what seems to be emerging from the findings is the ways in which the teachers' own religious backgrounds and spiritual tools are acknowledged as a resource and one which should be fostered. It is the agency of the pupils that is acknowledged and it is expected for them to draw on and/or develop that should they wish to. Differing from what may be thought of as a traditional 'Vocation' which has been traditionally understood as emerging from within a 'recognised' Christian tradition, most of the participants acknowledge the humanistic aspect of the spiritual drive and whilst acknowledging their own inheritance, in no way seem to assume this of the pupils with which they work.

Moran and Craft's study (2011) whilst focused on university educators in the United States found that educators who came from a religious background and acknowledged this as part of their identity, seemed more motivated to develop their students as whole persons rather than simply attending to their development intellectually or academically. While this is questionable as the study took place within a religious university and one could assume that this might draw particular educators to it in the context of the United States, it does however parallel the findings in ways which draws links between educator's identities and their motivations within the professional context outside of the singularly academic (Beach, 2015). Identity and motivations arising out of the interplay between the

professional and spiritual identities of the participants is essential to understanding the teachers in the study and their expressions of spiritual/professional identity and challenges the findings of Chater (2005) which found that established educators were more likely to focus on the practical rather than aspirational view of their professional ideals.

The motivations of the teachers to develop their students by drawing on their spiritual identities challenges the ways in which identity or identities has been understood by referencing 'Vocation' within dialogues concerning religion and education. The concept of 'vocation' as uncovered in the findings points towards a deeper understanding of the role of teacher as educator and participant in a social enterprise. It is more politicised than the definitions provided by Cooling (2008) and Palmer (2003). However, it is suggested that the ways in which their spirituality is expressed through the teaching of the participants is deeply motivated through a sense of social action. All participants seek to develop their pupils so that they can take active and informed roles in society and to draw on their own assets to achieve this. This larger narrative (Social Action) uniting all of the participants brings together all aspects of their identities into a coherent narrative of empowerment and response. This shares many parallels with Intersectionality. In this way identity is not understood as being made up of discreet identities within an individual but is borne out of a project, it is not a theoretical understanding of identity but one of action and project. Jones et al (2011) notes four aspects of Intersectionality which pertains to teaching from an Intersectional perspective that is evident in the findings arising out of the participants' accounts of their motivation to teach: Centering the experience of people (pupils), Complicating Identity, Unveiling Power Relations and Promoting Social Justice (Jones et al, 2011, p13). There is a clear link which has emerged between the expression of spirituality in teaching and the way in which the teacher's identities have been expressed through a grander social narrative of democratization and Social Action. As such the link between Intersectionality and teachers' spiritual identity and expressions of it has been found.

### Relationships as central to understanding and formation

The interplay between the working relationships the participants had between themselves and their colleagues and those with their pupils illustrate the ways in which relationships are understood as important. Throughout the accounts given by the participants there is an

awareness that to foster and maintain good relationships this must be done in an active but also reflective way. Allowing oneself to enter into the perspective of the other in order to attempt to understand their story and motivations were a theme which ran throughout the participant's accounts. This was often situated in the context of a spiritual impulse to help others. Again, social action and an awareness of addressing imbalances in relationships or to some extent the wider community also featured. What was common to most of the participants was an acknowledgement of the numinous influence or focal point for these motivations (Kose and Lim, 2010).

# **Spiritual Aspects of Relationships**

Attempting to address social imbalance is a key motivation for all of the participants. How they understood this in relation to their spirituality varied but what was common to all of the participants was an awareness of providing an opportunity for the children they work with to be able to understand and develop ways in which they could be proactive members of society and aware of their possibilities as people in it. Understanding their role in this way provided an opportunity for the participants to situate their professional within a pastoral framework (Crowder, 2013) which embraces and exceeds but does not challenge the Teacher's Standards (2013). The desire to relieve suffering, injustice and inequality in the classroom, to be an advocate for the children in their class and as an ambassador for their faith in some instances were grounded in the fostering and maintenance of positive relationships.

Many examples have been given by the participants which illustrate the importance of the relationships they have with children and colleagues. What is evident within these is an awareness of the nature of giving of oneself in order to actualise this. Recognising one's own gifts and attributes and allowing these to be used by and for others is a central concern. For Katherine this was evident in her willingness to take children beyond a literal understanding of the world through the curriculum but to provide opportunities for her pupils to engage at a deeper and perhaps symbolic level. 'Her Self-Communication involves a donation of one's personal gifts and resources in order to meet the need in the other' (Pembroke, p12, 2004). This approach, according to Pembroke (2004), constitutes

'Agapic love' the giving of oneself in the service of others. In order to be able to do this, the participants had to place themselves in the position of those in which they worked alongside in order to meet their needs. The inspiration, ability and personal qualities needed to engage with teaching in this way exceeds those provided through professional training and are deep, personal and resonant. As such, the relationship between SMSC and the educator's ability to explore spirituality in order to enrich the lives of pupils is problematic, not only because of the lack of clarity in regards how this is to be observed (Ofsted, 2014, p37) but also because negotiated opportunities from which to engage in this are not clearly defined. To understand the perspectival nature of other's experiences a willingness to imaginatively enter into the domain of others in order to meet their needs or develop their potential is established. The aspiration to actualise the potential of others by the participants is rooted (on an individual basis) in their understanding of the relationship dynamic between themselves and their pupils and/or colleagues. By giving of oneself in this way, it could be established that hierarchy is challenged as entering into the perspective of others it is necessary to be in relational equilibrium rather than a concept of professional hierarchy.

The concept of a two-way power dynamic is an area which Martin Buber (1947) examines. The ways in which the teachers in this research consistently sought to negate or reexamine the power dynamic assumed in their profession prompted by a desire to foster individuals as people alongside the educational project. This two-way negation or a Buber frames it, 'Mutuality-both, being mutually engaged in the encounter' (Buber, 1947, p 21). The true mutuality which these participants strive for in their relationships with whom they are engaged is one which the professional hierarchy is renegotiated on the part of the participant. Again Buber sees this as not an empathetic project but one of friendship as for him empathy is seen as removing oneself from the situation in order to understand the other. What is closer to the accounts given by the participants of their professional encounters is the concept of inclusion (Buber, 1947), inclusion (or the ideal of it) is the dual positioning for the benefit of other. Arising out of this position is the contention that the participants are implicitly engaged in an acknowledgement of their own professional status as the accounts given demonstrate that for the majority of time, this 'mutuality' is only acknowledged on the part of the participant and not made explicit to the pupil or colleague in the encounter. There are many instances where participants refer to this

tension in explicitly citing their beliefs/faith and the tension this holds in the professional (and power dynamic) of the encounter. In this way, while Buber's 'mutuality-both' might be the ideal for the participants, the reality is one where the ideal is negotiated due to the professional constraints and dynamics inherent in the teacher-to-pupil or the colleague-to-collegue encounter.

Janet is very aware of this aspect of her teaching, for her the teaching and working alongside pupils in order to help them understand the interrelated ways in which they are part of the wider world or society necessarily prompted her to illustrate with examples from her own experiences. Sharing her narrative and the giving of herself in this personal way made her responsible for the development of the other through an inclusive relationship.

Developing this further there is evidence, from within the participants' accounts, of the acknowledgement that to fully work alongside and with others that a perspectival shift is imperative. To varying degrees each participant negotiates this process in their own unique and creative way. Through an acknowledgement of the spiritual aspect of their teaching and professionalism the individual responses reflect a creativity and dynamism based on the interaction with the individuals and environments in which they teach through an integrated knowledge of these aspects. One could argue (from the participants' accounts) that there is a realization that in order to 'know' the other person in order to engage in a positive relationship with them leading to a sense of worth in the other, that an awareness of oneself and what attributes and personality traits one brings is necessary. This selfawareness and analysis can also be the way in which a spiritual encounter is realized. By understanding who they are as people and professionals the participants are empowered to give of themselves and from this grow spiritually and interpersonally. The negation of their egos towards a realization of self and others in the relationship is manifest. This dynamic has also been noted by Wright and Sayre-Adams (2000) in regards to the relationships encountered in health care. What is different in the experiences given in the study is the ways in which this self-giving of oneself is part of an overall social project for the majority of the teachers taking part. This is not in opposition to those examined by Wright and Sayre-Adams but it more explicit in the teacher's actions and personal

testimonies.

Both Helen and Toni recall instances where there is an active giving of oneself in order to bring about change in others. For Katherine, the way in which she recalled making herself vulnerable to another member of staff through sharing her faith perspective imposed on her a need to understand how someone might interpret her actions. This led to her having an appreciation of how her faith can be understood as an identity marker and as a tool to assist in fostering others. Toni examines how her faith has allowed her to reflect upon ways her spirituality has been a vehicle from which she understands the worked but importantly for her pupils she acknowledges the personal nature of her response but is eager to find ways in which personal responses can be scaffolded through her foregrounding of the environment in particular.

While this might be interpreted as an idealised view of what relationships are like there is an awareness from the participants that to give of themselves and forego their ego (Wright and Sayre-Adams, 2000, p58) does not necessarily lead to positive responses. Janet made this most clear when recalling how when engaged in planning activities with teachers this can be a source of conflict. Making children aware that relationships are to be built and can be a source of discomfort is an area where spirituality can reflect the reality that confronts them. Imperfection and the reality of relationships as opposed to the idealized form allows the teachers to illustrate ways in which spiritual tools as well as practical life skills take time to be mastered. Again, the agential imperative is strived for by the teachers as the aspiration of developing wisdom in children from which they can learn to reflect and interact on their situation is evident.

Situating their professional lives through an awareness of the presence of spirituality within themselves and others has allowed the teachers taking part to interpret the spiritual aspect of their profession. Finding coherence in their professional lives through the interaction and privileging of others is one way in which the spiritual dimension of living helps identify meaning and coherence (Hasselkus, 2002, p102). This meaning making process engenders the inner life affecting the outer life or the personal world interacting

with the public world. In such a process it is evident that applying spirituality as a narrative and also as a resource assists the teachers in using their occupation as a vehicle for personal and spiritual exploration (Hasselkus, 2002).

Both Wright and Sayer Adams (2000) and Hasselkus (2002) challenge the view expressed by Hogan (2009) in that rather than spirituality being perspective ego free as Hogan suggests. The spirituality expressed by the participants originates in part due to a self-awareness of their egos as well as a synthesis of spiritual and professional identities which exists to bring about change in 'other' and 'community'. A new definition of the spiritual is apparent as the practitioners are centred in their professional lives but informed in part by their spirituality. The result is that change is sought for the betterment of other rather than a self-focussed spirituality.

From the many accounts given by the participants it is clear that the valuing of relationships is central to their practice and is given context through their understanding of their personal spiritual lives. How this becomes manifest in the classroom is situationally dependent and from Katherine and Janet's accounts a great deal of reflection is carried out which their spirituality, profession and aspirations for their pupils all interact to inform their pedagogical approaches to form a grand pedagogy or philosophy of practice. This relational pedagogy is built upon the sound relationships that the practitioners have with the children who they work alongside. What is interesting to note is that the ways in which the participants approach their work with children explicitly takes into account the environmental factors in school as well as being aware of the children's home environments. It is through a thorough awareness of the children and their families that the participants seek to provide the pupils with the agency to become reflective individuals and independent learners. Using their expertise in this way this relational pedagogy has shown from the accounts that there is a professional awareness amongst the practitioners which uses the specialist knowledge they have acquired through their work to acknowledge the ways in which the environments in which the children come from and where they learn effects the children's physical, mental and spiritual development. What makes the participants different to specialists in other fields and possibly educators in general is that they see this through the lens of spiritual well-being. Research has shown

that the human child's system is really held together by the language of love (Gopnik in Johnson, 2010). Being an effective practitioner the skills of listening and empathy and central but alongside of this, and perhaps from the accounts more importantly, is the focus on building and maintaining positive relationships. Where the participants clearly illustrate this but differ from the more general statement given by Johnson is that they situate these positive relationships within the spiritual as well as the professional realm. In so doing, the value and dignity of each child is endowed with a picture of personhood at odds with a superficial, fact based approach to education (Palmer, 2003).

The teacher as partner in learning and working is an aspect which could be interpreted from the accounts given. Where the participants recall events between themselves and colleagues there is a foregrounding of the ways in which their spirituality is either muted, negotiated or enacted. Helen, gives several accounts of the ways in which she reflected upon her spirituality in relation to all three scenarios. Where learning is the task at hand, all the participants refer to being active alongside of that process with the children rather than directing their learning from a didactic pedagogical model. It would seem from the findings that this is a way in which their spirituality informs their professional choices having been inspired by the social project of realizing the potential as individuals in their pupils. This awareness comes from the reflectiveness developed both as a teacher but more substantially as an awareness of the spiritual component. Being aware of the children as learners is common to all of the accounts. The findings suggest that this awareness is inspired by the spiritual drive. To see each learner as individuals with their own potentiality is a manifestation of the aspiration of equality and empowerment from each of the participants. Zachery (2000) notes that where teaching and learning is framed in such a way that the power dynamics are implicitly and explicitly muted. Doing so, articulates the negation of power structures and through guidance empowers the learners to develop independence and agency in their learning and development. Again, being able to achieve this, the findings have shown to be a highly complex and interpersonally involved project. The professional skills needed coupled with the reflective and social awareness through an engagement with their own spirituality indicates that to be active in this learning and teaching approach requires a deep involvement from the participants towards the personal lives of their pupils and their family situations.

These findings challenge group psychology theories surrounding the ways in which teachers gravitate towards certain individuals in their work environments. According to Aronson et al (2007) propinquity plays a role in the ways in which individuals respond towards one another, that is to say that individuals will be drawn towards establishing more harmonious and positive relationships with individuals which they are compatible with. The accounts given by the participants show that their spiritually informed practice allows them to see beyond an individual's superficial characteristics and towards a deeper and more rounded, nuanced and sympathetic profile of the person. It would seem that an element of social action and response is one way in which this is aspired towards. Seeing beyond the individual in the classroom and workplace and towards an understanding of who they are, why that is and how the participants can contribute towards their potential is interwoven with many of the narratives. One of the ways this is achieved is the constant reflection-action cycle which the participants acknowledge as an aspect of their spiritualprofessional selves. Being able to see self in context, it would seem, has developed the ability to look for over-arching narratives and personal ecologies of the individuals in which they are professionally engaged.

The ways in which the teachers involved in the study demonstrated their implicit awareness of their own relational pedagogy is how these pedagogical concepts in particular move beyond the curriculum and into deeper learning. Both the environment, the physical nature of the pupils and the ways in which individuals and their personal ecology are all interrelated emerged as ways in which teachers sought to expand children's learning and reflection. For Jane the way in which she describes how fostering care for others and the environment in her pupils exhibited a desire to assist children in developing their own thinking and reflective skills in order to appreciate their place in society and the physical world and being sympathetic and appreciative of it. From a phenomenological perspective the physical interaction (as scaffolded by Jane) between child and environment shapes and affirms the sense of selfhood in the individual through a constant reaffirmation and creation of the self. It could be posited that this is from what Whitehead (2010) describes as a 'Monist' perspective which advocates the holistic nature of all human experience.

