England's self-image as portrayed in public examination Citizenship Education textbooks

Ralph Leighton
Canterbury Christ Church University (UK)

Abstract

This paper is based on an analysis of the images in five textbooks aimed at young people (14-16 year olds) taking public examination courses in Citizenship Education in England. While the subject is a statutory part of England's National Curriculum (Department for Education, 2013a), examination is not compulsory and it is often the case that schools do not observe the minimum statutory requirements (Ofsted, 2010). With reference to Fang (1996) and others showing the role of images in motivating pupils and scaffolding their learning, as well as Freire's (2006) notion of the thick wrappers of multiple 'whys' which attach to any educational entity, it is considered that images are at least as important as text. The focus is primarily on the images which relate to gender, class and ethnicity – what those images indicate regarding the 'official' perception and presentation of these socially constructed and defined categories, and the extent to which that perception can be said to be verified or sustained through other data. A fourth category, the 'English citizenship' perception of the foreign – the European Union and the world beyond Europe – is also considered. While the images presented in the textbooks are analysed to demonstrate the 'English persona' which they imply, that persona is also shown to be emphasised by what is absent from the images. The presence of specific images represents choices made, so that the absence of others can be considered similarly to represent choices. These choices are shown to speak volumes about the gap between England's state directed self-image and the reality of citizenship in England.

***Keywords**: democratic development, ignored inequalities, images, text books, the 'other'*

Introduction

The data presented here are derived from analysis of the illustrations in five textbooks aimed at those young people taking any one of the three public examination courses for 16 year olds in Citizenship Education. While the subject is a statutory part of England's National Curriculum (Department for Education, 2013), examination is not compulsory and it is frequently the case that schools to not observe the minimum statutory requirements (CELSI; Leighton, 2012, 2013; Ofsted, 2006, 2010). It must also be noted that the National Curriculum for Citizenship has gone through various forms (QCA 2002, 2007, 2010; Department for Education, 2013a) since the books were published, and there have been new editions of some of them. However, when teachers in school were asked which books and which editions they use, these were the books they identified.

It was decided to use the 2002 editions for a variety of reasons:

a) they share a common year of publication and therefore a common reference point;
b) they are aimed at the same (14-16) age group;
c) 2002 was the year Citizenship Education became a compulsory subject within the National Curriculum for England;
d) they reflect the National Curriculum, but are not constrained by it;
e) they are the editions currently in use in schools;
f) they are approved by examination boards as supporting their subject specifications which are, in turn, approved by the Department for Education.

These books have therefore been chosen as representing a collective image designated by the Department for Children, Families and Schools (as it was then known), delineated by the examination boards, and projected by schools, to pupils in the 14-16 age range, of what it means to be English.

Caveats

Not all teachers of citizenship rely on textbooks. It has been argued that best practise militates against such use (Ofsted, 2010, Leighton, 2012) as many of the 'facts' and personalities central to the subject change over time at a pace which outstrips publication. Specialist teachers of Citizenship Education are often encouraged, during their pre-service education, to ensure that learning is tailored to their pupils' interests and experiences (Leighton, 2012) – something which any one text book cannot achieve.

There are also vast amounts of useful – and a good deal not so useful – images, data and activities available through the internet which teachers use and manipulate to determine the images and ideas they wish to develop as part of citizenship education. Freire's observation that 'a deed, a gesture, a poem, a painting, a song, a book are always wrapped in thick wrappers. They have been touched by manifold *whys*' (2006, p. 10) reminds us that the images deployed by teachers of citizenship – whether specialist, volunteer or coerced – are loaded with reasons and messages not always immediately obvious but none the less powerful and influential.

Only 9,279 young people sat the GCSE in Citizenship in 2012, out of a potential 649,553 (1.4%), but Ofsted, the schools inspectorate for England, reports that a significant majority of that age cohort experience Citizenship Education to an extent which satisfies official guidelines. According to Ofsted, in those schools where provision was deemed inadequate (11%), *citizenship had been misunderstood or ignored, or its development had been so constrained by other priorities that its effectiveness was severely limited. As a result, the students had little knowledge or understanding of citizenship* (Ofsted, 2010, p. 10)

We do not know whether that misunderstanding is of the official image of being a citizen and that a more comprehensive or universalistic perspective is offered as an alternative in those schools, but it would appear that Ofsted inspectors were satisfied that 89% of schools in England were developing citizenship in line with the requirements which the

textbooks discussed here meet. If the images used in each classroom do not wholly coincide with those in the textbooks considered here, the majority are clearly held to tell the same story.

Historical/Political context

England's imperial, political and democratic history is not as clear-cut as might sometimes be assumed; in 1603 England ceased to be an independent sovereign power, and after 1707 it was no longer a politically independent nation but one part of the United Kingdom. While its development as an international force predate the early sixteenth century – according to Andrews (1991) these began to bear fruit by 1480 and, as McLeod (2009) shows, they were firmly established one hundred years later, contrary to some interpretations of laissez faire – Gallagher provides compelling evidence of 'a fundamental continuity in British expansion throughout the nineteenth century' (2004, p. 6)

Britain's empire covered a third of the planet; it was the pink bits on the maps I saw as a pupil in the 1960s and 70s; it was 'everywhere'. Throughout the Twentieth Century it slowly became 'The Commonwealth' – 54 countries, from Antigua to Zimbabwe – 53 of which have a shared history of being 'discovered' by, fought over by, exploited by, traded with, run by, indoctrinated by, evangelised by, the UK. I was taught that it was an empire built on daring exploits, courageous explorers, clever trade policies, and a strong navy. It was also an empire built on violence, slavery, exploitation, racism and record keeping; on bullying, bullets and bureaucracy.

Many historians of jurisprudence have referred to Magna Carta of 1215 as an early example of democracy in action (Sen, 1999; Gedicks, 2009) but this document was negotiated between King John and his barons – it had nothing to do with or for the common people, who remained the chattels of the nobility. Fear of the revolution in France influencing the disenfranchised in Britain was a major factor in political reform in the nineteenth century. According to the UK's National Archives, in 1780 only 3% of the population had the right to vote. There were significant reforms in the mid-nineteenth century, including widening the franchise to include more men but also explicitly debarring women from voting. In Sweden there was limited female suffrage in the 1860s, in the UK it didn't happen until 1918 – for wealthy women – and, on equal grounds to men, in 1928. Catholics were barred from public office until 1829, Jews until 1858. Today, senior Anglican clergy have automatic seats in the second chamber of the legislature, the House of Lords; by tradition the Chief Rabbi (who represents one particular trend in Judaism) is also a member of that house. No other faiths have such an entitlement.

Until 1906, trade unions were liable for employers' losses due to strike action; since 1992 they have again been liable except in very specific circumstances. There are currently serious and far reaching discussions in the UK on limiting press freedom since the Levenson Report. The Human Rights Review (2012) reports that it was not until 1998 that the law recognised the right to peaceful assembly and freedom of association, and that '[p]olice misuse of surveillance, stop and search powers, and other pre-emptive

legal action by the police and private companies inhibits peaceful protest' (p. 279). There are an estimated 5.9 million CCTV surveillance cameras in the UK – almost one for every ten people. There is also a long tradition of radicalism in the UK, from the Peasants' Revolt of 1381 to the UCS sit-ins of 1971/2; from the English Civil War 1642-51 to a general strike in 1926; from trade unionism developing in the nineteenth century to the Greenham Common Women's camp of the 1980s and 90s. Not all these movements have been successful, but whatever successes they achieved were in the face of 'democratic' establishment opposition. In noting this, it is also important to observe that many nations have had much more repressive regimes and a much slower and thornier path towards democracy. It is particularly important to also observe that there is no reference to these radical traditions in any of the textbooks scrutinised.

Method

As this paper concentrates on the visual images in textbooks aimed at 14-16 year old students of citizenship education in England, the dominant method is one of image analysis; what individual images – but more significantly, what the collective impression of a series of images – tell us about the perceptions or intentions of those who have selected them; they are scrutinised for Freire's '*whys*'. In all cases the images are accompanied by written text, but it is the images which catch one's eye and which tell the story of being a citizen.

There were a total of 699 pages in the textbooks, and 907 illustrations. Excluding title pages, examination technique sections, glossaries and index pages, there were 648 pages of text, most of which had pictures or other images – averaging almost 1.4 images per page, along with text, activity boxes, assignment suggestions, graphs and charts.

Carney and Levin (2002) confirm Fang's (1996) findings, that the images within or accompanying text serve several functions: they

- a)   establish the context of the text,
- b)   define/develop characters, (or, in our context, institutions and personalities)
- c)   extend/develop plot, (or, in our current context, the narrative)
- d)   provide an alternative viewpoint,
- e)   contribute to the coherence of the text, and
- f)   give emphasis to the text.

Fang goes on to list several benefits that pictures provide, including such things as motivating the reader, promoting creativity, serving as mental scaffolds, fostering aesthetic appreciation, and promoting children's language and literacy (Carey and Levin, 2002, p. 6). Given their role in motivation and scaffolding, it can be seen that images play a significant role yet one it is sometimes easy to overlook.

The predetermined focus for analysis is on those images which portray or relate to gender, class and ethnicity; what those images indicate regarding the 'official' perception and presentation of these socially constructed and defined categories, and the extent to which that perception can be said to be verified or sustained through other data.

A fourth category, the 'English citizenship' perception of the foreign – the European Union and the world beyond Europe – is also considered.