Katherine made very clear that her teaching was greatly influenced by the desire to assist

pupils in seeing themselves as more than just isolated individuals but as part of a greater communal and environmental community. Seeking meaning beyond the curriculum by fostering an awareness of deeper meaning and nuance were key to her teaching practice as influenced from her own spiritual reflections. Seeking and making connections in this way has close links to the sustainability literature. Scoffham (2016) posits that a key aspect of what it means to be human is linked with the numinous. To be human, according to Scoffham (2016), is to act sustainably and to seek connections with others and the environment. Taking this further and drawing from Katherine's account, it is to acknowledge a deeper purpose and to make sense of who we are by making connections with those around us which also involves reflection and making sense of ourselves. Through analysis of a sustainability paradigm the findings suggest that making connections between self and environment is part of the spiritual aspect of learning, if supported and developed by reflective pedagogy. One issue with this is that the way in which spirituality is felt or experiences lies outside the realm of academic development within schools. The apparent dichotomy between tacit knowledge and propositional knowledge is negotiated by the teachers. This is an area within sustainability studies which is being engaged with positively and may provide a forum for making explicit activities designed to encourage the spiritual in the mainstream classroom by interpreting aspects of the curriculum in a way which is sensitive to a monist approach. There is a need for educators to go beyond cataloguing place and moving towards a feeling of place. While this is an area which seems coherent when examining what it means to be spiritual and connected with 'other' whether that is another individual or the environment as a whole, there is a tension whether this is an aspect of the educative process which is achievable given the professional skills and attributes of the teachers involved. From the points of view of the participants as posited through their reflections it is evident that the spiritual, personal and interpersonal development of their pupils is of extreme importance but it is problematic in that it is an area which is not easily defined, or reliably observable by others. While the meanings attributed to events and reflected upon by teachers are powerful and transformative it is clear that these skills cannot be taught but can only be modelled. This crafting of a knowledge or skill is one which is matured through an accumulation of reflection leading to the development of wisdom (Black-Hawkins and Florian, 2012, p569).

Seeking to develop relationships between themselves and their pupils and colleagues is situated in the context of relational pedagogy. As pupils are developed through the nurturing of reflective and analytical skills each individual is empowered to apply these skills to their own situation. There is an awareness that this empowerment should, with time, lead to a greater sense of independence and self-esteem on the part of pupils. From the accounts given, it would seem that the social action aspect of relationships is common to the participants. Fostering a sense of self-worth and empowerment goes beyond the experiential and moves towards the actualization of individual within society and environment.

# Teaching and learning as a shared encounter through mentoring

Mentoring has been identified as one of the themes which brings into a coherent narrative the ways in which the participants conceptualise the relationships they have between the children they teach and their colleagues. In this sense, mentoring has been conceptualised as the implicit ways in which the participants express their spirituality through the various teaching and professional encounters with staff which, they feel, expresses their spirituality, fosters growth and positive outcomes over time (Mullen cited in Fletcher and Mullen, 2012, pp8-9, 14). From the accounts explored above, it is evident that these encounters typically are not made explicit, spirituality or faith is not an overt narrative but through the participants' behaviours, exemplars and professional approaches a recognition of aspects of character which are manifested through a mentoring approach become evident. This holds some parallels to De Klerk-Luttig's assessment that teaching without some awareness of the spiritual can manifest itself as being performative rather than enriching in nature. Areas where teachers have reflected upon their roles as educators exceed those of the standards expected of them with a view of enlivening the teaching and learning encounter (De Kelerk-Luttig, 2008, pp508-513). Examining the effectiveness of these assumptions professed by the participants will assist in understanding if, as is clear from the findings, a non-explicit approach is effective in being identified as a mentor by pupils and staff or whether the teachers' hopes for a more socially engaged pupil community is fostered.

The importance placed by the participants in the ways in which children should be supported to be independent and active learners and participants in their community could

be observed through several examples they provided. The link between how children are supported in their learning and the ways in which it was assumed this would impact their perception of self and others was consistent throughout all of the narratives. How the teaching and learning relationship was expressed had socio-political implications for the participants. The ways in which the participants' understanding of their individual spiritualities assisted in this enterprise and provided the participants with a way, appropriate to their professional context, to express their spirituality. This was most often expressed by a teaching approach which could be termed as that of mentoring. What has emerged out of the findings however, is the assumptions made by the participants for this being an effective tool to foster change in individuals and society is one which is not unproblematic.

Mentoring through active modelling is not something that is made explicit to children. The professional-religious nexus counts for this in part. The participants have consistently stated their wish to not influence their pupils by their spirituality as this complicates the relationship between their personal and professional selves. Alongside of this, the professional implications of failing to meet the required standards of professional conduct through adherence to the Teaching Standards (DfE, 2013) may have negative ramifications for those involved. How the teachers recounted the ways in which they mentored the children through allowing them to take ownership of their own learning varied according to their own professional context. What was consistent throughout was that each individual's approach was not made evident to the pupils. That is to say, they provided opportunities for pupils to have agency over their classroom activities but stopped short in making clear why this was or why their approach might be considered personal to them (Zimmerman, 2014).

Both Toni and Helen allowed for pupils to engage with the learning for themselves but, from their accounts, did not consider why they should have foregrounded this more openly. The issue arising out of this is whether the children would have been able to identify this as a positive aspect of teaching or the teacher-pupil relationship, in order to recognise as a positive feature of their teacher's approach. Failing to observe these behaviours challenges the assumptions made by Toni and Helen of their pupils that this signposts them as mentors or positive role models. Bandura's Social Learning Theory cited in (Wouter, 2013) suggests that learning takes place through observation in the social setting. If the participants fail to make clear the decisions they make or the materials and

lessons they are presenting and the reasons for this, it could be assumed that the pupils will simply carry out the task as set by the teacher. Failing to explore the moral or spiritual aspect of the teaching and learning encounter in an explicit way would suggest that this aspect of the encounter is not present for the pupils taking part. The benefit of interpreting themselves as mentors, gently modelling desirable spiritual aspects through a conscious referencing of their spiritual-religious identities clearly benefits the self-perception of the participants. This is a positive outcome for their sense of self-esteem and wellbeing but challenges the assumed outcomes of fostering empowerment and socially active pupils.

Wouter's (2013, p30) examination of the way in which teachers mentor students and are recognised as mentors and role models challenges some of the assumptions made by the participants, when recalling aspects of their teaching which their spirituality was reflected in, the activities they provided children with in order for learning and development to take place. The participants made it clear that the decisions they made were conscious of and took into account their view of themselves as teacher and the ways in which they saw that relationship with pupils. Allowing their behaviour to exhibit the positive aspects which they wanted to mentor to their pupils in was conceptualised through a referencing of their spirituality. That is to say, their spirituality and/or faith informed the professional choices manifested in the teaching context. There was an active engagement with their spirituality which informed the message embedded in the teaching and learning activity. Wouter's analysis of a range of studies carried out globally on whether students identify teachers as exhibiting characteristics illustrative of a role model or mentor found that teachers did not make conscious decisions on what material they thought would develop students morally. From this, it could be extrapolated that these encounters were unplanned and spontaneous. This is challenged by the findings in this study.

The teachers were conscious of and proactive in constructing encounters which would develop pupils, this was done in part by a spiritual and special imperative arising out of their spiritual lives. Where Wouter's study and the findings correlate is in the recognition that the mentoring aspect of teaching is somewhat different pedagogically in that it sits alongside of a pedagogical model of teaching. This enhances the student experience by allowing for individuals to engage with learning in a way which is developmentally more holistic and exceeds the intellectual and academic focus. Whilst being aware of the opportunities they were creating for the pupils, the participants facilitated learning and cooperative encounters which they believed developed pupils capacity to grow as

reflective and active individuals, through an approach to mentoring which saw the pupil as a partner in the interaction (Flannery-Quinn et al, 2011). The possible inspiration for this way of interpreting the teacher-pupil relationship seems to be informed by their spiritual conception of personhood and the sacredness of the individual. However, these encounters were constructed and interpreted by the participants in this way, while the pupils were unaware of the lens from which the teacher visualised the encounter.

The positive characteristics and behaviours which the teachers engendered and hoped that the pupils would intuitively perceive could be viewed as the positive attributes expressed by Aristotle (Wouter, p35, 2013). Aristotelian habituation, whereby the participants enacted positive aspects of personhood with the hope that individuals would reflect these aspects through prolonged engagement with activities to support their development, is evident in the accounts given by Toni, Helen and Katherine. Rather than making it plain and explicit, through an emulation approach, which would allow for the active questioning of why these traits are positive seems to challenge the conceptualisation of the mentorpupil-teacher relationship espoused by the participants. The findings conclude that modelling these behaviours rather than making them explicit is manifested because of the issues around the integration of the professional and private/religio-spiritual identities and attributes of the participants and challenges the account given by Radford (2006) in regards to the separation of personal and spiritual attributes as interpreted from Plato. This does not detract from the projects of the participants to cede control and challenge hierarchy in their teaching by adopting a mentoring approach but is a negotiation of the spiritual and professional identities of the teachers as such the psyche and nous as separate components s shown to be more integrated than those explored by Plato (ibid).

Katherine, Jane and Janet all spoke passionately about the way they felt that education had become about producing children who would go on to be productive workers. This was something, which all of them identified as a negative aspect of the current educational landscape and in part prompted the way in which they defined their role as something beyond simply being a facilitator of academic learning. Increased focus on the core subjects of English, Mathematics and Science in the curriculum was identified as having a negative impact on the holistic development of the child. This was recounted several times by all of the participants in various ways and throughout their narrative accounts. Identifying themselves as individuals challenging this trend assisted in the participants redefining their role through referencing their spiritual lives.

Challenging the perceived narrow prescription of effective teaching outlined in the Teaching Standards (DFE 2013) and the National Curriculum (Department for Education 2013) the participants sought to exceed the requirements in both documents to develop the spirituality and moral fibre of their pupils. The accounts given indicate that the ways in which this was outlined in both documents exhibited a narrow and superficial engagement with these aspects of the children under their tutelage. The teachers taking part in the study sought to redress the academic-spiritual imbalance, as they perceived it, through an approach to teaching which levelled the hierarchy between teacher and pupil and manifested itself in a way similar to that of mentor and mentee. The ways in which moral education and development of children is envisioned through the Teaching Standards and National Curriculum are open to interpretation about the paradigm through which they should be interpreted and enacted. The assumption made by the participants was that without a context, the ways in which children are developed would be without an overarching narrative or perspective from which the children could refer to. For the participants, drawing on their spirituality provided a context from which they could provide opportunities for pupils to develop a critical moral aptitude from which to interpret their unique lived experiences and assist in critiquing and reflective engagement of the communities which they are part of.

Rather than present moral, ethical dilemmas through a secular lens the participants sought to give meaning and context to questions of morality and profundity by presenting opportunities for children to engage with these on an individual basis with time for reflectiveness incorporated. This was demonstrated by Katherine's use of posing questions where pupils could be thankful and recognise aspects of their lives which they felt privileged to possess. Toni also recalled areas where she developed pupils' appreciation of their context by exposing them to learning outside of the classroom environment which they could then relate to by drawing parallels and contrasts that of their lives outside of the school setting. This approach challenges what is outlined in the Teachers' Standards (2013) and the National Curriculum (2013) which presents the teaching of reflectiveness as part of morality in a way which is without a cultural or religious narrative. This implies that teachers should use these documents to construct opportunities for children which are fabricated and seeks to find ambiguous links between the life of the school and questions of morality and deep learning.

By providing opportunities for children to explore morality through a mentoring approach

where these qualities are demonstrated consistently albeit implicitly demonstrated, the participants are mentoring the pupils to become engaged in reflection and criticality as demonstrated by them. Again, the impetus for this seems to position itself at the personal position of spirituality and this is expressed through a delicate negotiation of the spiritual and professional identity of the participants. Whitehead (2010) outlines a similar approach (and issues) from the perspective of Physical Education where teachers are prompted to find links between playing fair and allowing for a forum which the virtue of honesty can be reflected on by the pupils. Whitehead's observations are similar to the pedagogy of Concept Cracking but is a secularized/faith free parallel to it (Cooling, pp 153-169, 2000 in Grimmitt, 2002). It could be postulated that while Concept Cracking as a discreet (religiously rooted) pedagogy provides a context from which the educator can position themselves, it may be that these two approaches are explicitly similar with the perspectival nature and values differing because of the educator's positioning. In Whitehead's study it is acknowledged that without first establishing positive relationships with pupils that acknowledge their individuality and uniqueness, fabricated encounters such at the one she outlines become meaningless and void of legitimacy.

Issues arising out of an implicit mentoring of pupils is that pupils may fail to observe the behaviours and messages which the participants identify as valuable and would lead to their holistic development. Addressing this through a formal approach to mentoring might assist in aiding the participants in having encounters which are verifiable. Making formal the mentoring message through an engagement with an identification of a key concept or lesson which the participants wish to engage the pupils with. Making this clear to pupils and perhaps linking this to an appropriate narrative establishes the possibility that pupils will be able to easily engage with the encounter without the aspiration of meaning and understanding being achieved by individual pupils. Satanulis and Weaver (p137, 1998) suggest that for mentoring to be effective, time and space should be set aside with clear goals and milestones established in order for the mentoring relationship to be fruitful. This is a markedly different conception of mentoring to that outlined by the participants whereby it was hoped that pupils would intuit the value of a learning encounter devised by the teacher. One issue arising out of this approach however which is challenged by the participants' approach and their understanding of the primacy of the whole child is that the Satanulis and Weaver conception of mentoring assumes a hierarchy of relationship whereas through the lens of spirituality the participants identify themselves as companions with their pupils and consistently sought to negate or level the hierarchy assumed in the pupil-teacher relationship.

Addressing the current educational climate towards a subject and knowledge based curriculum which places demands on time and what is to be presented to children is a common theme in the interviews. For Janet in particular she makes clear that to develop children fully, the current educational culture of producing results detracts from what she perceives as the educational project of developing children fully. This is a highly political stance borne out of her spiritual engagement and which also provides a context from which she seeks to enable children to positively develop their opportunities. This political imperative developed out of a spiritual narrative could be understood as transformational as it seeks to develop in pupils aspects of resilience and character. Resilience and adaptability in order for pupils to critically assess their situation is hoped to develop agency in the pupils. An approach such as this closely parallels that of critical theoretical approach in that as a transformative paradigm of teaching based on shared relationship (mentor-companion) rather than hierarchical relationship (teacher-pupil) promotes ethical behaviours through the mentoring of individuals to recognise aspects of human rights and social justice. Inherent in a mentoring and transformative approach to education is the assumption that education, as a social project, needs reform.

Implied within the accounts given by the participants is for a curriculum which fosters spiritual development to be constructed rather than the necessity of creating contexts for spiritual growth out of a solely academic framework. Critical Theory as a paradigm for developing a critical and reflective transformative pedagogy assists in understanding the ways in which the participants construct a pedagogy inspired by spirituality and engaged in the project of social action. Through the mentoring of spiritual competencies, the participants model ways in which their pupils can be become empowered.

### Spirituality as a contextual resource

The ability and awareness of the ways in which one's spirituality can inform and form the basis of how one contextualises the intersection between professional and private spheres is central to the project of teaching for the practitioners. The complex nature of this process is recounted in numerous ways and provides examples from which the

spiritual/professional nexus is negotiated with the aim of social and personal transformation as a prime concern. Ways in which one's spirituality has been negotiated and adapted to fit within the professional context illustrates the creative ways in which this central aspect of personhood remains integral to the teaching project but is also challenged by the professional context and constraints. The vicarious role of religion (Hemming, 2011) in the current social and some educational contexts would suggest that the findings point towards religion and spirituality as being a distraction from the educational enterprise for the participants. Rather than being considered as a legitimate aspect of the cultural and professional landscape, expressions of a religious or spiritual nature are muted. The accounts given by the participants recall explicit and implicit instances in which this aspect of the self has been challenged and occasionally muted so as to adapt to the constraints of the environment (Warden, 2007) and challenges the positive role ascribed to vicarious religion (Hemming, 2011). Alongside of this, there are instances where one's spirituality has been used as a way of forming coalitions between the environment, professional and pupil relationships. What is evident and common to all of the accounts is the way in which the teaching encounter is politicised. The project arising out of this is transformation through the complex contestation between the social role of the teacher, the pedagogies enacted and the foregrounded acknowledgement of the spiritual identities of the participants. As such the forum of spiritual identity/expression and professional identity/practice is negotiated through an intersectional analysis.