Findings from individual textbooks

Textbook A (143 images) offers a range of faiths and ethnicities, including a quotation against racism from Sir Alex Ferguson (a white Scot), then manager of Manchester United FC, and an image of Hope Powell, the (black) manager of England's women's football team. Nelson Mandela is present – the most frequent person presented throughout the books is Nelson Mandela. There are also images of an Asian teacher, an Orthodox Jew, Japanese in traditional costume, a church and a mosque. The multi-racial Notting Hill Carnival is shown, as is an anti-racism meeting with three Asian and two white people, and there are images and discussion relating to the 1993 murder of black teenager Stephen Lawrence.

The only non-white political figures who are shown are from outside the UK: Mandela, bin Laden, S Hussein, Mao and five unnamed 'Commonwealth Leaders'. All are male and three have had a poor press in the UK. Of the 31 political figures shown, all but three are men, the exceptions being Queen Elizabeth and two women in a photograph of the Prime Minister and his cabinet. Gender representation in general lacks balance and insight, with 57 men shown in a variety of occupations as opposed to 10 women – one judge and others involved in 'traditional' activities, including the carer/mother role.) One particularly challenging image is of a woman protesting for the right to die as she suffered from an incurable wasting disease.

In common with the other textbooks, *Textbook A* offers a confused, limited and diluted interpretation of the relationship between the UK and the European Union. There is a picture of the EU parliament, one of some Euros, a map of the countries which were at that time the member states, and a picture of the Eurostar train. It is not explained that England has no relationship with the EU other than as one component member of the UK, nor is there discussion of the how 'ordinary' Europeans behave – indeed, there is no image of people in, of or from European countries other than one of German anti-nuclear protesters.

The wider international image presented appears to be largely of a benevolent UK supporting a backward and often violent rest of the world. Images of world populations range from child soldiers, child labour and starving children in Africa, through an idyllic beach in the 'West Indies', to destruction of the rainforests and over-fishing of whales. UN troops are shown 'keeping the peace' and there is a picture of the UN building in New York. George W Bush is added to Mandela, bin Laden, Hussein and Mao (who died 26 years earlier) as world leaders. Where protests in the UK were shown to relate largely to environmental issues, this was juxtaposed with the Tiananmen Square protests in China in 1989.

Overall, the images in this textbook indicate a secure, content, multicultural, male-dominated England holding its head up and doing its bit in a nasty and deprived world. There is a tendency for representation to centre on London rather than throughout the

country, further distorting the notion of Britishness through Englishness to a vague Londonness.

Textbook B (133 images) presents a broad range of images of ethnicity, including Christians, Muslims, travellers and Chinese in Britain. Black police officers, black students, black voters and black footballers also feature. There section on immigration (but not on emigration) and one which features black women and children in relation to HIV Aids. The notion of 'being British' involves images of Morris dancing, the Notting Hill Carnival, the English countryside, and Gerri Halliwell (Ginger Spice) who had ceased to be involved in pop music in 1998. Nothing about empire/imperialism, war, resource exploitation, inventiveness. . .

Gender distribution tends to the stereotypical while possibly also being an accurate representation. There are three male politicians and one female, as close as whole numbers allow as proportionate to membership of the House of Commons. Other portrayals of women include barrister, boss, secretary, Victoria Beckham (Posh Spice and footballer's wife), journalist, property owner, recipient of aid, carer, teacher, police officer, food safety officer, shoppers, and parent. The range for men is narrower, restricted to police, footballers, trading standards officer, borrower, councillor, criminals and two television journalists.

The image of the European Union is limited to a picture of two unnamed men in suits and one of euro paper money and coins, while the UN is represented by Kofi Annan, UN soldiers, and reference to flood aid. On the wider international front there are asylum seekers and refugees, child soldiers and child labour, charity in Gambia, an African woman receiving a commonwealth loan, and African youths on motorbikes. There is also an indigenous South American drinking Pepsi Cola.

Again there is the presentation of a contented and egalitarian England/Britain, standing against an unpleasant world of 'others'. Southern Englishness predominates, as does an apparent tendency by the authors to attempt to latch onto youth interests (e.g. Spice Girls images), but not quite managing.

All of the books include cartoons/drawings, but in *Textbook C* (116 images) these considerably outnumber photographs. Of the recognisable images, men are represented variously as MPs, statesmen and parents, while women are graduates, weavers, footballers, mothers and a political activist. The activist is Emily Wilding Davidson, who died trying to stop a horse race during the UK campaign for women's suffrage in 1913. There is little explicit reference to issues of ethnicity, other than showing black families with black parents. Summarising the history of education in Britain by referring exclusively to legislation affecting education in England presents an inaccurate impression of national unity/consistency; however, Scotland and Ireland have their own separate systems while the Welsh education system shares much with its English counterpart but differences remain.

The international images touch on Europe by the presentation of a members' map, and on the UN through UNICEF. There is reference to relief charities, to refugee camps and asylum seekers, while the more 'stable' environments of an African 'tribal' family and

an indigenous South American Weaver are also presented. Notable international figures are shown to be Nelson Mandela (twice), Aung San Suu Kyi, and Osama bin Laden, leading to the Taliban and the events of 11th September 2001. Other international events of record were the Rio de Janeiro environmental summit of 1992, and the Sharpeville massacre in South Africa in March 1960.

While the events of September 2001 were clearly highly pertinent to a 2002 leaner, a terrorist attack on a train in Angola the month prior to the USA attacks received no mention. Eleven years later (at the time of writing) the attack in Spain (2004) or, for example, in India (2008), Pakistan (2007), Russia (2002, 2004), Iraq (2004, 2007), Indonesia (2002) – not all perpetrated by al Quaeda – might be more relevant to young European leaners with Asian and Eastern European classmates and neighbours. While these clearly could not have been included in texts published prior to the events, there is no evidence of newer texts emerging which contain such references.

Textbook D (283 images) presents employment as predominantly male and white. 36 males included a head teacher, an Imam, two chief executives of large companies, a number of athletes and an heir to a throne. The nine political figures shown in images were all men. The six women portrayed comprise two engineers, one teacher, one dismissed worker, and one monarch, with only the dismissed worker not being a white person. On the broader impression of ethnicity, the Chinese New Year celebrations in London, and the Notting Hill Carnival both appear, as do images of Sikhs, Jews and Muslims – at a wedding, in school and, separately, meeting Prince Charles. There are also images of the Bradford Race Riots of 2001 and relating to the murder of Stephen Lawrence in 1993. The other criminal reference is to the notorious murder of a two year old boy by two ten year old boys in 1993.

In that uncertain space between the UK and the rest of the world is Ireland. The situation there is illustrated with pictures of troops and civil unrest, with a text which ignores events prior to the late 1960s and makes no mention of the historical relationship between Ireland and the rest of the British Isles. On a more secure international footing, *Textbook D* offers a group of white drummers – part of a missionary group – playing to an indigenous African audience. African wildlife is shown, as are child labour, a 'send a cow' campaign aimed at alleviating poverty in the developing world, pictorial reference is made to famine, floods and favela, and there are two pictures of Nelson Mandela and one of Rev Martin Luther King Junior (died 1968). The EU is once more depicted by a map, although there is also reference to the 1989 Prague protests. Protest in Israel/Palestine is illustrated with images of the West Bank, tanks and refugees, again without reference to history other than a version of the most immediate past.
West Bank, Israeli tanks, Palestinian refugees

Textbook E (232 images) offers a lot of cartoon-like illustrations which are difficult to categorise under the headings with which this paper is concerned as ethnicity and gender are rarely clear in them. None the less, some pictures do clearly relate to gender and to an international dimension.

Women are shown variously as punk, shopper, nurse, tube driver, mother, computer operator, MP, disabled person, and asylum seeker. The textbook also usefully mentions

the UK's first woman MP, Countess Constance Markievicz, correcting the widely held mistaken belief that it was Lady Nancy Astor. However, neither her name nor her party (Sinn Fein) is named. Uniquely amongst the textbooks considered, men are given comparatively little photographic attention – illustrated as judge, doctor, MP, prisoner, scientist, and disabled person.

The international perspective is more limited than in the other textbooks, but remains noteworthy. The general state of 'foreignness' is represented by refugees and reference to 11 September 2001. International politics are illustrated by an EU flag and a picture of the European Parliament, UN peacekeeping, the ubiquitous Nelson Mandela and Osama bin Laden, GW Bush and New York's Mayor Rudy Giuliani, and Slobodan Milosevic. Giuliani's appearance is in relation to 9/11, while reference to Milosevic concerns his role in the collapse of Yugoslavia as an illustration of the demise of the Soviet bloc. No demonstrations, no monetary union, no internationalist perspective.

Contexts, analysis and discussion

As observed above, events have overtaken all five publications. Responsibility for this cannot be laid at the authors or the publishers of these texts, but the lack of texts which provide reference to them can be laid there and with those schools which fail to invest in up to date learning and teaching materials. There are websites with such references, but not all schools, teachers, pupils, have the time, financial resources, will to find, check, evaluate and use them. It might be expected that qualified and experienced teachers of citizenship can use their wits, awareness, contacts and resources to address the shortfall between published perceptions and evidence-based reality, but there are fewer than 3000 such teachers and 3917 secondary schools. In the most recent government inspection report, ascertaining whether schools manage to adequately address even the limited requirements placed upon them in the teaching of citizenship, it was asserted that 32% of citizenship lessons are not good enough, generally because 'teachers' subject knowledge and expertise led to only limited and superficial learning.' (Ofsted, 2013, p5)

Ethnicity

In UK Census categories (ONS, 2005), ethnicity equates to vague notions of skin colour and region of origin (e.g. Black British, Black African) rather than to any value system or shared set of beliefs or cultural norms, so it is not possible to compare the frequency of ethnicity representations in the textbooks to their statistical frequency in England and Wales (data for Scotland and Ireland are published separately). Between them the books offer a fairly comprehensive and positive image of a multi-cultural and multi-ethnic society. There are positive role models across a range of occupations and social circumstances for members of some minority ethnic groups, although most illustrations of employed people appear to present white people. While this might not offer positive role models, it does reflect reality – unlike the overall impression given by the illustrations.