## Intersectionality as an analytical tool

Intersectionality can be defined as the intersection between two or more aspects of self in which problems arise between the individual and other (Crenshaw TED Talk, 2016). The ability of the individuals taking part in the study to express (openly) their spirituality and to draw on it as a resource has been contested when attempted in the professional contexts in which they practise. Taken on its own, one could assume that due to legislation and the Teachers' Standards (DfE, 2011) the acknowledgement of one's religious identity is upheld. However the accounts given by the participants demonstrate that the possibility of open articulation of one's spirituality must be negotiated in ways which are professionally/communally negotiated and which may not be an authentic expression from the perspectives of the participants. The complex nature which underpins the professional

and spiritual identity of the participants provides some explanation for this but when examined the complexity of this negotiation emerges. Intersectionality as a theory of identity and as a research methodology allows for this complexity to emerge. The ways in which spirituality as a resource is negotiated differs between participants but what is common is the struggle between the individual and the professional community, or their assumptions surrounding it.

Intersectionality as an analytical tool provides a lens for understanding the multiple frames which people inhabit and how one or more of these frames combine to shed light on the ways in which one's situation is negotiated (Hill-Collins and Bilge, 2016). Identity markers when examined discreetly or atomised does not provide a robust contextual frame from which to examine how one's identity(ies) are expressed, upheld or contested. Spirituality as one of these frames, and as a contextual resource which the participants draw on to inform and understand their professional practice, must be examined alongside the contextual landscape in which it is situated. Adopting an Intersectional analysis assists by uncovering interpersonal domains of power and highlights the multiple nature of one's identity and how the varying identity frames empowers or disempowers individuals.

One's spirituality and the expression of this through either a formal religious practice and membership or an informal individualised mode are areas which are deemed as problematic in the professional public service sphere in the UK (Woodhead and Catto, 2012). As an aspect of self which is constrained through social or professional pressures one's spiritual/religious identity may be muted so as to be seen as enacting an assumed professional position. Denial of one's identity is a central concern to an Intersectional analysis. Intersectionality has emerged out of minority studies in the U.S and more specifically out of African American Feminist concerns, (Hancock, 2016). Using an Intersectional analysis allowed for the identification of one or more axis of one's identity to locate areas where problematic issues abound and where one's agency and freedom of expression was hampered. In this way an Intersectional approach to the ways in which the participants drew on their spirituality as a contextual resource which, they felt, provided a context for their teaching encounters allows one to understand their professional lives as a spiritual encounter which assists in drawing out the complexity of situating one's personal, professional and spiritual beliefs in the educative process. Identifying one-self as spiritual/religious and foregrounding this in the professional space is a minority position even when examined in the context of the majority of faith schools in England. Standing

outside of the homogeneous characteristics of individuals assumed to be present in a given context is a central project of Intersectional analysis (Hancock, 2016). The teachers taking part in this study all exhibited a hesitance to foreground their spirituality when acting in the professional space. Helen recounts how changing schools left her with feelings of regret as she felt she had not lived authentically and asserted that this was something she would not wish to happen in her future career. Understanding the context of minorities through an Intersectional analysis has resulted in an understanding of the ways in which drawing on one's spirituality as a contextual resource is problematised in the professional realm.

Intersectionality and Education have a shared history and concern with social justice (Hill-Collins and Bilge, 2016). This has also been evident in the findings thus far, the participants see their spirituality and their role as educators as inextricably linked. The ways in which this experience is complicated can be understood through the filters which Intersectional analysis provides: Power, Relationality, Social context, Social Justice and Complexity. The findings have uncovered a picture where one's spirituality as a contextual resource is negotiated through the teaching and professional choices the participants make and have made. The interpretation of this is that the participants draw on their spirituality to provide a grand narrative from which they see their role as educators and the personal and societal project they feel they are involved in.

Ways in which individuals have drawn on their spirituality to see the links between themselves and others and to provide a context for understanding is embedded in the findings. Janet and Jane both recall how forging relationships with staff and pupils and finding common, shared concerns empowered them. These shared concerns and projects can be understood as 'coalitions' (Carasthatis, 2016). Coalitions draw together individuals who might seem to have no shared characteristics but through reflection relationships between individuals are brought to the surface. Rather than isolating individuals with their concerns the ways in which the individuals used their spirituality as a context making resource which paralleled the ways in which Intersectional analysis is undertaken is that it shed light on the common concerns of individuals and from this relationships and coalitions were formed. Empowerment of the individuals taking part in the project through new or developing relationships in order to address a common concern is one way in which Intersectionality was found to assist in developing an understanding of how these social interactions could be understood. The political way in which teachers engage with

their profession and how their spirituality is implicitly politicised becomes evident when viewed through an Intersectional lens. Forging relationships is a central concern for the teachers in the study, relationships are fostered so as to empower the learner in the project of learning and understanding their place in society. Empowerment is central to understanding how the teachers understand the common aim of their spiritual and professional identities coming together (Sampson, 2010). Rather than create a hierarchical relationship the political way in which the spiritual influence on the teaching encounter is manifest is through a negation of this hierarchy. The relationship is not imposed on the learner but a fostering of an equitable teacher-pupil or teacher-colleague framework is built. This political approach through an engagement with one's spirituality as a contextual resource is also examined by Freire (1994). Freire sharing many concerns and contributing to Intersectional thought on education as a social project notes that relationships should be forged between individuals which should not be imposed but should be equitable and positive. Not only between individuals but seeking to identify relationships between the individual and their social situation or environment. In much the same way Jane makes links between her teaching and her spiritual impulse to teach and enhance her teaching. Through a negotiation of herself as teacher and guide and as an advocate for those without a voice or who are underrepresented.

## Pedagogy through a spiritual contextual lens

Pedagogy as praxis has been a consistent feature of the ways in which the participants in the study expressed their spirituality. Alongside of this, seeing their pedagogical praxis through the lens of their spirituality allowed for their spirituality to be used as a contextual resource. The interactions, relationships and priorities of the teachers' practice, when examined in this way, foregrounds how professional and spiritual identities are bonded together (Arthur and Barnes, 2017). Whilst the expression of their spiritualties varied in the professional environment of the classroom and school varied, the desire to understand and locate their professional practice spiritually was consistent throughout all the teachers. The desire to produce, reflective, engaged and empowered learners was central to all the participants but how they understood this process was complex and relied on reflection. This shed light on the ways in which the uneasy negotiation of spiritual and professional-self amongst the participants and the ways in which their identities were expressed in their

professional praxis were enacted.

Paolo Freire has been a central figure in shaping how Intersectional analysis has engaged with Education (Hill-Collins and Bilge, 2016). The theme of forging coalitions where apparently diverse individuals come together to address a shared concern is where the two shared projects between Freire and Intersectionality emerge. Freire notes that the process of education is to develop critical learners and learners who are also reflective of their place in society and the mechanisms which they may engage with the social and political processes (Freire, 1974, 1993, 1994). This has been addressed in many ways by the participants and their examples could be interpreted as those of central concern between Freire and Intersectionality. Using their spirituality as a contextual resource to understand their professional ideals and values and how these are manifest through praxis occurs throughout the participants' accounts. Rogers and Hill (2000, 274) also noted this is their study which found that educators engaged in critical spiritual reflection in regards to their professional selves expressed the view that to be spiritually aware is to be engaged with acknowledging the spiritual as an essential development of a holistic education and not an additional feature of it focussed on the development of fully empowered individuals. Interestingly, Jane recalls an event which has left a profound impact on her and how she relates to her colleagues. Recounting their attitude towards a family who were engaged in and suffering from domestic abuse prompted Jane to challenge her colleagues' assumptions and prejudices. She recounts how her feelings towards this were informed by her spirituality and her willingness to suspend judgement but to seek relationships were borne out of this. Freire also examines the ways in which relationships should be fostered so as to challenge areas where power and lack of power impact on teachers and learners. It is the elitism of the teacher who may feel sheltered from these concerns which Freire challenges. Being able to engage, reflect and understand the life world of the community in which teachers are engaged with insulates the teacher from an intellectual/professional elitism (Freire, 1993, p74). The findings would suggest that Jane's spirituality coupled with her professional values and personal attributes allowed her to contextualise the challenges facing this family and gave her the conviction to challenge a narrow assumption but be open to differing and challenging perspectives. I this way, forging two axes of identity has allowed for evidence of how one's varied identities and concerns can come together and manifest in teaching praxis. It would seem from this interpretation of the findings that Jane's spiritual contextualisation of a professional and social issue illustrated

the complexity of spiritual and professional identity interaction.

Forging a critical consciousness through analysing where one's position in society is located and seeing this in relation to others is central to Janet's practice. She acknowledges that she has had a privileged start in life but seeks through her professional practice to redress imbalance where possible. Sharing the opportunities and attributes that Janet has had in her personal and professional life to promote equity among her pupils is exemplified by her professional reflection and how this becomes practise in her classroom. It is this critical consciousness that Freire (1974) aspired towards in his teaching philosophy. The ways in which Freire envisioned giving agency back to individuals rather than allowing individuals to assume that others held power and responsibility is in common with Janet's contextualisation of her spirituality. It is through her personal/professional relationships with her pupils that Janet gives of herself (her skills, attributes, experiences). By giving of herself she aspires towards the Freireian ideal of individuals who are dialectically engaged in an educational relationship which addressed social engagement and transformation. This personal political ideal held by Janet is best contextualised when viewed at the intersection of her class, ethnicity, geography and spirituality.

The various intersections between spiritual, professional ideal, professional practice and social action illustrate the ways in which the pedagogical praxis of the participants is complicated and draws to a greater or lesser extent on one or more of these axes. This is something which is acknowledged in Intersectional studies and Critical Theory (Adorno, 1998) and is to be expected from individuals with multiple identities and ways of drawing on these identities whilst in relationships with others. The general spiritual aspiration which contextualises the interactions with others has been shown to cascade or filter towards pedagogical practice in the classroom or professional engagement with the school community. However, some of the ways in which the participants have illustrated this complexity and relatedness also shares close parallels to examples taken from educators within an Intersectional framework and paradigm. Toni expresses her awareness of the need to draw to the attention to the very young children in which her practice is based to the links between themselves and their community and to see this as a positive, empowering connection. One which is rooted in a spiritual connection for Toni but has broader implications for her pupils such as belonging, agency and empowerment. From Toni's account it is clear that this is something which is difficult to articulate but is

profound in nature and of high value to her. Looking at geography in this way shows that the ways in which the teachers' identity with place and the value they ascribe to it, draws on their spiritual, and communal connection to it. Examining geography intersectionally helps to illustrate that while a spiritual and communal identification with place is evident it also highlights ways in which the teacher challenges the ways in which assumptions are made as to who and what belongs in certain places and who decides. These narratives are challenged by a critical approach by the teacher and a fostering of this enquiry type in the pupils. In this way, through using an Intersectional paradigm to analyse the findings, it became clear that using one's spirituality as a contextual resource (geographically) boundaries became malleable and identity and factors of belonging were challenged (Naples, 2009, p571).

Using one's spirituality as a contextual resource had characteristics which while they were individual and illustrated through individual's accounts, shared a common theme of critical engagement through a spiritual process of discernment. Seeking to understand another's position and perspective in a spiritually engaged and process of spiritually discernment exemplified a conscious lack of judgement between the individual (participant) and the other agents they were in relationship with. The findings would suggest that this is brought about through an awareness of the spiritual connection made between the participant, other individuals, their profession and the community/environment. This discernment, rather than judgement, was critical in the sense of a seeking to understand and engage with other but uncritical in the sense of making a value/moral judgement. The intersection between the participants' spiritual life and their professional practice illustrated a social and personal engagement which was rooted in spirituality but directed towards social engagement. This is also evident in ways in which critical theory and Christianity have intersected (Falke, 2010). Falke notes that whilst critically engaged a Christian perspective seeks to engage with others on an equal footing borne out of respect. This equality is understood (according to Falke) as seeking community through a Christian vision, being able to position oneself in another's perspective to seek to understand the world through their eyes. Developing this further she notes that to judge another (negatively) is to mirror disunity (at the core) with God (Falke, 2010, p48). While none of the participants were as emphatic or as explicit in this position as those alluded to by Falke, Falke's drawing together of a critical theoretical paradigm which in also focussed on the individualised agential empowerment of individuals and learners provides foregrounded assertion

between the links of a spiritually engaged discernment and the hope of positive change.

Having one's spirituality as a contextual resource has allowed the participants ways to engage with their pupils, colleagues and the wider community. Drawing on their spirituality has enabled ways in which engagement with colleagues is both challenging and contributes to reassessment of the role of the educator both in and out of the classroom environment. In this way the spirituality of the individuals involved often emboldened them to be advocates for learners and their families. In the classroom environment and project, spirituality has been used to understand the relationships between the pupils and those around them as well as how they relate to their local and extended community and the role they have in their communities; this is a project of empowerment. Spirituality as a contextual resource provided some of the participants with a way of critically discerning their interactions with others and the motivations of self and other. A grand narrative of positive change is evident throughout all the findings and this has been an element evident in Intersectional analysis and approach. Intersectionality and an Intersectional framework has emerged as a one way of understanding the ways in which the many identities of the participants have been drawn on to understand and engage with their profession with a particular focus on the spiritual identity of the participants. Unique to this study is the way in which religion/spirituality has emerged a positive aspect of identity which has hitherto been unexplored in Intersectional analysis (Hancock, 2016, p197) as religion has tended to be understood as a method of subjugation rather than empowerment within an Intersectional paradigm.

#### **Summary**

This chapter has allowed for the examination of the superordinate themes which emerged from the accounts given by the participants. Whilst remaining phenomenological by privileging the uniqueness of each account, it emerged that the phenomena exhibited in the superordinate themes shared characteristics between participants. By examining the accounts in the context of current literature and practice it became evident that an awareness of the agency and context afforded by an awareness of one's spirituality could inform the teaching encounter. This is most clearly demonstrated by the examination of how one's spirituality provides a context for the encounters and reflections between the participants, their colleagues and pupils. Again the unique contribution to knowledge

emerging from this study is a new definition of spirituality which makes clear that within teaching (in this project) 'moments of profundity and connection with other that lead to change' is clearly evident in the professional educational encounter and perhaps unique to it. The implications this has for current practice and teacher education programmes is clear, whereby the examination demonstrates the need for a revisiting of how the spiritual is defined and engaged with professionally.

## Chapter 6

#### Conclusion

The concluding chapter sets out to reiterate the findings of the study. Implications for teacher education and practice point towards a revisiting of the aspect of personhood in which spirituality is placed. By summarising the ways in which IPA was used to gather and interpret this information helps illustrate the strengths and limitations of study and posits possible avenues for further study.

### IPA as a Methodology

Examining the lived experiences of individuals is appropriately undertaken through an interpretive paradigm. IPA as one such methodology offered ways in which this analysis could be designed, undertaken and analysed which were deemed more suitable than other methodologies. As a methodology which focuses on an idiographic approach rather than a nomothetic or large scale study, IPA's structure and philosophical underpinning lends itself well to a deep analysis of individual's understanding of their own spirituality and how this may affect their teaching practice. Emerging out of this analysis were themes which were unexpected and nuanced which were often shared (on a thematic level) amongst participants but their experience and retelling of these phenomenon were individual and subjective.

IPA's philosophical underpinnings and methodology allowed for a phenomenological and interpretative stance to be taken throughout. Through carrying out semi-structured interviews which the participants were able to engage with fully and have a space to tell their stories meant that the social reality being created was co-crafted without losing the position of the participants as expert contributors in relation to the retelling of their professional and spiritual nexus. The reflective process which was immediately undertaken post-interview was phenomenological in character in that first and early impressions were noted before a systematic analysis took place. The attempt to suspend rather than a strict phenomenological observance of 'bracketing out' allowed for the researcher to acknowledge his place in the interpretive process whilst maintaining an awareness of the interpreter effecting the interpretive enterprise. A thematic analysis which was structured and adhered to a procedural approach brought to the surface themes which illuminated the narratives provided by the participants. Areas of identity which are common to IPA

analysis were revisited numerous times to adopt an idiographic analysis which rooted the interpretation in the account given by the participants. This insured that using IPA as a method of data collection and analysis grounded the interpretation of the themes in the participant's accounts ensuring correlation between the transcribed interviews and the analysis and interpretation of them.

# **Selection of Participants**

Participants for the study were self-selecting after having been given the information on the project through the partnerships between my department at the university and the schools in the area. All of the participants had an interest in the research from a personal perspective. This was stated by all of them in informal conversations or during the pre-briefing which established the details such as time frame, commitment, subject matter, ethical considerations as well as the right to withdraw and welfare considerations.

Self-selection was a positive aspect of the participant's involvement with the study. As the majority of the participants held a position of faith, which for some was active participation in a faith community. Others were interested in how spirituality could be understood as a humanistic phenomenon which need not necessarily be directed at the ineffable but grounded in the material. As an interest was shared among the individuals in the group, most had material they could readily call on and expand to illustrate areas which exposed how spirituality was manifested in their professional lives whilst also present in their personal lives.

What may have helped the process would to have had participants which were also male as the entire participant group was female. This might have allowed slightly different interpretations of spirituality and professional practice to be explored. It is assumed that the majority of teachers engaged in primary school education are female perhaps this was reflected in the engagement with the project. The professional experience and duration of practice allowed for a rich body of material to be explored in the interviews. The teachers taking part had many professional stories to explore which were reflected in examples being drawn from their work with children but also as members of a professional staff team and community. Having a depth of experience also meant that the teachers were comfortable with trying to relate their spirituality to professional encounters which may

have been at the early stages of their careers and benefitted from professional evaluation and insight gained over time.

## **Interview Design**

The process of designing interviews which would allow for a full exploration of the spiritual and how it was defined and understood by the teachers taking part proved difficult. Before undertaking the design process, a thorough study of aspects of spirituality, and the way in which this has influenced education and professionalism, was undertaken. By doing so, a preliminary table was crafted and possible areas of interrogation were constructed. This enabled the first interview to be constructed in such a way as a general outline of spirituality might emerge and how this is manifested in the professional context. Semi-structured interviews were carried out and the first phase of interviews allowed the participants the freedom to express their thoughts and experiences as the preliminary questions were intentionally open-ended in nature. Each phase of interviews allowed for the participants to take the interview in directions which best reflected their thoughts, experiences and what they felt was important to reveal their understanding of professional practice and the effect of spirituality on this. After each phase of interviews were carried out, initial reflections undertaken, transcription and coding took place. This informed the next phase of interviews as the detail arising out of the interviews provided a rich seam of material to explore.

Approaching the interviews in this way allowed for the participants to direct the interview process while engaged in the actual interview but by also foregrounding areas which they felt were important to them and which could be used to craft further interviews and their component questions. One theoretical and practical issue which emerged from this process which had to be addressed was the influence of the researcher as an interpreter of the material. Not wanting to direct the interviews too much whilst engaged in them or designing them meant that a constant reflexivity had to be adopted to maintain minimal interpretive bias. Maintaining this distance but also being aware of the way in which the researcher was part of the process meant that a dynamic which was sympathetic, attentive and subservient to the participants was established and maintained. In doing so, a phenomenological attitude was preserved which meant that the transcripts were studied individually and from an awareness of their unique nature as artefacts of individual

experience. However, through using IPA the researcher was aware of their role in the interpretation and the crafting of the analysis and thematic emergence.

# **Unique Contribution to Knowledge**

Using IPA as a methodology to examine primary school teachers in England in relation to their understanding and expression of spirituality has not been done before. As such, while acknowledging some of the limitations inherent in this project, it has as a methodology been successful in illuminating some of the features of this phenomenon in this unique and homogenous group of participants. In doing so, a new definition of what it means to be spiritual has emerged out of their understanding and expression of it in the workplace. Namely that spirituality is those 'moments of profundity and connection with other that leads to change'. Where this differs from other expressions and definitions above is that the imperative to action emerges out of this understanding of spirituality. Uncovering the superordinate themes from the participants' interviews points towards the imperative to action being common across participants but expressed in ways unique to them. This definition points towards a way of understanding spirituality which is unique to educational professionals.

## **Implications for Practice**

Several areas emerge from the study which may have, if implemented in school or wider policy, direct implications for how schools recognise the contribution of staff to areas such as RE, SMSC as well as how the Prevent Strategy (gov.uk, 2011) is enacted alongside the impact of the Teaching Standards has on teachers of faith.

Religious Education has had several aims since the renaming and alteration of its focus away from Religious Instruction and towards Religious Education. The confusion which surrounds the subject has been recently examined by Ofsted in 2013 in the report 'Religious Education: realising the potential' (Ofsted, 2013) which examined the ways in which RE is conceptualised in schools. The report's findings noted that RE is misunderstood by teachers who are unclear as to the subject's aims and scope. It is clear from the findings of this study that the teachers taking part are also unclear as to what role

they play in nurturing the spiritual aspect of personhood in their pupils when engaged in Religious Education. Referring back to the Ofsted report it is apparent that RE is not the appropriate vehicle for spiritual development of children as this should be fostered through collective worship and SMSC. The role of the teacher is excluded from the report's analysis and recommendations. Emerging out of the findings of this study is an awareness of the complex ways and unplanned encounters which children (and teachers) experience which lead to spiritual development or awareness. The implications for the curriculum and for Religious Education in particular is that the school community and the relationships found in that community are more appropriately served by a sensitivity to and an engagement with the spiritual when it arises as opposed to when it is planned.

SMSC as noted earlier perhaps lends itself to these encounters as opposed to formal teaching. However, contributors in this thesis challenge this when they note that the decline in religious observance or literacy in contemporary society implies that teachers are not equipped with the necessary tools to be aware of and develop a sense of the spiritual in schools. As such, this project posits the thesis that teachers' expression and understanding of their spirituality would benefit from a forum which lies at the intersection between formal RE and opportunistic curriculum areas such as SMSC. Allowing teachers the space to articulate their spiritual or religious identity may be an aid to this. The challenge to this however is the way in which religious observance is negatively conceptualised in the Teaching Standards (2013) and initiatives such as the Prevent Strategy (www.gov.uk, 2011). What emerges from the findings is a situation where teachers feel they need to edit an aspect of their personal identity which is at the core of their being and central to their understanding of self. The negative connotations of this are clear in that there is a feeling that to be professional could mean that one cannot be of a faith or spiritual disposition without being seen as at odds with the wider teaching profession. This is also the case for those practising within the faith school sector as teachers in this study either felt compelled to monitor their expression of faith or adopt a narrative of the school which was not reflective of their personal spiritual and religious positioning. Providing a forum where teachers can legitimately express their faith or lack of faith sensitively and through a medium of openness and appreciation of the provisional nature of faith would benefit all as discussions would be enriched by multiple perspectives as well as challenge.

One possible approach to address the issues which have arisen in the project is to provide

an opportunity for teachers and student teachers to explore their spirituality in a forum which allows for their experiences and positions to be taken in to account in professional and developmental encounter. In Initial Teacher Education for example an open forum within teacher education programmes which bridges the tensions between the professional (developing or established) identity and the personal would be a positive outcome. This would acknowledge this aspect of identity as having a legitimate voice and one which is focussed on the educational encounter and the attributes individuals bring to this. This would ideally move away from the concept of religion and/or spirituality as something attributed to religious or spiritual development as envisioned in the curriculum and towards a positive engagement with these aspects of identity which may enrich the professional approaches to teaching and learning. Moving away from distinct traditions while acknowledging the role of religion in some professional's lives and school contexts would make individuals aware of the continued presence of the spiritual in people's lives and as a distinct feature from concepts of religion perhaps present in current political and social thinking. As such, the ways in which teachers understand and express their spirituality would provide a knowledge base and context from which those in teacher education or in various stages of their careers could engage with this dialogue and positively raise their understanding and awareness of the importance of spirituality in the educational encounter.

## **Further Research**

This project has shown that there are many areas of teachers' spirituality which inform not only how they understand themselves as practitioners but which impacts directly on the lives of their schools, pupils and colleagues. Several themes emerged which were expected but were enacted in ways which were individual and context specific.

Identity was a major theme running through the project. The impact the teacher's personal lives and histories made an indelible mark on how they saw themselves and professionals and their roles I the educative process as well as the support given to pupils and colleagues. The motivations for this were unique to the participants but an awareness of their ability to impact positively on the lives of others with a genuine hope for wider societal transformation was clear. Again, the general narratives under which these agential choices were constructed varied from theistic to atheistic but for many somewhere along

this spectrum. The complexity of faith, belief and spirituality and what the products of these personal encounters and ways of understanding one's place in society ultimately mean is an ongoing project of understanding.

Developing out of this study is an awareness of the decompartmentalised ways in which one's faith and spirituality is understood by individuals. Further study would be beneficial to understand the ways in which one's identities intersects and how these intersecting modes of being are foregrounded given professional contexts. The way in which the participants in this study felt that their personal faith had to be negotiated so as to remain 'professional' or being perceived to be professional when not expressing their faith needs more research. In what ways can one's faith be deemed an appropriate identifier or asset when engaged in the professional realm? Is a professional understanding of faith as understood by others a disingenuous or contrived and inauthentic reflection of the faith as understood and lived by the individual? These areas would benefit this project if researched further as power dynamics and cultural dominance could be explored.

#### **Final Comments**

Dedication and commitment to the children under their tutelage and care and commitment towards colleagues is a core value which all of the teachers in this study demonstrate throughout their accounts. Throughout their narratives the teachers illustrate times of opportunity and challenge in seeking to negotiate their professional and spiritual identities. Where this negotiation is most effective is when there is harmony between the two areas which shape the overall identities of the individuals. Challenges emerge when one aspect of identity is undermined through the privileging of another, particularly in the professional encounter.

The teachers taking part in this study overcame obstacles which challenged their spirituality and/or faith. This was achieved through interpretive acts which were decoded through a lens of the tacit spiritual domain. Making sense of and giving context to professional encounters through the lens of spirituality allowed the participants to draw on these aspects of self and engage with them as sense making and value giving tools. Whilst the tacit dimension of knowledge is key to an understanding of the spiritual which also enlivens the personal encounters between the participants and their school communities it

is challenged by a positivist assumption of knowledge in the professional realm and a charge of irrationality from an assumed culture of secularity.

The position taken in the findings of this thesis is counter cultural in contemporary England. To acknowledge the possibility of the divine and the way in which this may impact on one's professional identity may be assumed to be irrational. What the study concludes however, is that an awareness of the way in which individuals understand themselves and their engagement with the ineffable can be understood not only as a resource but as a rational dimension of selfhood not at odds with one's professional practice but complementary to it.

## References

Adams, K., Hyde, B. and Woolley, R. (2008) *The Spiritual Dimension of Childhood*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Adorno, T.W. (1998) *Education After Auschwitz*. Gesammelte Schriften, 10(2), pp. 93-12.

All Parliamentary Party Group for Religious Education. (2013) *RE: The Truth Unmasked*. Available at:

http://religiouseducationcouncil.org.uk/media/file/APPG\_RE\_-\_The\_Truth\_Unmasked.pdf Accessed 04/07/2014

Allen, R. and West, A. (2011) 'Why do faith secondary schools have advantaged intakes? The relative importance of neighbourhood characteristics, social background and religious identification among parents', *British Educational Research Journal*, *37*(4), pp. 691-712.

Alma, H. and Zock, H. (2002) 'I and Me. The Spiritual Dimension of Identity Formation', *International Journal of Education and Religion*, *3*(1), pp. 1-15.

Aronson, E., Wilson, T.D. and Akert, R.M. (2006) *Social Psychology*. (6<sup>th</sup> ed), Upper Saddle River, NJ: Pearson Education Inc.

Arthur, J. and Barnes, L.P. (eds.) (2017) *Education and Religion*, Major Themes in Education. (Vol 1), Abingdon: Routledge.

Arthur, J., Waring, M., Coe, R. and Hedges, L. (2012) *Research Methods and Methodologies in Education*. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Ashmos, D. and Duchon, D. (2000) 'Spirituality at Work: a Conceptualization and Measure', *Journal of Management Enquiry*, 9(2) pp. 134-145.

Astor, E. (2018) 'Countering extremism in British schools? The truth about the Birmingham Trojan Horse Affair.' *Journal of Education Policy*, 33(4), pp. 584–585.

Atkins, L. and Wallis, S. (2012) *Qualitative Research in Education*, Research Methods in Education. London: SAGE Publications Ltd.

Bainbridge, R.M. (2000) 'The Spiritual and the Intending Teacher'.

*International Journal of Children's Spirituality*. 5(2) pp. 163-175.

Bagguley, P. (1999) 'Beyond Emancipation? The reflexivity of social movements', in O'Brien, M. Penna, S. and Hay, C. (eds.) (1999) *Theorizing Modernity*. *Reflexivity, Environment and Identity in Gidden's Social Theory*. Harlow: Addison Wesley Longman Limited.

Beach, O. (2015). Trusting the profession to do its job: the only way to deal with workload and stop teachers quitting. Available From:

https://www.tes.com/news/school-news/breaking-views/trusting-profession-do-its-job-only-way-deal-workload-and-stop. Accessed: 14/05/2015.

Bennett, M. and Sani, F. (eds.) (2004) *The Development of the Social Self.* Hove: Psychology Press.

Bennett, T. (2015) 'Virtues of great teachers: Justice, courage, patience, wisdom and compassion', in Gregson, M., Nixon, L., Pollard, A. and Spedding, T. (eds) *Readings for Reflective Teaching in Further, Adult and Vocational Education*, Reflective Teaching. (4<sup>th</sup> ed), London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc.

Bernstein, B. (2000) *Pedagogy, Symbolic Control and Identity: Theory, Research and Critique*. Critical Perspectives Series, Oxford: Rowman and Littlefield Publishers Ltd.

Bhaskar, R. (2016) From East to West. Odyssey of a Soul. London: Routledge.

Black-Hawkins, K. & Florian, L. (2012) 'Classroom Teachers' craft knowledge of their inclusive practice', *Teachers and Teaching*, 18(5), pp. 567-584.

Boyd, S. (2010) 'On Being Here with Others: Space, Identity and Justice', *Journal of Men, Masculinities and Spirituality*, 4(1), pp. 6-18.

Brown, I. T., Chen, T., Gehlert, N. C., and Piedmont, R. L. (2012) 'Age and Gender Effects on the Assessment of Spirituality and Religious Sentiments (ASPIRES) Scale: A Cross-Sectional Analysis', *Psychology of Religion and Spirituality*, *5*(2), pp. 90-98.

Buber, M. (1947) Between Man and Man. London: Routledge.

Burr, V. (2003) Social Constructionism. Hove: Routledge.

Carastathis, A. (2016) *Intersectionality: Origins, Contestations, Horizons*, Expanding Frontiers: Interdisciplinary Approaches to Studies of Women, Gender and Sexuality. London: University of Nebraska Press.