There were 161 religions listed in the UK census returns (ONS, 2005), mainly subsets of Christianity, but over 4,000,000 decided not to answer this optional questions while roughly 7,300,000 asserted they had no faith at all. Attitudes to religion are perhaps indicated by the 390,127 who identified themselves as Jedi Knights , which placed it as the third most common religion after Christianity and Islam (BRIN, 2011), and by the almost complete lack of news coverage of this. By 2011 the number of Jedi Knights was almost halved, but it was still the 5th most common religion in the UK. (BRIN, 2011). None of these figures, nor the attitudes behind them, is reflected in the textbooks. There are Muslim, Christian, Jewish and Buddhist representations, but none for atheism, agnosticism, or Jedi. By 2011 over 25% of the population of England and Wales stated they had no religion and a further 7% chose not to respond (ONS, 2012). It is therefore likely that over 30% of the population is non-theistic, yet that possibility is not considered in any of the textbooks.

The range and nature of ethnicity images also raises some questions. While there are clear and positive role models such as Hope Powell and black police officers, the interethnic joy of carnival alongside the Englishness of Morris dancers, we wonder what the only reference to HIV Aids is in illustrated with a black woman and her child – when almost 50% of all those with AIDS/HIV in 2001 were white males (by 2011 66% of AID cases were white and 62% male) and that the incidence of AIDS/HIV transference from mother to child was consistently in the region of <1%, far less than the incidence of transference through homosexual (65%) or heterosexual (32%) activity. (AVERT, 2011)

Most of the books draw attention to the murder of Stephen Lawrence, in South London, in 1993. This was a cause celebre at the time and recognised as a racist murder for which two out of five accused were eventually jailed (in 2013). In 2009, over 9,000 people were convicted of racially aggravated crimes in England (HMG, 2010), a figure we can extrapolate to over 70,000 during the period between Lawrence's death and the gathering of data for the books. The Institute for Race Relations (IRR, 2012) identifies 96 other racially motivated murders during the same period. To focus on this one event, no matter how significant or media emphasised it became, is to obscure the truth – that young black men are statistically more likely to be stopped and harassed by police officers, or assaulted by people they know, than to be murdered by strangers (Bowling & Phillips, 2007).

The 4.6 million people self-classified as non-white are not evenly distributed across the country but tend to live in the conurbations, with 45% of them living in London. (ONS, 2005, p. 3) It might therefore not be surprising that representations concentrate on that region, but the 45% in one place are shown having fun at Notting Hill or London's China Town, whereas the majority (55%) are 'elsewhere' seen only in relation to race riots. That Stephen Lawrence's murder took place in South London is not mentioned as being significant.

National self-identity is a challenging concept to illustrate through photographs and other images. According to the ONS (2005, p. 7), the majority of non-white people in the UK describe their national identity as British as opposed to English, Scottish or Welsh. Those in the White British group were 'more likely to describe their national identity as English (58%) rather than British (36%)' (ONS, 2005, p. 7) whereas, for example, three

quarters (76%) of people of Bangladeshi origin identified themselves as British, whereas only 5% identified themselves as Scottish, English or Welsh (ONS, 2005, p. 7).

Images of employment did not discriminate between occupations and ethnic groups, although menial lower status employment is rarely illustrated. While this perhaps provides positive role models and encourages aspiration amongst all pupils, it does not match reality. Non-whites are more likely to be unemployed than whites (ONS, 2005, p. 5), while there is a higher proportion of Chinese and Indian 'professionals' than there are of white professionals. (Proportion and number can serve to confuse here, as there are still many more white professionals than there are from all other ethnic groups, which reflects the relative size of those groups.) In relation to women and employment, there is a particular disparity between image and reality; nursing was the largest area of women's employment (10% of Black African women and 3% of White British women) yet there is only one image of nursing. Similarly, the main occupational areas for Indian women (sewing machinists) and for (Pakistani women (packers, bottlers, canners and fillers) (ONS, 2005, p. 10) are not mentioned.

Gender roles

Gender depiction is largely centred on occupation, in which women and men are represented unevenly – a common feature in all books is the significantly greater number of men than women in occupational roles and, indeed, in depiction in general. Women are not invisible but, in a proportion of roughly 8:1, they are certainly obscured.

The occupations shown for women do include the traditional parent/carer (as they do for men) and some of what Caplow (1978) described as the Ten Deadly C's of women's roles – e.g. shopper, secretary, teacher, nurse, shop assistant. Others women's roles include barrister, MP, journalist, property owner, police officer, food safety officer, footballer, dissident, engineer, punk, tube driver, computer operator; perhaps not representative and certainly not comprehensive, but reasonably aspirational. Although men were shown much more often, the number of roles in which they were portrayed was much more limited – head teacher, Imam, executive, statesman, judge, doctor, MP, scientist, police, trading standards officer, councillor, MP, TV journalist; more limited but generally higher status. That they were also shown as criminals, athletes, footballers and borrowers shows that it was not all male dominant inequality, even if largely so.

Politics – gender, ethnicity, self-image and social class

UK domestic politics are depicted as predominantly male and exclusively white in 2002. Not only does this not provide aspirational role models, it is wildly inaccurate – in 2001 16% of MPs were women (currently 22%) including 5 cabinet members (out of 24) and 4% (no change and none of the cabinet) were members of minority ethnic groups – and came only five years after the country had had its first female prime minister, Margaret Thatcher, who is depicted only once. The only other female political figures depicted are the Queen of the UK and the dissident Burmese, Aung San Suu Kyi despite there being at least nine other women heads of state/government at that time.

Political action beyond the ballot box is represented in several ways. Images of the 1985 miners' strike, although not with any of the police intimidation and violence (Waddington, 1987; Milne, 2004) feature in one text, while others present environmental protest, Greenpeace, Fair Trade, animal rights and anti-globalization. Emily Davidson's death during the suffrage movement illustrates simultaneously the sacrifices made to get the vote and the dangers inherent in agitation. Europeans are more present here than in sections dealing with the EU, in the form of German anti-nuclear protests and anti-communist protests in Prague in 1989, while the world stage is represented by anti-communist protests in Tiananmen Square, Beijing, also in 1989 and anti-apartheid demonstrations in Sharpeville 1960. Virtually all of these protests resulted from or with state violence yet none of the books examines or portrays violence by the state as worthy of citizens' concern.

On the world political stage ethnicity/nationality representation is inevitably more diverse than in the UK, but not diverse enough to reflect reality. Nelson Mandela (South Africa) enjoys eight representations, far outstripping all other political figures. He, along with Aung San Suu Kyi (Burma), Ray Giuliani (USA), GW Bush (USA), Kofi Annan (UN) and Martin Luther King (USA), are depicted clearly as role models and defenders of freedom. Presented on behalf of international terror and injustice are Osama bin Laden (al Quaeda) seen three times, Saddam Hussein (Iraq) twice, with Mao Zedung (China) and Milosevic (Serbia/Yugoslavia) one each.

Given that the United Nations had 189 member states when the books were being developed, they might have offered a more contemporary and geographically wide-ranging selection. Limited accounts of the Israel/Palestine situation and of the history of Ireland, the lack of representation of Europeans other than Milosevic and the relative preponderance of figures from the USA and UK/USA 'enemies' in the 'war against terror' are clear reflections of UK government policy and rhetoric. The citizenship National Curriculum extant in 2002 required that pupils should learn about 'the United Kingdom's relations in Europe, including the European Union, and relations with the Commonwealth and the United Nations' (QCA, 2002, p. 196), aspects of the curriculum with which these books deal very superficially, if at all.

The European dimension is reduced to maps and/or photographs of buildings, money, a train and a handshake. The Commonwealth is seen in photographs of meetings of heads of state, and the United Nations is represented through UNICEF, the General Secretary, 'peace-keeping' troops, and pictures of the inside and outside of the UN building in New York. While the accompanying text explains elements of these institutions, there are no pictures of people going about their daily lives as there are for the specifically 'British' content. These organisations are portrayed as separate, impersonal, authoritarian, and different – even though the UK, and therefore England, is a part of each.

The wider international domain rests in stereotypes of child soldiers, child labour, starving Africans, 'tribal' Africans, charity dependence, refugees, famine, floods and favelas. A more positive but still stereotypical image is presented through tourism, wildlife and idyllic West Indian beaches.

Brief critical summary

This paper was introduced as presenting a focus on images of gender, ethnicity, class and Britishness/Englishness in relation to otherness. The outline of political imagery illustrates an isolationist and uninformed image of 'abroad' – that the EU has different money and the world is full of terrorists, starving homeless, and floods; the message appears to be 'thank goodness for the Americans'.