Catholic Education Service (2014) *Memorandum On Appointment Of Teachers To Catholic Schools*. Avaliable at: http://www.catholiceducation.org.uk/employment-documents/recruitment-process/item/1000049-memorandum-on-appointment-of-teachers-to-catholic-schools (Accessed: 18/11/2014)

Chater, M. and Erricker, C. (2013) *Does Religious Education have a future?* Abingdon: Routledge.

Chater, M. (2005) 'The Personal and the Political: notes on teachers' vocations and values', *Journal of Beliefs and Values*, 26(3), pp. 249-259.

Collard, P. and Looney, J. (2014) 'Nurturing Creativity in Education', *European Journal of Education*, 49(3), pp. 348-364.

Cooling, T. (2008) 'Setting the Vision: The Calling of the Christian Teacher in the Twenty First Century World', *Teaching as Vocation*, Fourth Isaac Armitage Lecture, pp. 1-28.

Cooling, T. (2010) 'Transforming Faith: Teaching as a Christian Vocation in a Secular, Worldview-Diverse Culture', *Journal of Education and Christian Belief*, 14(1), pp. 19-32.

Copley, T. (2000) *Spiritual Development in the State School.* Exeter: University of Exeter Press.

Craft, A., Howard, G. and Claxton, G. (ed.) (2008) *Creativity, Wisdom and Trusteeship: Exploring the Role of Education*. London: Sage.

Crenshaw, K. (2016) *The urgency of intersectionality*. Available from: https://www.ted.com/talks/kimberle\_crenshaw\_the\_urgency\_of\_intersectionality (Accessed 24/01/2017)

Crossan, F. (2003) 'Research Philosophy: towards an understanding', *Nurse Researcher*, 11(1), pp. 46-55.

Crowder, R. (2013) 'Spirituality in Social Work and Education: Theory, Practice

and Pedagogies', *Social Work Education: The International Journal*, 32(7), pp. 964-965.

Collard, P and Looney, J. (2014) '*Nurturing Creativity in Education*', European Journal of Education, 49(3), pp. 348-364

Cooling, T. (2000) in Grimmitt, M. (Ed) (2002) Pedagogies of Religious Education, Case studies in the research and development of good pedagogic practice in RE. Great Wakering: McCrimmon Publishing Company Ltd.

Csikszentmihalyi, M. and Csikszentmihalyi, I. S. (2006) *A Life Worth Living; Contributions to positive psychology.* New York: Oxford University Press.

Csikszentmihalyi, M. (2002) Flow: The Classic Work on how to Achieve Happiness. Chatham: McKays.

Csikszentmihalyi, M. (2013) *Creativity: Flow and The Psychology of Discovery and Invention*. New York: Harper Collins.

Culliford, L. (2011) *The Psychology of Religion*. London: Pentonville.

Cush, D. (2007) 'Should religious studies be part of the compulsory state school curriculum?' *British Journal of Religious Education*, 29(3), pp. 217-227.

Davie, G. (1994) Religion in Britain since 1945. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd.

Davis, E., Moriarty, G. L., and Mauch, J. C. (2013) 'God Images and God Concepts: Definitions, Development and Dynamics', *Psychology of Religion and Spirituality*, *5*(1), pp. 51-60.

Dawkins, R. (2007) *The God Delusion*. (2nd edn), London: Transworld Publishers.

Day, A., Vincett, G., Cotter, C.R. (eds.) (2013) *Social Identities between the Sacred and the Secular*. Farnham: Ashgate.

De Klerk-Luttig, J.(2008) 'Spirituality in the workplace: a reality for South African teachers?' *South African Journal of Education*, 28(4) pp. 505-517

Department of Education (2013) *The National Curriculum in England: primary curriculum*, Avaliable at: www.gov.uk:

https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/national-curriculum-in-england-primary-curriculum Accessed: 11/07/2014

Department of Education (2014) *Teachers' Standards July 2011: Guidance for school leaders, school staff and governing bodies.* Avaliable at: www.gov.uk: https://www.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attachment\_data/file/301 107/Teachers\_\_Standards.pdf Accessed: 11/07/2014

Desailly, J. (2012) Creativity in the Primary School. London: Sage.

De Souza, M. (2012) 'Connectedness and connectedness: the dark side of spirituality-implications for education', *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 17(4), pp. 291-303.

Dewey, J. (2012) Democracy and Education. Hollywood: Simon & Browne.

Durham, W. (1991) *Co-evolution, Genes, Culture and Human Diversity*. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Eatough, V. and Smith, J. A. (2007) 'Interpretive Phenomenological Analysis', in Lyons, E. (ed.) and Coyle, A. (ed.) *Analysing Qualitative Data in Psychology*. London: Sage, pp. 35-50.

Eaude, T. (2006) *Children's Spiritual, Moral, Social and Cultural Development,* Exeter: Learning Matters Ltd.

Emmons, R. A. (2006) 'Spirituality: Recent Progress', in Csikszentmihalyi, M. and Csikszentmihalyi, I. S. (2006) *A Life Worth Living; Contributions to positive psychology*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Falke, C. (ed) (2010) *Intersections in Christianity and Critical Theory*. Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan.

Ferber, M. P. (2006) 'Critical Realism and Religion: Objectivity and the Insider and Outsider Problem', *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 96(1), pp. 176-181.

Findlay, F. and Gough, G. (2003) *Reflexivity: a practical guide for researchers in health* and social sciences. Oxford: Blackwell Science

Finke, R. (2012) 'Religious Diversity and Devotion: Explaining a Peaceful Coexistence', *Contemporary Sociology: Journal of Reviews*, 41(1), pp. 444-473.

Flannery-Quinn, S. M., Morton, M. L. and Brindley, R. (2011) 'A Window of

Opportunity: perspectives of preservice teachers from the United States on the customs and practices of teaching in primary schools in England', *Teacher Development: an international journal of teachers' professional development*, 15(1), pp. 37-52.

Fletcher, S.J. & Mullen, C.A. (eds.) (2012) *The Sage Handbook of Mentoring and Coaching in Education*. London: Sage.

Fraser, D. (2007) 'State Education, spirituality and culture; teachers' personal and professional stories of negotiating the nexus', *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 12(3), pp. 289-305.

Freire, P. (1974) *Education for Critical Consciousness*. London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc.

Freire, P. (1993) Pedagogy of the Oppressed. London: Penguin Group Ltd.

Freire, P. (1994) *Pedagogy of Hope. Reliving pedagogy of the oppressed.* London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc.

Freud, S. (1923) The Ego and the Id. London: Hogarth

Freud, S. (1928) The Future of an Illusion. London: Hogarth Press.

Frey, J H. and Oishi, S. M. (1995) *How to Conduct Interviews by Telephone and in Person*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Gaitandia, A (2012) Anxiety, psychoanalysis and reinvigorating education, in Bainbridge, A & West, L. (eds.) (2012) *Psychoanalysis and Education: Minding a Gap*. London: Karnac Books Ltd.

Geh, E. and Tan, G. (2009) 'Spirituality at work in a changing world: managerial and research implications', *Journal of Management, Spirituality and Religion*, 9(4), pp. 287-300.

Giorgi, A. (1997) 'The theory, practice and evaluation of the phenomenological method as a qualitative research procedure', *Journal of Phenomenological Psychology*, 28(2) pp. 235-260.

Giorgi, A. (2008) 'Concerning a serious misunderstanding of the essence of the phenomenological method in psychology', *Journal of Phenomenological* 

Psychology, 39(1), pp. 33-58.

Giorgi, A. (2008) 'Difficulties encountered in the application of the phenomenological method in the social sciences', *The Indo-Pacific Journal of Phenomenology*, 8(1), pp. 1-9.

Goodliff, G. (2013) 'Spirituality expressed in creative learning: young children's imagining play as a space for mediating their spirituality', *Early Child development and Care*, 183(8) pp. 1054-1071.

Gordon, P.E. (2011) 'Must the Sacred be Transcendent?', *Inquiry*, 54(2), pp. 126-139.

Gordon, P.E. (2008) 'The place of the sacred in the absence of God: Charles Taylor's A Secular Age', *Journal of the History of Ideas*, 69(4), pp. 647-673.

Greenfield, S. (2008) *ID: the Quest for Meaning in the 21st century*. London: Hodder and Stoughton Ltd.

Grimmitt, M. (2002) *Pedagogies of Religious Education, Case studies in the research and development of good pedagogic practice in RE*. Great Wakering: McCrimmon Publishing Company Ltd.

Hammersley, M. and Traianou, A. (2012) *Ethics in Qualitative Research: Controversies and Contexts.* London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Hancock, A-M. (2016) *Intersectionality: An Intellectual History*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Hardy, A. (1965) *The Living Stream: A Restatement of Evolutionary Theory and its Relation to the Spirit of Man.* London: Collins.

Harris, K. I. (2007) 'Re-conceptualizing spirituality in the light of educating young children', *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 12(3), pp. 263-275.

Hasselkus, B.R. (2002) *The Meaning of Everyday Occupation*. Thorofare: Slack Incorporated.

Hay, D. and Nye, R. (2006) *The Spirit of the Child: Revised Edition*. London: Harper Collins.

Hayward, R. D. and Krause, N. (2013) 'Patterns of Change in Prayer Activity,

Expectancies, and Contents During Older Adulthood', *Journal for the Scientific Study of Religion*, 52(1), pp. 17-34.

Heelas, P., Seel, B., Szerszynski, B., Tustin, and K. Woodhead, L. (2005). *The Spiritual Revolution; why religion is giving way to spirituality*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Hefferon, K. and Gil-Rodriguez, E. (2011) 'Methods: Interpretative phenomenological analysis', *The Psychologist*, 24(10), pp. 756-758.

Heidegger, M. (1962) Being and Time. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing ltd.

Hemming, P. J. (2011) 'The Place of Religion in Public Life: School Ethos as a Lens on Society', *Sociology*, 45(6), pp. 1061-1077.

Hill Collins, P. and Bilge, S. (2016) *Intersectionality*. Key Concepts. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Hogan, M. J. (2009) 'On Spirituality and Education', *Thinking Skills and Creativity*, 4(1), pp. 138-143.

Holloway, W., and Jefferson, T. (2002) *Doing Qualitative Research Differently*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Hudson, R. (2013) 'The Question of the Theoretical foundations for the spirituality at work movement', *Journal of Management, Spirituality and Religion*. 11(1), pp. 27-44.

Hull, J.M. (2000) in Grimmitt, M. (2002) Pedagogies of Religious Education, Case studies in the research and development of good pedagogic practice in RE. Great Wakering: McCrimmon Publishing Company Ltd.

Hunt, C., and Sampson, F. (2006) *Writing: Self and Reflexivity*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Jackson, R. (2004) *Rethinking Religious Education and Plurality: Issues and Diversity in Pedagogy*. London: Routledge falmer.

Jamieson, C. (2013) 'God has created me to do him some definite service', *International Studies in Catholic Education*, 5(1), pp. 10-22.

Johnson, J. (2010) Positive and Trusting Relationships with Children in the Early

Years Setting Exeter: Learning Matters Ltd.

Johnson, K.A. (2003) "Every experience is a moving force": identity and growth through mentoring, *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 19, pp. 787-800.

Jones, S.R., Wijeyesinghe, C.L. (2011) 'The Promises and Challenges of Teaching from an Intersectional Perspective: Core Components and Applied Strategy', *New Directions for Teaching and Learning*, 125, pp.11-25.

Jones-Ault, M. (2010) 'Inclusion of Religion and Spirituality in the Special Education Literature', *The Journal of Special Education*, 44(3), pp. 176-189.

Kay, W. K. (2003) 'Spirituality and Education: two millennia of thought and practice', *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 8(3), pp. 37-41.

Kibble, D.G. in Best, R. (ed.) (2000) *Education for Spiritual, Moral, Social and Cultural Development*, Continuum Studies in Pastoral Care and Personal and Social Education. London: Continuum International Publishing Group Ltd.

Kose, B.W. & Young Lim, Y. (2010) 'Transformative Professional Development: Relationship to Teachers' Beliefs, Expertise and Teaching', *International Journal of Leadership in Education*, 13(4), pp. 393-419.

Knott, K. (2013) 'The Secular Sacred: In between or both/and?', in Day, A., Vincett, G., Cotter, C.R, *Social Identities between the Sacred and the Secular*. Farnham: Ashgate.

Kvale, S. (2007) Doing Interviews. London: Sage.

Langdridge, D. (2007) *Phenomenological Psychology: Theory, Research and Method*, Harlow: Pearson Education Ltd.

Larkin, M., Watts, S., and Clifton, E. (2008) 'Giving voice and making sense in interpretative phenomenological analysis', *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, *3*(2), pp. 102-120.

Liu, J.H., and Laszle, J. (2007) 'A Narrative Theory of History and Identity: Social Identity, Social Representations, Society, and the Individual', in Maloney, G & Walker, I. (eds.) *Social Representations and Society: Content, Process and Power*. Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan.

Lyons, E. and Coyle (2007) *Analysing Qualitative Data in Psychology*. London: Sage.

Madhill, A., Jordan, A. and Shirley, C. (2000) 'Objectivity and Reliability in qualitative analysis: Realist, contextualist and radical constructivist epistemologies', *British Journal of Psychology*, pp. 1-20.

Maloney, G and Walker, I. (eds.) (2007) *Social Representations and Society: Content, Process and Power.* Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan.

Marcel, G. (1950) The Mystery of Being, (vol. 1). London: The Harvill Press.

Markova, I. (2007) 'Social Identities and Social Representations: How Are They Related?', in Maloney, G & Walker, I. (eds.) *Social Representations and Society: Content, Process and Power.* Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan.

Marx, K. (1975) Economic and Philosophical Manuscripts of 1844, published in Marx and Engels: Collected Works, Vol 3. London: Lawrence and Wishart.

Moran, Craft, C., Foubert, D., Jelkin Lane, J. (2011) 'Integrating religious and professional identities: Christian Faculty at Public Institutions of Higher Education', *Religion and Education*, 38(2), pp. 92-110.

Mueller, J. (2012). *An Exploration into the Meaning of Spirituality and Spiritual Experience for Counselling Psychologists, and Implications for their Practice,* Phd Thesis, University of Roehampton.

Naples, N.A. (2009) 'Teaching Intersectionality Intersectionally', *International Feminist Journal of Politics*, 11(4), pp. 566-577.

Neuman, W. (2011) *Social Research Methods: Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches*, (7th edn.). London: Pearson.

Newby, P. (2014) *Research Methods for Education*. (2nd edn.). Abingdon: Routledge.

Newby, P. (2014) Research Methods for Education. Abingdon: Routledge.

O'Brien, M. Penna, S. Hay, C. (eds.) (1999) *Theorizing Modernity. Reflexivity, Environment and Identity in Gidden's Social Theory*. Harlow: Addison Wesley Longman Limited.

O' Broin, A. and Palmer, S. (2010) 'Introducing an interpersonal perspective on the coaching relationship', in Palmer, S. & McDowell, A. (eds.) *The Coaching Relationship. Putting People First.* Hove: Routledge.

Ofsted (2013) *Realising the Potential*. Avaliable at: http://religiouseducationcouncil.org.uk/media/file/Religious\_education\_-\_realising\_the\_.pdf Accessed: 07/07/2014

Oliver, P. (2010) *The Student's Guide to Research Ethics*, (2nd edn). Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Palmer, P. J. (2003) 'Teaching with Heart and Soul: Reflections on Spirituality in Teacher Education', *Journal of Teacher Education*, 54(5), pp. 376-385.

Pembroke, L. (2004) *Working Relationships: Spirituality in Human Service and Organisational Life.* London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Pickering, W. S. F (2009) *Durkheim's Sociology of Religion: Themes and Theories*. Cambridge: James Clarke & Co.

Polanyi, M. (1966) *The Tacit Dimension*. London: The University of Chicago Press Ltd.