Gender is portrayed largely as an area of equality in England, despite comprehensive data which contradicts this viewpoint. There were 1.7 million lone parents with dependent children in the UK in 2001, a figure which grew to 2 million by 2011 - 29% of all families. 92% of lone parent households were headed by women (a situation which had not changed by 2011 (ONS, 2011c), yet neither the general issue of lone-parent households nor the specific one of female-led families was addressed in any of the books. One of the consequences of such households is inequality of income, and data clearly indicate that the gap between male and female income is narrowing. At the current rate, extrapolating from TUC (2007), full-time wages will be the gender equal by 2057 and part-time wages by 2067. As Metcalf puts it, there is undoubtedly 'a problem of pay discrimination and that women's work is undervalued' (2009, p. iv).Gender discrimination in wages has been illegal in England since 1970, so this might also give fuel to any discussion on the meaning and value of equality in law.

Ethnic inequalities are more clearly illustrated but still underplayed. There can be no doubt that 'pay gaps are substantial for most, but not necessarily all, major ethnic minority groups. The gaps cannot be explained by the age, education or foreign birth of ethnic minority groups' (Metcalf, 2009, p. v).However, it should be noted that extant inequalities with regard to ethnicity are not restricted to wages or other forms of income. There is the paradoxically that, while 'the risk of being a victim of personal crime was higher for adult members of all BME groups than for the White group . . . Black persons were stopped and searched 7 times more than White people . . . and . . . 21,878 prisoners (just under 26%) were from BME groups' (HMG, 2010). Unemployment is higher amongst ethnic minority groups. Life expectancy is lower. None of this appears in the GCSE images or in text.

The books offer a fixation with historical references which, while generally accurate and often appropriate to the contexts in which they are presented, are none the less highly selective. Sharpeville (1960), the Prague uprising and Tiananmen Square (both 1989) illustrate state violence against the people, yet no mention is made of for example the UK government's use of the army against striking Welsh miners in 1910 and 1911, of tanks against Scottish workers in 1926, nor of the use of the army to break strikes in the 1980s. Reference to suffragettes and to the first woman MP show that there is not a reluctance to consider the early twentieth century, but only to what might be presented as progressive rather than establishment-directed oppression.

Neither the photographs nor the text have anything to say with regard to social class. This might, of course, mean that social class is a term no longer relevant to life in England/UK; it is certainly missing from the 'equality strands' which form the basis of

current legislation. However, had reference to class been made, illustrations, photographs or text might have had to address that '[t]here were large social class inequalities in self rated health, with rates of poor health generally increasing from class 1 (higher professional occupations) to class 7 (routine occupations). . . Women had higher rates of poor health compared to men in the same social class' (Doran et al, 2004). They might have had to address the ethnicity and gender inequalities identified earlier in this paper and, crucially, the reasons for these and other inequalities. They might have had to consider why it is, for example, that 7% of the population produces 38% of MPs, 47% of Oxford University undergraduates, 54% of Chief Executives, 60% of the Cabinet, 68% of barristers and 70% of judges (Hansard, 2013; Sutton Trust, 2009, 2010, 2012; Leighton, 2013)

Conclusions

The books provide what Banks (2004) terms an 'assimilationist model', not unlike that which underpinned Parks' (1926) 'Immigrant/Host Model' within the Chicago School of sociology– that those with power are secure, reasonable and rational beings in a stable and wholesome society, and that newcomers and dissidents must learn to fit in and accept the status quo. This is also the situation which Gramsci describes as a dominant hegemony. Whilst it is true that cultural, national, and global identifications are interrelated in a developmental way, and that students cannot develop thoughtful and clarified national identifications until they have reflective and clarified cultural identifications, and that they cannot develop a global or cosmopolitan identification until they have acquired a reflective national identification (Banks 2004, p295), we must, on the basis of these textbooks, consider the nature of those images with which students are required to relate and upon which they are required to reflect. That those images represent a highly selective and distorted version of the reality of being English, one which promotes a false consciousness and acceptance of the status quo, is beyond doubt.

References

Ali-Khan, C. (2013) Seeing what we mean: visual knowledge and critical epistemology, in Kress, T. M. (ed) *Using Critical Research for Educational and Social Change* Abingdon: Routledge, pp. 43-62 [a reproduction of *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education* 24 (3)]

Althusser, L. (1971) *Lenin and Philosophy and other essays* London and New York: Monthly Review Press

Andrews, K. R. (1991) *Trade, Plunder, and Settlement: Maritime Enterprise and the Genesis of the British Empire 1480 – 1630*. Cambridge: CUP

AVERT (2012) *UK HIV and AIDS Statistics* http://www.avert.org/uk-statistics.htm (accessed 28 July, 2013)

Bailey, R. (1996) The Irony of The National Curriculum, in Hayes, D. (ed) *Debating Education: Issues for the new millennium?* Canterbury: Canterbury Christ Church College, pp. 14-18

153

Banks, J. A. (2004) Teaching for Social Justice, Diversity, and Citizenship in a Global
World. *Educational Forum*, 68, pp. 289-297