Prevent Strategy. (2011) Available At:

https://assets.publishing.service.gov.uk/government/uploads/system/uploads/attach ment\_data/file/97976/prevent-strategy-review.pdf Accessed: 14/05/2017

Punch K.F. and Oancea, A. (2014) *Introduction to Research Methods in Education*. (2nd edn.). London: Sage.

Radford, M. (2006) 'Spirituality and education; inner and outer realities', *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 11(3), pp. 358-396.

in England

Religious Education Council for England and Wales. (2013) *A Curriculum Framework for Religious Education*. Available at: RE Council: <a href="http://resubjectreview.recouncil.org.uk/media/file/RE\_Review\_Summary.pdf">http://resubjectreview.recouncil.org.uk/media/file/RE\_Review\_Summary.pdf</a> Accessed: 17/02/2017.

Revell, L. (2015) 'Predicting religion', Journal of Beliefs & Values, 36:1, 54-63.

Richards, L. and Morse, J. M. (2007) *Readme First for User's Guide to Qualitative Methods*. (2nd edn). London: Sage.

Richmond, L. (2012) 'Constructing the connection between spirituality, work and family', in Miller, L. J. (ed.) *The Oxford Handbook of Psychology and Spirituality*. New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 455-467.

Rogers, B. (2004) Is Nothing Sacred? London: Routledge.

Rogers, G. and Hill, D. (2002) 'Initial Primary Teacher Education

Students and Spirituality'. *International Journal of Children's Spirituality*, 7 (3), pp. 273-289.

Sacks, J. (2011) *The Great Partnership; God, Science and the search for meaning.* London: Hodder & Stoughton Ltd.

Sampson, P. (2010) 'Humans, Animals, and Others' in Falke, C. (Ed) *Intersections* in *Christianity and Critical Theory*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, pp. 120-134.

Satanulis, R.N. and Weaver, D. (1998) 'Teacher as mentor, teacher as learner: Lessons from a middle- school language arts teacher'. *The Teacher Educator*, 34(2), pp. 134-143.

Schwab, J. (2013) 'Religious Meaning Making: Positioning Identities Through Stories', *Psychology of Religion and Spirituality*, *5*(3), pp. 219-226.

Scoffham, C, (2016) 'Spirit of Place: Awakening a Sense of Awe and Wonder', The Primary Geography Research Conference, Charney Manor, 28<sup>th</sup> February 2016, pp. 7-15.

Sheldrake, P. (ed.) (2005) *The New Westminster Dictionary of Christian Spirituality*. Louisville: SCM Press Ltd.

Sheldrake, P. (2007) A Brief History of Spirituality. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing.

Shields, R. (2008) 'Nurturing Spirituality and Vocation: A Catholic Approach to New Teacher Induction', *Journal of Catholic Education*, 12(2), pp. 160-175.

Shinebourne, P. and Smith, J. A. (2009) 'Alcohol and the self: An interpretative phenomenological analysis of the experience of addiction and its impact on the

sense of self and identity', Addiction Research and Theory, 17(2), pp. 152-167.

Shipway, B. (2011) *A Critical Realist Perspective of Education*. Routledge: Abingdon.

Silverman, D. (2000) *Doing Qualitative Research: A practical handbook*. London: Sage.

Smith, J. (ed.) (2008). *Qualitative Psychology; a practical guide to research methods*. (2nd edn). London: Sage.

Smith, J. (2004) 'Reflecting on the development of interpretative phenomenological analysis and its contribution to qualitative research in psychology', *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 1(1), pp. 39-54.

Smith, J., Flowers, P. and Larking, M. (2009) *Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis: Theory, Method and Research.* London: Sage Ltd.

Tacey, D. (2004) *The Spirituality Revolution; the emergence of contemporary spirituality.* Hove: Routledge.

Taylor, C. (2007) A Secular Age. Harvard: Belknap Press.

Todres, L. (2007) *Embodied enquiry: Phenomenological Touchstones for Research, Psychotherapy and Spirituality.* Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Walters, R. cited in Sangster, M. (ed) Challenging Perceptions in Teacher education. London: Bloomsbury.

Warden, C. (2007) Nature through Nurture. Auchterarder: Mindstretchers Ltd.

Webster, S. (2009) *Educating for Meaningful Lives through Existential Spirituality*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

West, L. and Merrill, B. (2009) *Using Biographical Methods in Social Research*. London: Sage.

Whitehead, M. (ed.) (2010) *Physical Literacy: Throughout the Life Course*. Abingdon: Routledge.

Willig, C. (2009) *Introducing Qualitative Research in Psychology*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Woodhead, L. and Catto, R. (eds.) (2012) *Religion and Change in Modern Britain*. London: Routledge.

Wouter, S. (2013).'The meaning of role modelling in moral and character education'. *Journal of Moral Education*, Vol. 42(1), p.28-42

Wright, S.G. & Sayre-Adams, J, (2000) Sacred Space: Right Relationship and Spirituality in Healthcare. London: Churchill Livingstone.

Zachery, L.J. (2000) *The Mentor's Guide: Facilitating Effective Learning Relationships*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Zimmerman, K. (2014) *Deconstructing Privilege: Teaching and Learning as Allies in the Classroom*, edited by Case, K.A. Journal of Feminist Family Therapy, 26(2), pp. 113-115.

Zohar, D. and Marshall, M. (2000) *Spiritual Intelligence; The Ultimate Intelligence*. London: Bloomsbury Publishing Plc.

# **Appendices**

# **Recruitment Letter for Participants**

Title: 'How do teachers understand and express their spirituality in the workplace? An interpretative phenomenological analysis of professional educators 'spiritual expression in primary schools.

Dear Participant:

I am currently pursuing a Doctorate of Education (EdD) at Canterbury Christ Church University, where I am conducting a research study investigating the experience of, and meaning attributed to spirituality in the educational practice of primary school teachers. With your cooperation and involvement, I am therefore interested in exploring the meanings that you make of spiritual experience in your role as a teacher

Currently, most material written on this topic focuses either on the children's spiritual experience or on school identity and spiritual practices. There are also models of therapy which maintain that the work itself is a spiritual endeavour. I would welcome the involvement of teachers who have more than five years of experience practicing in the role of primary teaching, and who wish to contribute their experiences to this study by means of a research interview. The interview will last approximately one hour, exploring this very personal and meaningful subject. The interview will be conducted in entirely confidential circumstances, and will be treated with the utmost care. This could offer a unique opportunity to talk about such experiences in a way that might not normally be available or possible when in the role of classroom teacher.

If you choose to participate in this study, you will be asked some or all of the following questions in a partially structured interview:

1. What does the term 'spirituality' mean to you, and how do you think this meaning or belief

has come about for you?

- 2. Can you describe a particularly vivid experience from your non-professional life which is consistent with your understanding of what, for you, constitutes a spiritual experience?
- 3. Can you describe a particularly vivid experience in your professional education work which relates to your view of

what constitutes a spiritual experience?

4. Can you speak about any meaning you might have made of this, and if you feel you are or

were changed by this/these experiences?

5. Do you consider these experiences as learnings (or otherwise), and draw upon them in your work? If so, in what way

or ways?

6. Under what circumstances, if at all, might you discuss these beliefs or experiences with a school manager, with

members of your professional community or with work colleagues?

The interview will be audio-recorded and transcribed with personal details being coded or changed to ensure that the

participant's information is anonymous to others. The audio recordings and other related material (e.g. verbatim

transcripts) will be destroyed after it has been stored for at least 3 years, as is required for this research. You also have

the right withdraw at any time without giving any reason.

The interview will be arranged at a time and place that is convenient for you. If this has piqued your interest and you

would like to take part in this study, or if you have any further questions, please contact me by either the e-mail address

or the telephone number listed below.

Many thanks for your interest.

Telephone Number: 07506572467 / 01233 812005

Email: aidan.gillespie@canterbury.ac.uk

Department of Primary Education

Canterbury Christ Church University

Longport

Canterbury

CT1 1QU

Kind regards,

Aidan Gillespie

# CONSENT FORM

Name of Participant

Date

Signature

Title of l	Project: 'How do teachers feel about expressing their spirituality in the workplace?' An interpretative
phenome	enological analysis of professional educators' spiritual expression in primary schools.
Name of	Researcher: Aidan Gillespie
Contact	details:
Address:	F1:12 Fisher Tower,
Canterbu	rry Christ Church University,
Longpor	t,
Canterbu	ury,
CT1 1QU	J
Tel:	07506572467 / 01233 812005
Email:	Aidan.gillespie@cantebrury.ac.uk
Please in	itial box
1.	I confirm that I have read and understand the information sheet for the above study and have had the ity to ask questions.
2.	I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time, without giving any
reason.	
3.	I understand that any personal information that I provide to the researchers will be kept strictly confidential
4.	I agree to take part in the above study.
5.	I agree to have my interviews audio recorded and understand that these will be made available to me on request
as well a	s any related transcribed material

Researcher Date Signature

Copies: 1 for participant

1 for researcher

'How do teachers feel about expressing their spirituality in the workplace?' An interpretative phenomenological analysis of professional educators' spiritual expression in primary schools.

A research study is being conducted at Canterbury Christ Church University (CCCU) by Aidan Gillespie.

Background

One third of all primary schools in England and Wales are faith based and/or Church schools. While this is the case, traditional church attendance has been decreasing for many years. Baring this in mind, it is important to begin to understand in what new ways do teacher's both define and express their individual spiritualties while teaching in these contexts.

How adults both understand and express their spirituality is an area of study in psychology of religion and spirituality. Spirituality has been largely explored using empirical methods of research within Applied Psychology and more recently, using qualitative methods within Therapeutic Psychology. At the moment this has not been expanded to explore how spiritualities are understood and expressed within educational settings by individuals themselves and the implications of this in relation to educational identity and practice.

Using a qualitative method such as Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis (IPA) it is hoped that an exploration of how individuals define their understanding of their individual spirituality common themes may emerge which identify how their engagement with spiritual aspects of their identity affects their practice as educators. IPA as a methodology has not been used as an interpretive tool in education with regards to Religious Education and Spirituality; it is hoped that in this study it will emerge as a valid methodological stance in relation to understanding aspects of professional identity in education.

What will you be required to do?

Participants in this study will be required to make themselves available for 3 individual interviews over the course of their academic year. The interviews will take place at the participant's school unless otherwise agreed and will cover approximately 10-12 questions based on a semi-structured interview. The interviews will be recorded and transcribed, with an email/telephone call to follow up the interview and talk through the transcript for agreement and clarification.

To participate in this research you must:

Currently be a practising primary school teacher within the area of East Kent.

Procedures

You will be asked to take part in 3 interviews. Interviews will take place at the participant's school unless otherwise agreed and will cover approximately 10-12 questions based on a semi-structured interview. The interviews will be recorded and transcribed, with an email/telephone call to follow up the interview and talk through the transcript for agreement and clarification.

Feedback

After each interview is transcribed and analysed, the interviewee will be contacted to talk through the themes emerging from the interview and give their interpretation of the analysis or clarification on any points.

Confidentiality

All data and personal information will be stored securely within CCCU premises in accordance with the Data Protection Act 1998 and the University's own data protection requirements. Data can only be accessed by Aidan Gillespie. After completion of the study, all data will be made anonymous (i.e. all personal information associated with the data will be removed).

Dissemination of results

The results of the project will contribute towards a Thesis submitted for the Doctorate in Educations (EdD). The thesis will be a public document available through the Canterbury Christ Church University Library and Graduate School as well as a copy to be submitted to the British Library for their Thesis database.

Deciding whether to participate

If you have any questions or concerns about the nature, procedures or requirements for participation do not hesitate to contact me. Should you decide to participate, you will be free to withdraw at any time without having to give a reason.

Any questions?

Please contact Aidan Gillespie on 07506572467 or aidan.gillespie@canterbury.ac.uk.

#### **Reflective Exercise 4**

Listening and revisiting the interview with HK challenged me in ways which were both unanticipated and predicted. HK talked about her understanding of spirituality in ways which were both familiar and challenging to my own concept of this phenomenon and as such there were times of shared empathy but also times where I failed to understand and make sense of the participant's account.

The reflective exercise comprised of breaking down my response to the material in to a personal reflection and an epistemological reflection (Larkin et al, 2008). The challenge of understanding a way of conceptualising spirituality which was grounded in a discreet form of Christianity was difficult given that my own concept of spirituality is broader in the sense that it is not specific to any one religious tradition or an apriori of religion. Being able to observe the account and the ways in which the participant explained her concept of the phenomenon was aided by the desire to 'bracket out' my own views. Having a method of doing this assisted in acknowledging the role of myself as an interpreter and locating these thoughts, feelings and values so that they aided the interpretative task rather than hinder it in order to reveal new ontological and epistemological knowledge.

The participant in this interview was from a Christian tradition which I felt was exclusive in nature that is to say that for the participant, her form of Christianity was thought of as being the closest in spirit to what she regarded as authentic (biblical) Christianity. Following on from this, she also said that other religions were 'incorrect' and that Christians should seek to bring non-believers to faith in Jesus as their saviour. I was challenged on many levels because of this account. Namely the assumption that spirituality (as an element of humanity) could be thought of as secondary to observance of a particular religious tradition. My own religious/faith position was at odds with this. Being from a liberal form of Christianity (which many including the participant would possibly not acknowledge as Christianity) brought forth feelings of defensiveness and inadequacy. The motivation to justify both my own position and the participant's thinking was very strong but was resisted during the interview. Alongside of this, the participant also said things that I empathised with, the feeling that her faith was one motivation to teach, and be a good 'friend' to both colleagues and those she worked with. This was something that I also felt strongly about and the way that this was initially overlooked as a 'given' aspect of spirituality could have been material that was not considered fully. The choice of IPA as a qualitative method was closely aligned to this, in that I identified IPA as a methodology which privileged the participant and placed them at the centre of the research in terms of hierarchy, more so than other forms of qualitative research which had a more even focus on researcher and researched. Epistemologically, IPA was adopted in that's its focus of enquiry paralleled the values held by myself in exploring relationships between identity, researcher and researched (Smith et al, 2009).

Epistemologically, an awareness of how the research question shaped, influenced and limited the account had to be engaged in (Larkin, 2008). Posing a question as to how one understood their spirituality was not only intrusive but also provided opportunity for challenges; within the interview relationship but also an inbuilt assumption that participants had an active engagement and awareness of their spirituality as part of their personal and professional identities. Throughout the interview process I became aware of a desire to link these two aspects of identity as much for their own benefit as much as to benefit the examination of how professionals contextualise this area. Perhaps framing questions within specific interviews in specific ways hinted at an unconscious desire

Examining areas of spirituality and belief also posed interesting questions as to how the teachers involved in the research made sense of their own beliefs in the context of their classrooms and the children in them. How they understood their beliefs on religion and spirituality caused me, as a researcher, to consider the ways in which I engage with the differing belief systems in my own professional capacity as a teacher/educator. The imperative to be respectful of people's beliefs also forms part of the Teachers' Standards 2012 (DfE, 2011) and as such requires all teachers to respect all religious beliefs and none. This raised the question as to the amount of training available to inservice teachers on how to conceptualise their own and other's religious and spiritual traditions and identities. An awareness of how I as a researcher seemed to be more literate in this area in comparison to the participant who was exceptionally literate in the specific area of her own spirituality caused me to question the suitability of the teacher training I am involved in in equipping my students to engage in this self-reflection but also of my teaching colleagues in their ability and desire to seek out further training r understanding of the differing belief systems and traditions which make up contemporary society.

# **Interview Schedules**

# Schedule 1: <u>How do individual educators within primary schools define their spirituality?</u>

Can you tell me how you understand the term spiritual?
Do you have a story from your personal life which might help me to understand how you understand and use the word 'spiritual'?
Is spirituality something that you've been aware of throughout your life?
Is spirituality something you have to work on or is it a part of you?
What ways do you express your spirituality?
Has the spiritual side of yourself ever caused you discomfort or challenge?
What about the other side, has your spirituality been a help or support?
Do you think everyone is aware of spiritual aspects of life?

# Schedule 2: <u>How do individual educators within primary schools define their spirituality?</u>

Are you mindful of your spirituality in school?
What areas do you feel in the curriculum where you can engage your spirituality?
What subjects do you think allow for the spiritual to be expressed?
Within those subjects what kinds of activities do you feel are more conducive to spiritual engagement?
What would that look like?
Are there particular things that make you feel more spiritual when teaching?
Would you feel comfortable expressing your spirituality to colleagues whether that is 1:1 or in a group?
How would expressing your spirituality look like to your colleagues, is it explicit or more subtle?
Do you think your spirituality enhances your teaching, how?

# Schedule 3: What contextual mechanisms are there which help/hinder the spiritual expression of primary school educators?

Do you think Spirituality helps you with your work? How do you know this, material/immaterial 'felt' knowing.
At work does your Spirituality include or exclude you from the team? Workings, socially.
Could your Spirituality be a barrier at work among colleagues, promotion?
Do you feel your work offers opportunities to be creative? Does this have an impact of how you feel and respond? Is it beneficial?
Can creativity be taught? Why do you think it is important?
Do you ever feel happily immersed in your work? Are there ways in which this has affected what you noticed about your work after these times?
Do you see a link between Spirituality and Creativity?
Why did you enter teaching?
Is there a difference between teaching and other jobs. What makes it different?
Do you have a vocation?

# **Transcript 19**

#### KM2 08/05/20**1**5

<u>Transcript</u>	Exploratory Coding			
	Descriptive	<u>Linguistic</u>	Conceptual	Superordinate
I Memories of superstition, so it's the inside of a Christian Church but the title is 'Memories of superstition', what does that say to you?				
KM That maybe as he was growing up to him it felt more like it was superstitious than religious.	Feeling as opposed to knowing. Different ideas of			
I OK, that's not the reason he gave me.  KM What did he tell you?	knowledge.			
I Well, I said to him 'Is that because you think religion is kid of no use of whatever' and he said 'essentially' so we had a long discussion and he was like 'What do you think of it?' and I said 'We;; if you're inside a church that has sacraments I would agree with you that that is superstition' but he was like 'Well everyone takes a different view'. But the fact he chose an Anglican church was quite interesting, so is he saying that religion is dead in Britain or Christianity is dead in Britain?				
KM No, I don't think he is saying that he saying its dead I just think he is saying that at that moment in time when he painted it he interpreted it.  I It is a bit dead though isn't it really, well its either dead or its not dead.  KM No.	Context and time important in taking a position.			
I If you think about the population how many people				

#### KM2 08/05/2015

would actively living a Christian life?				
KM I think that's the difference, when they do the			Affiliation through	
census loads of people put down that they're a			inheritance as opposed	
Christian don't they but then they don't kind ofwell I	Openness of practice	Doing is an	to personal life choice	
say that I was going to say then they don't kind of live t	rather than teaching.	Important concept	and value/bellef.	
out by going to church and stuff but you don't have to go	Individual as well as	but it is challenged.		
to church to be a Christian.	group authority.			
I What would you have to do?				
KM Its about the way you look at life and the way you				
live your life I guess, life choices.	Philosophy and			
	practice not			
I OK in which case I would say none of them are	mutually exclusive.			
Christians or very few.				
KM I don't know, see I know loads of wellyeah I know				
loads of people actually who call themselves Christian,				
no they're not hanging out in church, I'm thinking of like			She assumes that this is	
people I work with and yeah they don't go to church but			their position or she	
some of them are the most amazing Christian spirited	People reflect		attributes this meaning	
people I ever met.	something in		to them in order to find	
	common with		commonality or to	
I Ah ok so they're good people but would they align that	Christians.		make understanding.	
goodness with being rooted in a Christian faith, or do	Humanity/values.			
they just happen to be good people?				
KM, I think they would say it is rooted in a Christian faith				
from an early age but they probably don't actually follow	Life development			
that faith now.	and stages make a			
	difference.			
I So they are just good people aren't they?				

				1
KM I don't know, are they?				
l Well yeah ∣ mean				
KM Well don't you think If that seed is sown like that		Cultivation under	Education analogy also	
religious Christian seed is sown, yeah as a child. It's a	Child and personal	the right conditions.	used In Englishness,	
bit like a tree isn't it being grown from seeds. Get an	life development		this might tie in to the	
acorn right and you put the acorn in the ground and	implied that early		concept of what it	
that tree grows from the acorn doesn't it?	exposure ripples		means to be Christian,	
	through life.		affiliation and labels	
Hguess.			imposed or	
			appropriated.	
KM But the root of it is always going to be the acorn, so				
that's a bit like Christianity. If you are brought up in the		Root-consistent.	Maybe this challenges	
Christian tradition the root of it is always going to be	As above.		free will or youth	
from your Christian upbringing			development. See Jung	
			and Archetypes.	
I Well, that's true I would say but there are lots of things				
that you would say would be in that seed but you cast off				
during life so could Christianity not be one of those				
things?				
KM Yeah if you choose to cast it off yeah.				
171				
I Those people you are talking of would they not do you				
think orWhat I'd be worried about is that they don't				
even think about it so it's a subconscious casting off. Its not even a like well 'that's how I think'.				
not even a like well that's now I think'.				
KM I don't know. I guess the difficulty comes when you	Tentativeness here.			
start thinking about life and death because then it kind	Drawing on church	Bible passage to		
of says in the bible doesn't it that if you don't believe in	teaching to	reinforce position.		
or says in the bible doesn't it that if you don't believe in	teaching to	remoree position.		l

4

## KM2 08/05/2015

your heart and confess with your mouth that you're	interrogate her own	
saved.	position. Conflict	
	here between	This challenges or at
I So if you're dumb you're screwed.	personal opinion and	least provides a
	church teaching or	contrasting/paradoxical
KM No, no I believe there are kind of exceptions to the	paradoxically	narrative. Maybe this is
rule. That where really religious people say that they're	existent.	a position that is
not really Christians because when they die if they're not		chosen for the
confessing that Jesus is their saviour and la la la they'll go		anomalies.
to Hell. So that's whereits true, that's what it says.		
I The bible says lots of other things, it says have several		
wives if you want, sacrifice your son.		
	Choice of narratives	
KM That's all in the Old Testament.	important.	
LOK well what about the new testament where it says to		
have gay sex is like an abomination, stone prostitutes,		
drunkenness won't get you in to Heaven yet Jesus' first		
miracle was turning water in to wine. It says lots of silly		
things.		
		Looking in to this draws
KM You need to read a book by Joseph Prince, its called		a line between
'Unmerited Favour' because he talks about stuff like		taught/inherited
this and there's another book calledhang on its		teaching and
written by Philip Yansey its called 'What's so amazing		assumptions and
about Grace?' so they both in both of these books have	Humanity and	seeking to place her
this big debate about grace and religion and they're	church teaching	faith/religion in the
saying that	juxtaposed.	current pluralistic
		context.
I Are these Christians though?		
KM Yeah they are Christians.		

I SO they're coming from a premise to being with aren't they?	She has explored		As above	
KM They are but they're kind of just saying that that	this. Is this to make			
Grace is kind of one way of viewing Christianity	sense of the current			
whereas living by the Law and living by the rules is the	zeltgelst? Trying to			
way that some people choose to follow and live out	bridge pluralism with			
their Christianity.	her faith.			
I So by Grace what do you mean?				
KM So they believe, I'm probably not going to do it				
justice.				
I The rough idea.				
		Does Old mean		
KM God loves you anyway despite the fact that you	Spirit is more	exceeded or out of	The Old I aw as	
make mistakes and you mess up and they believe he	important than	thinking.	superseded through	
died on the cross for your past, present and future sins	observing 'Law'.		new and superior	
and there's a quote in the book that says 'nothing you	Perhaps this allows		understanding.	
can do will make God love you more and nothing you can	for different			
do will make God love you less' yeah? Whereas some	expressions of faith			
people who live under the old law believe that they	in/out of the			
have to be perfect to be saved and kind of try and	recognised forms.			
religiously follow the 10 commandments and then				
you're kind of set up to fail because its difficult to be				
perfect.				
			Tentative position or	
I Would they extend the idea of grace to non-Christians			complexity is	
then?		Is Grace a comfort blanket?	acknowledged.	
KM Again that is where it kind of splits for some people.		DIGINEL:		
Because some Christians do believe that and they				
because some constiants do believe that and they				

## KM2 08/05/2015

believe in a kind of fluffy				
I So you're either in the club or you're not?				
KM They believe in a fluffy God that will save everybody.				
I Why's that a fluffy God and not a loving God?				
	Does this acceptance			
KM Well you know, I don't know I'm just sayinglet me	mean that once it's	Adult informed		
finish.	done you are saved?	choice.		
	This might challenge			
I There's bias coming out here KM.	other forms.			
KM Yeah and then others believe its just grace for people				
who have accepted Jesus but they could have accepted				
him at like 18 and then kind of mess up forever.	Personal ownership		Again, this is not	
	is important.		definite. Open to	
I What if you're a month old and you're Catholic and			conversation.	
you've accepted and its been accepted for you?				
KM Yeah, I don't think, I think they feel that you have to				
accept it for yourself.				
I It sounds lie that way of looking at it's a very particular				
kind of Christian view of it.				
KM I would say that that is kind of the emerging				
Christian view.				
I But then that to me would make God really incoherent				
because he obviously has got a bad streak because he's	A lot of contrasting			
created what, four fifths of people, to be not Christian so	narratives here,			
they're all screwed just by accident of birth and	pluralism,		There seems to be a	
geography. That doesn't sound like that kind of God I'd	acceptance, biblical		dialogue between	

	I e. e		1
want to hang out with.	literalism.	inherited teaching and	
		applying this to her	
KM I don't know but there's a bit in the bible that says		current context.	
that God won't come back until the Good News has			
been preached to all the nations.			
I See this is like if I don't base anything on the bible at all			
not remotely.			
KM Is that a Quaker view or is that just your view.			
I No some Quakers, like Λmerican Quakers are really			
bible based, British Quakers not so much but its just. Just			
for me the bible is such a flawed document because of			
because people interpret it as one coherent book and it			
really isn't. Even like chapters within one book of the			
bible will be contradictory or maybe not contradictory			
that's too strong a word but juxtaposed against each			
other. Yet some people will go 'well that's how you read			
it' you kind of go 'why would you?'			
KM I think I got a better understanding when I   haven't			
read the whole bible from start to finish.			
I You need to pick up the pace then.			
KM Have you?			
,			
l Yeah.			
KM Have you really?			
,			
I And the Koran.			
		l	

7

## KM2 08/05/2015

KM Wow.  I The Koran is short you can read the Koran in a month or two.  KM I bought a chronological bible and that.  I Good choice, first book?  KM I don't know, not Genesis.  I No not Genesis.  KM Is it Exodus?  I No not that either.  KM I can't remember and that kind of made more sense to me and I only got about half way through it. I failed and that made more sense reading it chronologically.  I So in school then would people be aware of your religion?  KM Yeah.  I OK but how? Is it because you look graceful? Not in high heels though?  KM Because I waddle, according to you! How to make someone feel really good, thanks.	Reading the bible in different ways might allow her to see issues in different interpretations. Maybe this leads to her openness in other issues.			
--	--	--	--	--

I When you're married you can give up on all the				
pretence and be honest with people.				
	Not afraid to explain		Maybe carrying out	
KM Yeah but we're not married.	her position. School	Small issues rather	religious actions in a	
	community	than big. Maybe	set context is where	
I If I sald that to L she's cut my throat.	facilitates this. Open	because they are	her religious and	
	relationship.	regular	secular conversations	
KM Well I guess they know that I go to church on a		conversations rather	are situated.	
Sunday so for example we've got a garden day coming		than big issues.		
up at school this Sunday and I have said I will come and				
help but for me its better if it's a Saturday. So its little				
things like that I guess kind of because obviously I'd				
normally be at church on Sunday, yeah things like that.				
		Distancing from the		
I So are you mindful of, I guess we use the words	Again, an openness	'group' label. Wants		
interchangeably but I don't want to, your spirituality are	here to	to be more		
you mindful then of your spirituality or your I guess your	incorporating things	individual.		
spiritual health whilst in school and the expression of it?	outside of Christian			
	teaching.			
KM Yeah I wouldn't say, like I'm not a religious person.				
Like I do Pilates at school as a staff we do Pilates on a				
Thursday and the kind of has aspects of meditation in				
and mindfulness which some Christians frown upon but I			Personal justification is	
don't have a problem with that.	Is this a challenge to		important and taken	
	religion?		alongside	
I A lot of Christians aren't fun are they?			conversations about	
			faith.	
KM No, no. I just think anything that is good for your				
mind, body, soul should be ok and				
I So in regards to teach in your dayI'm getting the				
impression from you that obviously your faith is very				
very important its one of those key things you think				

about or you know you're mindful of but when				
you'rein regards you as a teacher and as a professional				
are you mindful of your spirituality when you're actually				
teaching or when you're planning or when you're				
carrying out any aspect of professional life?	Again, distancing in			
	the professional			
KM I guess I'm more mindful of it when I do assemblies	sphere seems to			
and I think I'm mindful of it because I don't want to in	parallel her			
any way influence the kids so I make sure that I always	openness in her			
say things like 'If you agree with my prayer you can say	religious/personal			
things like 'amen' at the end and I don't say things like	sphere. These are			
'Christians believe'. Yeah because I guess I don't want to	intertwined.			
influence them in any way.				
I Beliefs wise?				
		Is this because it is		
KM Beliefs wise, yeah.	Shared human	not learned.	New approaches are	
	aspect easier to	Internalised but	integrated In to her	
I What about spiritually?	share than discreet	shared.	understanding and	
	religious teaching or		teaching. Subjectivity is	
KM Spiritually, probably, yeah probably I feel more	positioning.		seen as an asset rather	
comfortable with people talking about spirituality			than a hindrance when	
generally rather than one specific religion because we'll			talking about	
talk about the importance of keeping calm in stressful			spirituality. Individual	
situations and you can do that kind of whole			response is valued.	
mindfulness thing and so I guess it's easier to talk about				
being spiritual and looking after your social, mental well-				
being as well as your				
I So why is spirituality then, when you're mindful of it,	Context is key here.		She assumes that	
why is that more widely applicable than religion would	Her openness is also	Tools for living	spirituality is real and	
be? For you, not as a school?	dictated by her	rather than	experienced. It is a key	
	teaching	knowledge.	element to how she	

KM Because we're not a Christian school, we're not a	environment but is		sees personhood.	
faith school and people have chosen, some people have	in line with her			
chosen to send their kids because here because we're	values.			
not kind of a faith school or anything. I just think its				
important to give kids the skills of spirituality of you can				
have a skill in spirituality. You're Just being spiritually				
aware rather than we're not here to convert them are				
we? And then you're not kind of upsetting one particular				
set of parents or				
I So then do you think then that spirituality then is				
inherent in everyone then because kind of what you're				
saying then is that the religion thing can be kind of				
problematic because there's categories of religion and				
traditions and whatever whereas it seems, I don't know,	Again, not			
correct me if I'm wrong but it seems like you're saying	knowledge but			
spirituality seems to be more open, its more available to	feeling-hedging.			
everybody. So is that because it's a phenomenon that's				
separate or that everyone has an element of it or???				
KM No, I think its inherent definitely, yeah.				
I So would you then see spirituality even if there'd				
different traditions would you see spirituality as common				
to, there'd be an element of spirituality that might be				
common to people even though their traditions or		A process rather		
views		than a result.		
	Wellness and		Does this mean inner	
KM Yeah absolutely.	spirituality bound up		or shared peace. That	
	with the human		people want to be in	
I OK so what might be common then, this is your opinion	condition of		harmony with	
now.	emotions. Again, all		self/other.	
	felt phenomenon.			