Bowling, B. & Phillips, C. (2007) Disproportionate and discriminatory: reviewing the evidence on police stop and search. *The Modern Law Review*, 70(6), pp. 936-961

BRIN (2011) *British Religion in Numbers* http://www.brin.ac.uk/figures/ (accessed 25 July 2013)

Burns' Country http://www.robertburns.org/works/97.shtml (accessed 6 July 2013)

Caplow, T. (1978) *The Sociology of Work*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press

Carney, R .N. & Levin, J. R. (2002) Pictorial Illustrations Still Improve Students' Learning From Text. *Educational Psychology Review*, 14(1), pp. 5-26

Department for Education (2013a) *The National Curriculum in England: Framework document*. London: DfE

Department for Education (2013b) http://www.education.gov.uk/popularquestions Accessed 18 October 2013

Doran, T., Drever, S., & Whitehead, M. (2004) Is there a north-south divide in social class inequalities in health in Great Britain? Cross sectional study using data from the 2001 census. *British Medical Journal*, pp. 328-1043

http://www.bmj.com/content/328/7447/1043 (accessed 7 August 2013)

Fang, Z. (1996) Illustrations, text, and the child reader. What are pictures in children's storybooks for? *Read. Horizons*, 37(1)

Freire, P. (2006) *Pedagogy of Hope*. New York: Continuum

Gallagher, J. (2004) *The Decline, Revival and Fall of the British Empire: The Ford Lectures and other Essays*. Cambridge: CUP

Gedicks, F. M. (2009) An Originalist Defense Of Substantive Due Process: Magna Carta, Higher-Law Constitutionalism, And The Fifth Amendment. *Emory Law Journal*, 58, pp. 585-673

HMG (Her Majesty's Government) (2010) *Statistics on race and the criminal justice system 2010 - statistical tables* https://www.gov.uk/government/publications/race-and-the-criminal-justice-system--3 Accessed 28 July 2013

Human Rights Review (2012) http://www.equalityhumanrights.com/uploaded_files/humanrights/hrr_article_11.pdf (accessed 16 October 2013)

IRR (Institute of Race Relations) (2012) *96 Murder's Since Stephen Lawrence's* http://www.irr.org.uk/news/96-murders-since-stephen-lawrences/ (accessed 29 July 2013)

Leighton, R. (2012) *Teaching Citizenship Education: A Radical Approach*. London: Continuum

Leighton, R. (2013) *Citizenship Education for children of the elite in England*. Paper presented to CiCe conference, University of Lisbon, June 2013

McLeod, B. (2009) *The Geography Of Empire In English Literature 1580–1745*. Cambridge: CUP

Metcalf, H (2009) *Pay gaps across the equality strands: a review*. Manchester: Equality and Human Rights Commission

Miles, R. (1984) *Ethnic and Racial Studies*. London: Taylor and Francis

Milne, S. (2004) *The Enemy Within: The Secret War Against The Miners*. London: Verso

OFSTED (Office for Standards in Education) (2013) *Citizenship consolidated?* Manchester: Ofsted

ONS (Office of National Statistics) (2005) *Focus on Ethnicity & Identity*. London: Office for National Statistics

ONS (2011a) *Who we are; How we live; What we do* http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/guide-method/census/2011/index.html (accessed 28 July 2013)

ONS (2011b) *Population Estimates by Ethnic Group 2002 – 2009*. Newport: ONS

ONS (2011c) http://www.ons.gov.uk/ons/rel/family-demography/families-and-households/2011/stb-families-households.html Accessed 7 August 2013

Ofsted (Office for Standards in Education) (2010) *Citizenship established? Citizenship in schools 2006/09*. Manchester: Ofsted

Park, R. (1926) *The Urban Community as a Spatial Pattern and a Moral Order*. Chicago: UCP

Postman, V. (1970) The politics of reading, in Keddie, N. (ed) (1978) *Tinker, Tailor . . . the myth of cultural deprivation*. London: Penguin

QCA (2002) *The National Curriculum for England and Wales: Teachers' Handbook*. Nottingham: QCA/DfES

Sen, A. (1999) Democracy as a Universal Value. *Journal of Democracy*, 10(3), pp. 3-17

TUC (2007) *Closing the Gender Pay Gap: An update report for TUC Women's*

Conference 2008 http://www.tuc.org.uk/equality/tuc-14435-f0.pdf Accessed 7 August 2013

UK National Archives
http://www.nationalarchives.gov.uk/pathways/citizenship/struggle_democracy/getting_vote.htm (accessed 16th October 2013)

Waddington, P. A. J. (1987) Towards Paramilitarism? Dilemmas in Policing Civil Disorder. *British Journal of Criminology*, 27(1) pp. 37-46

Wilkins, C, (1999) Making 'Good Citizens': The social and political attitudes of PGCE students. *Oxford Review of Education*, 25(1-2), pp. 217-230