11

KM In my opinion common in kind of in spirituality,			
looking for that kind of sense of peace. I think			
everybody looks for that no matter how old, I think			
children sometimes want that sense of peace don't they.			
And I think that's got to be something that'sand I			
guess, I guess Just our emotions as a whole, wouldn't you	The curriculum	Emotion and	
agree. Like anger, anger we all experience anger and	acknowledges this.	spirituality is bound up.	
happiness and joy.	Professional area.	No mention of where	
		negative emotions tie	
II did this morning actually.		in with spirituality. It	
		might be implied that	
KM And I just think I don't know its like, yeah emotions		spirituality takes the	
and spirituality I think its important to I guess it's the		edge off negative	
whole PSHE thing isn't it.		emotion or	
		contextualises them.	
I OK so in which case then are there areas, are there			
subjects, areas of the curriculum or both that you think			
actually you can engage your spirituality. So you can	Fmotion and feeling		
think ok this is something that is in me that you can	is something which	As above but situated	
share with other people. So like you were talking about	can be taught and	in a definite curricular	
peace for example so would there be areas of the	developed/learned.	approach. Link	
curriculum where that's easier to explore or share with		between personal	
others?		values and professional	
		skills and context.	
KM I think PSHE naturally. We follow a programme in			
the infants called The Peace friends and that focuses			
on how to feel with different emotions and there are			
kind of strategies they give you in there work through	F		
how to find inner peace.	Foregrounding allows for access to		
Like divided about annulus because var/annulus an inhat			
I And what about regular, because you're year, so what about regular subjects. Do you think there's some sort	empathy.		
of			
01			

KM Yeah there'e Literacy yeah we're doing something at the moment called 10 minutes a day writing, it has got a snappier, jazzier name, but I can't remember it and its kind of emotional literacy based. It'll come up with a different picture every day and the children have to			Looking for empathy and connection to	
explore how that picture makes them feel and describe			Individuals is	
the picture.	Nature reflects the working of God. This	Again nature is	prioritised.	
I SO what sort of pictures have you seen?	is then meditated upon. Personal	common to all. So context might be		
KM A shipwreek, a baby with an ice-cream laughing and	response outside of	problematic as it is		
giggling and with ice-cream all around they're face, a	teaching (church).	specific whereas		
sunset with a lake and kind of rain and rainbows.		shared areas are helpful.		
I So did any of those pictures strike you in any way.				
KM Yeah, I quite like nature and I think when you're				
teaching small children they're kind of still a bit in awe of		Again process is the		
nature which is really nice and I think the kind of natural		important concept.		
pictures I guess kind of evoked kind of a bit of				
spirituality.				
I Alright.	Personal skills and attributes help and			
KM Because you're kind of thinking about God's creation aren't you?	hinder spiritual expression. It seems			
	to be something		Contrast between	
I Can spirituality then be explored for you now through	which should be		'head' subjects as	
subjects like Maths or DT ordo you think there's some	'easy' rather than		opposed to 'heart'	
that's its really easy to think about spirituality and other	challenging.		subjects. Intellect	
subjects that's don't; lend themselves so well? Or do you			might not be linked to	
think well actually its an individual thing and it can be	ĺ.		how she perceives the	

13

			development of	
KM I think I'd struggle with something like Maths, DT you			children's spirituality.	
could make something couldn't you? So I don't know,				
make a cross for Easter Sunday, or something or Divali				
lamps, we made Divali lamps in our class with clay.				
Maths and I guess you can put anything in a context				
can't you so I guess you can do money at the Jewish				
synagogue but that would be politically incorrect.				
I That's ok, we're just recording this so its fine.				
	Non favoured areas			
KM I don't know, I guess you can put maths in to a	might bring about			
context but that would probably be the hardest one.	growth as they	Concepts are more		
	challenge-stimulate	utilitarian than set		
I So is it down to you in many ways are you your own	thought. Head	'skills' 'knowledge'.		
leaning towards certain types of subjects do you think	versus heart.	They are easier to		
that's where the ease of it is? So its an individual thing?	Intellect over	share.		
So for me things like RF, Music and Art, Maths to some	emotion.			
extent I would probably find easy but other subjects I				
would have to think about it.				
KM Yeah I think so like Art, Music, Literacy would be easy				
for me to think of something to link with spirituality but				
Maths I would really have to think about.				
ten i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i i				
I SO trying to relate spirituality to the curriculum is down		Emotional rather		
to almost your personality in many ways or your attributes?		than cognitive.		
attributes:				
KM Yeah because our RE lessons are discreet I guess				
then when you're thinking about spirituality in a wider				
view then it is down to the teacher.				
The state of the seattles.				
	1	l .	I.	

In like for example, you said music or even in writing, has there ever been a time where you've thought kids have gotten something more out of this something intangible than you possible thought about? Do you know where they had one of those 'pop' moments or epiphany moments for want of a better word?  KM We did some music lessons where the children had to listen to pieces of music and then just kind of just draw about whatever the music made them feel like and that kind of but they were really good at talking about how the music made them feel and what their picture represented some of them were really quite deep, their pictures, and it kind if just brought put their, 5 and 6 year olds  LSo within the curriculum then is spirituality, does creativity play a part in it?  KM Yeah I think so.  I How?  KM Well I think you got I think you've got to give children the freedom to explore and express their feelings in a creative way because if you're someone who, that doesn't allow them the freedom to do that and they always have to do everything exactly how you want them to do it then they're never going to have an opportunity to show you what they're really feeling are	Freedom allows for self-expression. Teachers can help and hinder this.	Again, process should be individual not result.	Allowing children self expression is important. This reflects children's inner thinking rether than corporate a	
Working Chrodight			response.	

15

I So it's a case almost like stand back?				
KM Sometimes and I think some subjects again obviously				
lend themselves better to that. Maths you're always				
going to be either right or wrong aren't you and things				
have to be done in a set way usually. Unless you're				
problem solving and you're choosing the way you're				
recording but if you're looking at the 4 operations				
there's a specific way we have for laying out long				
multiplication	Attributes are			
	important with			
I If I was to say to you someone who I interviewed for	engaging. No right or			
this who adores Maths, she's almost opposite of me and	wrong way but			
you in the sense that her spirituality is almost rooted in	should be a personal			
rock solid things and when she thought about Maths she	response.			
said just the complexity of everything but yet the				
simplicity of one way of doing something she said that				
that for her that's how she understood God in many				
ways because of the craziness of the subject yet there is				
one fixed way of doing it. She said it's a bit like looking				
up at the sky and seeing stars, its all this multitude vet				
one single star can be understood for what it is.				
· ·				
KM Yeah, I hadn't thought of it like that. And I guess not				
naturally being Maths brained I probably would never				
have thought of it like that.				
nove thought or terms that				
I Maths brained. Are there particular things that make			Interesting example in	
you feel more spiritual when teaching? So the actual, not		Actual responses	that it draws on	
the subjects say, but the actual when you're going about		that are	religion rather than	
doing you're	Validation and	remembered.	individual as noted	
	spiritual	Connection with	above. Perhaps religion	
KM Yeah the response from the children.	nourishment by	pupils.	is a useful way in that	

	observing where		can prompt an	
I OK, in thewhere would you get those responses from	children have		individual response.	
if you can give me an example.	engaged with and			
	reflected on			
KM Sometimes when you're reading a story in assembly	something			
like a bible story or something and you'll have someone	themselves. Her			
saying 'that's a great story is there another one like	profession can be			
that' or 'I remember that from last year'.	spiritually nourishing			
	when she makes a			
I So why does that make you feel more spiritual?	connection with			
	children or children			
KM Because it shows that they've actually been listening	make a connection			
and they've enjoyed what they've heard and I guess	for themselves.	Ownership of the		
although you're not sort of explicitly trying to impart		pupils.		
anything spiritual in to them you are aware that	Personalised	Independence and		
obviously they've taken that on board, they've thought	reflective response.	autonomy desirable.	Look at previous two	
about it and they've enjoyed it. If they kind of			highlighted areas as	
understand the deeper meaning of a story then I guess			this ties in.	
you really feel like you've taught them something that,				
yeah something important I guess. A way of looking at				
life without explicitly teaching them, does that make				
sense?				
	Her perspective as a			
I Yeah I guess.	manager allows her			
	to see a whole		Time is an important	
KM Yeah, its almost like they've learned it for	school response		element as well as	
themselves so if you're telling a parable or something	through assemblies		maturity and	
and they can apply that to their own life without you	and coordinating.		development. This	
telling them how to you know at that moment they've	What is common is		should be nurtured	
actually thought about the story and how it impacts	children applying	Not learning more	though through	
them in their life and they've worked through that and	things to	but investigating or	allowing the	
then they're able to articulate that.	themselves. Echoes	internalising.	opportunity for	
	her own response.		individual response.	

often people will come down and bring work for like the RE evidence folder and its really nice to see how further up in the Juniors they might be children who I taught, I don't know 6 years ago, and now they're in the Juniors and they've really deepened their understanding of RE and and it might be I don't know a completely different religion, to what they were doing with me. Well it would be if they were in the Juniors but you can see they really got it and thought about it.    Exceeds the intellectual but goes   Exceeds the intellectual but goes	md
	nd
Exceeds the	
, ,	
deeper in to their Difference between	
KM Oh yeah you would yeah you'd still be really proud values and empathy. professional and	
wouldn't you because its exactly the same principle I Not intellectual but spiritual value for	
think because they've left you with kind of like the basic   emotional and   her.	
knowledge of counting, adding, subtracting and if they empathetic.	
come down and show me some fantastic you know	
algebra or something.	
I What you sound like there is that is job satisfaction you	
know that's like wow you knowdoes that blend in?	
The school as a place	
KM Yeah it is in a way because you think wow you know for planting values	
that kids are making progress we're doing a good job <u>but</u> and humanity.	
I guess spiritually you're thinking oh wow I hope that	
child keeps some of that with them and uses it in their	
life. If they come across a tricky time I hope the use	
those skills and things that they've learned in school and	
apply it to their own life.	

I So its not just like 'brilliant; they've got such and such knowledge in their head its deeper than that.  KM Yeah and like when the kids move on to secondary school you think I hope they keep some of those values and again its not just based on spirituality, we follow a values programme at the school. We look at things like courage, honesty and you just hope that they're going to take those values with them in to their next school and then in to later life.	Boundaries.			
I Now, here's a tough one, would you feel comfortable feel comfortable expressing your spirituality quite explicitly to someone on a 1:1 level in school, colleague wise.	Independence and maturity of thought seem to be prerequisites.	'Go and'Again	Hierarchy is equal rather than when it is	
KM Colleague wise yeah not children wise .		imposed.	teacher-pupil.	
I So why colleague wise first of all, why is that not a big deal? Or might would the situation be where that would be ok for you?				
KM Where it would be ok?	As above but also the fact that they know her and it is			
l Yeah.	instigated by them. She is being open to		Personal response is	
KM I think because you're both adults I think its	others rather than		valid if sought but	
absolutely fine to discuss your different beliefs and feelings and you know they're intelligent enough to go	bringing it to others/children.		when teaching it must be tempered because	
and make up their own minds.	Agency.		of role and possible the life stage of the	
I is there, I don't want this to be a leading question but its going to be I guess, do you think you feel comfortable			children.	

19

## KM2 08/05/2015

going to them. Witness rather than express.		there an implication that spirituality is contentious as a human trait/construct? If it is natural why the cautiousness when developing it?	
but others are free to come to her rather than her		have to be a choice? Is there an implication	
rather than her		triefe an implication	
going to them.			
Witness rather than			
express.		,	
١	going to them. Witness rather than	going to them. Nitness rather than	poing to them.  Witness rather than human trait/construct?  Express.  If it is natural why the cautiousness when

explicitly asked.			
I yeah sure, so what kind of things might they observe, observe is probably the wrong word but do you know			
what I mean though?			
KM Yeah, yeah I don't know because I'd hate the thought			
that someone was like looking at me as if to say you're			
like a spiritual person because I'd probably fail at loads of			
things every day and I wouldn't want people to think			
I Is that not ok?			
KM Yeah it is ok I think.			
I Just as well really.			
KM Yeah really I don't know I guess I try not to gossip about people.			
I So attitude maybe?			
KM Yeah.			
I Are there a lot of not spiritual people in the school?			
KM You're going to get them everywhere aren't you?		This challenges the	
		discreet role of the	
I OK so final question, do you think your own spirituality	Lifelong hopes for a	educator and places	
enhances your teaching, your actual teaching? In what	non-intellectual but	the 'person' as	
you do and how you go about it do you think it plays a	reflective value and	someone who is an	
part?	emotional response	elder.	
	are more important.		

21

## KM2 08/05/2015

KM Yeah yeah.				
I How?			Acknowledging the ways in which people	
KM I think some people would disagree with me but I			are flawed is	
think learning isn't just about what takes place in the			challenging it would	
classroom and I know it's a cliché but it is lifelong			seem. Is this realistic?	
learning isn't it and kind of values and attitudes are just			seem is and realisated	
as important as the academic side of things because you				
can be really clever but if you haven't got any morals or				
values or have a really bad attitude then you're not				
actually going to have a very happy life really I don't				
think I think its important to model again not like, no one				
is perfect and I hope no one would model their lives on				
just one person, but I don't know, model good values				
and give children a chance to express their feelings and				
their own spirituality. And know that it's ok to have like				
spiritual views and those kinds of thoughts and				
feelings.				
reelings.				
II guess hadn't thought of that, so is it important for you				
in some way to encourage kids to have views that aren't necessarily provable because you know school				
everything is about producing something that can be				
assessed or lots of things unfortunately so how would				
you go about fostering that sort of sense so actually				
there's some things you can know, you know and you				
feel, but there's no proof for them.				
Market State of the State of th		Does this imply		
KM I think that kind of manifests itself in the behaviour	Challenge is	sharing 'messiness'		
of the children, is that what you mean, how you can	important and	and complexity.		
measure them?	context. Exposing			
	children to difficult			

I Not measure but like, how you as a teacher how would	and challenging		
you. I'm trying to say how would you foster but I don't	material is important		
mean it like that but how would you make it ok for kids	when getting them		
to know that that's ok that there are some things that	to think and respond		
are intangible and they can feel a certain way about	to their own context.		
something and that's ok even though there's nothing to	There is a move		
correspond with in reality.	towards building		
	balanced children	Emotional empathy.	
KM <u>I think just being honest about different kinds of life</u>	who can take values		
experiences. We watch a kids news programme	and relationships		
throughout the week and I think that's good for kids	forward. Longevity is		
because they see that the word is bigger than our school.	more important than		
And they kind of see stuff that goes on in the world and	short term academic		
sometimes we don't understand it but that's ok and	goals.		
sometimes it makes us sad and that's ok and sometimes			
it makes us happy and that's ok.			
	Finding commonality		
I And it would be as explicit as that?	and connection with		
	others.		
KM Yeah because when you watch something you're			
going to be feeling something aren't you and I think its			
good to give them the opportunity to talk about it. So			
they don't leave thinking 'was I the only person that felt			
that?'			
I Right, so its ok to leave with a question you don't have			
to leave with a certainty?			
KM Yeah I think it's good to explore it though, its good to			
talk about it. I don't think you have to come up with all			
the answers but I wouldn't want a child to leave the			
classroom for example after watching the news thinking			
'Was I the only person feeling like that' I think it's good			

23

to talk about it.		